

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**



**Commenced at 09:00 and held on Thursday, 7 July 2022 at the Department of
Cultural Affairs and Sport, 1st Floor Boardroom, Protea Assurance Building,
Green Market Square, Cape Town**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)
Prof Walter Peters (WP)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Dennis Belter (DB)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS)
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Mr Robin George (RG)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJh)
Ms Natalie Kendrick (NK)

Visitors:

Mr Phakamisa Mohaila
Ms Melanie Attwell
Mr Marc Turok
Mr Rowan Theart
Mr Louis Steyn
Mr John Simson
Mr Servaas de Kock
Mr Stuart Hermansen
Mr Bryce Henderson

Ms Nicola Francis
Mr David Long (architect)
Ms Doryn Schreuder
Ms Louzel Steyn
Ms Janeske Brits
Mr Wernich Stander
Mr Darryn Rogers
Mr Stuart Burnett
Mr Jerome Le Sueur

3. Apologies

None

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 7 July 2022.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 7 July 2022.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 9 June

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 9 June 2022 and resolved to approve them with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

None

6.1 Recusals

None

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

Nothing to report.

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

CSc is currently on leave. WD to report back at the next BELCom meeting.

8.4 Hybrid format for meetings

It is currently not possible to conduct hybrid meetings but HWC's staff are working on providing a solution. In the interim meetings will continue to be conducted via MS Teams when necessary with IACom members making themselves available to be on standby should BELCom encounter quorum issues.

8.5 Meeting between HWC and the Moravian Church Management

Given BELCom's concerns regarding the state of heritage resources within Moravian Mission Stations and associated properties, the Committee requests the CEO to set up a meeting where this can be discussed. PM to relay this to the CEO and an agenda is to be compiled for circulation to staff and Committee members prior to this meeting taking place.

8.6 Performance of heritage consultants and constructors

The Committee notes with growing concern that conditions and special requirements relating to the application, approval and execution of heritage works are not being complied with. This includes the appointment of appropriately skilled practitioners and contractors. In a recent case this included property owned by Public Institutions. Consequently:

1. The CEO is requested to pursue this matter with the appropriate authorities and report back to this Committee on progress including procurement processes that currently exclude appropriately skilled heritage practitioners.
2. The Committee requires staff to review the CV's and appointment letters of all heritage specialists required in terms of conditions and special requirements of this Committee's approvals. Appointed heritage specialists are expected to immediately alert HWC should standards during execution be inadequate.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted.

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

None

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

None

10. Appointments

None

APPROVED

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions at Rem of Ptn 12 Farm 653, 1 Vergenoegd Road, Faure, Stellenbosch Wine Route, Somerset West: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SOMERSET WEST / REM of PTN 12 FARM 653

Case No: 22042206MS0422E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Phakamisa Mohaila (architect, Urban Concepts) and Ms Nicola Francis (architect, Urban Concepts) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is a Grade II resource (Provincial Heritage Site) and Grade IIIA (large farm area) and is situated outside an HPOZ.
- CoCT supports the proposals.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on detailed Plan; South Elevations; East Elevations; West Elevations; North Elevation; Plan showing existing doors & windows; Timber doors and windows summary spreadsheet, dated June 2022 prepared by Urban Concepts (Pty) Ltd as not negatively impacting heritage significance but on the understanding that the heritage architect involved in previous works on the property will continue to be engaged and will submit a closeout report on the works within 30 days of practical completion unless this heritage practitioner deems it necessary to alert HWC to potential problems prior to this.

SJh

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erven 140281 and 140282, 15 & 17 Lytton Street, Observatory:
NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ OBSERVATORY/ ERVEN 140281 AND 140282**

Case No: 22052412RG0525E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Robin George introduced the case.

Ms Melanie Attwell (heritage consultant), Mr Darryn Rogers (owner), Mr David Long (architect) and Mr Marc Turok (Observatory Civic Association Architecture & Heritage Conservation Body) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Both properties are Grade IIIC resources and are situated inside an HPOZ.
- CoCT did not comment within the commenting period.
- Observatory Civic Association objected to the proposed demolition.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objection in principle to the demolition of the buildings. However, regarding the proposed replacement building, the Committee is of the opinion that the roof should be articulated in a manner that repeats the veranda roof detail of the existing building and possibly a similar form of the rear. This will enable the massing of the main gable end to be reduced.

The Committee further requires that the continuity of the street boundary be retained by either retaining the existing boundary wall or replacing with a similarly detailed and scaled equivalent.

RG

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition at Erf 452, 30 Main Road, Hermanus: NM
HM / OVERBERG / OVERSTRAND / HERMANUS / ERF 452**

Case No: 22040410SJ0405E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Ms Janeske Brits (architect) and Mr John Simson (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIC resource.
- Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee supports the proposals.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objection to the proposed demolition. However, before a demolition permit can be issued, the Committee requires clarity regarding the replacement development and the heritage indicators including graphic indicators relating to the surrounding townscape and streetscapes that inform the proposal.

SJh

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Farm 485, Le Chant Wine Estate, Eikenhof, Polkadraai
Road: MA
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ EIKENHOF/ LE CHANT WINE ESTATE/ FARM 485**

Case No: 22032912AM0405E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

Mr Wernich Stander (architect, representing Malherbe Rust Architects) and Mr Servaas de Kock (architect, Malherbe Rust Architects) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The importance of reversible interventions to the gravity flow cellar interior, for example using timber for platforms.
- Door widths were reduced from the earlier proposal & frames are to be structural.

- Master craftsmen with appropriate heritage experience to be employed for work on the heritage structure.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 101, 1100, 1201, 1301 & 1701, dated June 2022 and prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects as not negatively impacting heritage significance but that the heritage architect involved will submit a closeout report on the works within 30 days of practical completion unless this heritage architect deems it necessary to alert HWC to potential problems prior to this.

AM

**13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 116120, 369 Burg Street, Namaqua House, Cape Town City Centre: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CAPE TOWN CITY CENTRE / ERF 116120**

Case No: 21111204CN1118E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Corner Nortje introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIA resource and is situated inside an HPOZ.
- CoCT supports the proposals in principle.
- CIBRA endorsed the proposals.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to refuse this application as having a negative impact on a building of highest local significance facing onto a Provincial Heritage Site.

The Committee notes that the application appears to contain inaccuracies in presentation.

CN

**13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 114940, 6 Lulworth Road, Rondebosch: MA
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ RONDEBOSCH/ERF 114940**

Case No: 22051607MS0519E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HOMs graded the building as a Grade IIIC resource.

- The building is situated outside an HPOZ.
- CoCT does not support the original proposal.
- The revised proposal has been amended in accordance with comments made at the BELCom meeting of 9 June 2022.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered ALLIE-2107-01 Rev B dated 16 May 2022 and prepared by Sudhier Magan Architects as not negatively impacting heritage significance, with one-member dissenting.

MS

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3480, 35 Bosman Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 3480

Case No: 22051904MS0530E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Stuart Hermansen (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIC resource and is situated inside an HPOZ.
- Stellenbosch Interest Group supported the retention of the current single storey but not the addition of the second storey over the subject building, however, does not object to a double storey addition behind the subject building.
- No comments were received from Stellenbosch Municipality and Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to refuse the application as indicated on drawings numbered SD-3462-M101, SD-3462-M102, SD-3462-M302, SD-3462-M304 dated 10 January 2022 and prepared by S Design Architects as having a negative impact on heritage significance. The new proposal completely subsumes the integrity of the historical building.

The Committee notes that the application does not provide sufficient information regarding the character of the streetscape.

MS

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3671, 33 Belmont Avenue, Oranjezicht: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ORANJEZICHT/ ERF 3671

Case No: 22051916MS0531E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIB resource and is situated inside an HPOZ.
- CoCT did not comment within the commenting period. A late comment was submitted which does not support the proposal.
- CIBRA does not support the proposals.
- The historical authenticity and architectural integrity of this early 20th c. Mediterranean Revival building to be retained as far as possible.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objection to the proposed internal alterations but will not approve the replacement of the existing timber fenestration with aluminium windows and doors, as it believes that this will have a negative impact on the building's heritage significance, and because it believes that alternatives for achieving adequately improved insulation have not yet been fully explored.

MS

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 0000743, 13 Cheviot Place, Green Point: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GREEN POINT/ERF0000743

Case No: 22030706CM0523E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the case.

Mr Stuart Burnett (Green Point Ratepayers and Residents Association) and Mr Bryce Henderson (architect) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIC resource within an HPOZ.
- The building is part of a semi-detached row house which is repeated along the length of the street, making for a consistent roofscape.
- There is no CoCT comment as the commenting period has not expired yet.
- Green Point Ratepayers and Residents Association did not support the application and had requirements in terms of resolution of the proposed dormer window and its setbacks from lateral party walls.

HELD OVER:

The matter is held over and will be tabled at the next BELCom meeting to be held on 27 July 2022.

MS

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations at Erf RE-14185, 79A Chamberlain Street, Woodstock: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / WOODSTOCK / ERF RE-14185

Case No: 22052509SJ0601E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Jerome Le Sueur (architect) was present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIB resource and is situated inside an HPOZ.
- CoCT supports the proposals.
- Woodstock Residents Association supported the proposals with conditions.
- Woodstock Aesthetics Advisory Body supported the proposals with conditions.
- The Committee did not have an objection to a loft room concealed behind the ridge line.
- The importance of retaining and restoring the existing chimney using appropriate methods, including lime mortar and renders, was stressed.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objections to the proposals as indicated on drawings numbered LA 001 Rev C3, LA 101 Rev C3, LA 201 Rev C3, dated 09.04.2021, 31.07.2021, 08.03.2021 and prepared by Le Sueur Design Detail in association with Vibrant Design Works as not negatively impacting heritage significance on condition that the existing chimney flue is retained and consolidated. Revised drawings to be submitted to HOMS.

SJh

13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 28748, 22 Rose Street, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 28748

Case No: 22021802TZ

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Ms Doryn Schreuder (heritage consultant), Mr Rowan Theart (architect) and Ms Louzel Steyn (owner) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is not graded but an IIIB grading has been recommended by Drakenstein Municipality.
- The building is located inside the Special Character Protection Overlay Zone of Paarl.
- The building was the old Parsonage associated with the nearby church.
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the proposals.
- Drakenstein Heritage Foundation supports the proposals.
- Paarl 300 does not comment on illegal work.
- Some structures do not appear on earlier plans and are considered unauthorised work.
- Images were presented showing demolition work to parts of the building and bricking up in others.
- A Stop Works order is in place.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that there are various aspects of this application that are not clear. This includes:

1. The historical or other bases underpinning the current design proposals.
2. Clarity regarding the extent of the unauthorised work and the identification of proposed work.
3. The status of the building fabric as it impacts the heritage significance of the building.
4. Confirmation from the structural engineer as to the stability of the work already undertaken.

The Committee requires that a heritage architect to the approval of HWC be engaged to prepare an independent report on the status of the building informed by a clearer understanding of its historical and physical morphology and to advise on how heritage significance can be recovered.

TZ

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

**14.1 Wupperthal: MA
HM/ WEST COAST/ CEDERBERG/ WUPPERTHAL**

Case No: N/A

For discussion.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

See final Wupperthal report.

SJh

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 15:00

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

12 July 2022

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

APPROVED