

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**



**Commenced at 08:30 and held on Tuesday, 12 July 2022 via
Microsoft Teams**

1. Opening and Welcome

Note: Due to the Chairperson, Mr. Graham Jacobs being unable to attend the meeting, and tendering apologies. Ms Penelope Meyer presided over the election of an Acting Chairperson in terms of the rule 12(5) of the Rules of Order and Conduct at Meetings of HWC. The Committee elected Mr Dennis Belter to chair the meeting.

The Acting Chair, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08:40 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Ms Janine de Waal (JdW) co-opted
Mr Dave Saunders (DS) co-opted

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM)
Mr Reagon Fortune (RF)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Mr Reagon Fortune (RF)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)

Visitors:

Mr Neil Franks
Mr Philip Smith
Mr Clive Theunissen
Mr Stuart Burnett
Mr Danie Louw
Ms Kirsten Burgess
Mr Morne Peterson

Mr Bruce Burmeister
Ms Claire Abrahamse
Mr Silvester Krivograd
Mr Schalk Marais
Ms Lize Malan
Mr Jody Vlok
Mr Conway William

Apologies

Prof Walter Peters (WP)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 12 July 2022.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 12 July 2022.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 7 July 2022

Ratification of the Minutes was held over to the next BELCom meeting to be held on 27 July 2022.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

6.1 Recusals

- DB: item 13.1

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

Nothing to report.

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

Nothing to report.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted.

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

None.

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

None.

10. Appointments

None.

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions at Erf 3507, 9 Higgs Crescent, St John's Estate, Oranjezicht: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / ORANJEZICHT / ERF 3507

Case No: 22060607SJ0606E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Neil Franks (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is a PHS and is situated inside an HPOZ.
- The subject building, also known as 'Bellevue', is a late 17th Cape Dutch Farmhouse.
- CoCT did not support the proposals.
- CIBRA did not support the proposals.
- Cape Town Heritage Foundation did not support the proposals.
- St John's Estate Homeowners Association Councillor did not comment within the commenting period.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

1. The Committee has no objection to the proposed pool as it is located at a lower level and fitted into the contours of the landscape.
2. The Committee agrees with the I&APs' objections with respect to the fenestration shape, form and extent.
3. The fenestration is to be dealt with holistically across all elevations keeping in mind the wall to window ratios and fenestration type. This is of particular concern at east and north elevations.
4. Any new alteration should be respectful of the history and heritage of the site. Additions should comprise of a subtle intervention, be subservient and complementary to the historical core of the building.
5. Colour code the plans in terms of date to enable the Committee to assess the impact on heritage fabric.

SJh

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition and Redevelopment at Erf 64693, 5 Purley Street, Kenilworth: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / KENILWORTH / ERF 64693

Case No: 22051706SJ0523E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Bruce Burmeister (Harfield Village Association) and Mr Philip Smith (CoCT) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade III C resource and located outside an HPOZ, but within the proposed extension of the HPOZ.
- CoCT did not support the proposals.
- Harfield Village Association did not support the proposals.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Little to no information has been provided about the history of existing structure nor its heritage value/significance.

The applicant did not provide contextual information to motivate the total demolition nor the replacement block of flats. This information to be provided enable the Committee to make an informed decision.

The Committee recommends that applicant engage the services of a suitably qualified architect or planner with appropriate heritage experience to provide the necessary information for the committee to assess the application.

SJh

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 875, 11 Piet Retief Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH/ ERF 875

Case No: 22012801CH0225E

Application documents were tabled.

HELD OVER:

The matter was held over to a next BELCom meeting to be held on 27 July 2022.

CH

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 6917 - RE, 16 Synagogue Street, Paarl: NM HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ ERF 6917

Case No: 22040511RG0414E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIC resource and located outside the Special Character Protected Area Overlay Zone of Paarl.
- Drakenstein Municipality objected to the proposals.
- Drakenstein Heritage Foundation objected to the proposals.
- Paarl300 noted that they could not comment on work already completed.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee does not condone unauthorised work, however in this instance, the Committee does not recommend charges to be laid and a S.51 letter can be issued as heritage resources have not been negatively impacted.

RG

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Portion 3 of Farm 169, Uitkijk, Stellenbosch: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH/ PORTION 3 OF FARM 169

Case No: 22042811CH0513E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Schalk Marais (engineer) and Mr Danie Louw (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HOMS graded the site a IIIB resource.
- Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation supports the proposals.
- Stellenbosch Interest Group supports the proposals.
- Stellenbosch Municipality supports the proposals.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as having met previous requirements and indicated on drawing numbered 2-2; 4-1; 4-2; 4-3; 9-1; 9-2; 9-3; 9-4; DS/WS-1, Revision 5, dated November 2020 and prepared by Adsquare Architecture and Design as not negatively impacted heritage significance.

CH

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf RE 735, 36 Hastings Street, Tamboerskloof: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / TAMBOERSKLOOF / ERF 735

Case No: 22052702MS0531E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Ms Kirsten Burgess (applicant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIB resource and located inside an HPOZ.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requires the applicant to investigate the authenticity of the existing balustrade on the Hastings Street elevation. Should this balustrade be authentic, the proposed balustrade design should be sympathetic to the existing, if not a reworked proposal to soften the visual impact of a new balustrade to be presented. New elements should firstly take the design cues from the building itself and then from the local historic boundary treatment patterns, not the contemporary generic examples.

MS

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1518, 4 Highbury, 42 Davenport Road, Vredehoek: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / VREDEHOEK / ERF 1518

Case No: 22020306MS0224E

The matter was removed from the agenda.

MS

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 50464, 9 Vincent Avenue, Rondebosch: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 50464

Case No: 22050315CM0621E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the case.

Mr Jody Vlok (contractor), Mr Morne Peterson (architect) and Mr Conway William (owner) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIC resource and located outside an HPOZ.
- A set of plans stamped and signed as approved by CoCT was presented.
- CoCT submitted a comment expressing concern.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawing numbered 20 201/202/203/204 and 21 201/202 & 21 301/302 Revision A, dated 27 July 2021 and prepared by MPET as not negatively impacted heritage significance.

CM

13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 646, 25 Torbay Road, Green Point: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ GREEN POINT / ERF 646

Case No: 21062903KB0629E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (heritage consultant), Mr Silvester Krivograd (owner) and Mr Stuart Burnett (Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIB resource and located inside an HPOZ.
- CoCT did not support the proposals.
- Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association did not support the proposals.

RECORD OF DECISION:

This Committee cannot condone unauthorised work. In this instance the heritage practitioner was engaged to present a report in which mitigation measures were proposed. The Committee

supports the mitigation proposals prepared by Ms Abrahamse and requires a heritage mitigation agreement to be entered into between the owner and HWC.

Ms Abrahamse should be retained to monitor construction and prepare the closeout report which is to be submitted with 60 days of completion of work.

KB

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

**19.1 Erf 1895, 31 Bellevue Street, Oranjezicht: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / ORANJEZICHT / ERF 1895**

Case No: 22031112MS0315E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

COMMENT

The Committee recommends that the owners be given 30 days to rectify the transgressions to the boundary wall, failing which criminal charges will be laid.

MS

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 12:20

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

27 July2022

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

APPROVED