

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**

**Scheduled for 09:00 and held on Wednesday, 25 November 2020 via
Microsoft Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 08:54 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)
Prof Walter Peters (WP)
Mr Dennis Belter (DB)
Ms Mishkah Collier (MC)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CAP)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Nokubonga Dlamini (ND)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)

Visitors:

Mr Bruce Wilson
Mr Andy Nold
Mr Gordon Metz
Mr Oscar Schmidt
Ms Carla Clara Camino
Ms Laura Milandri
Mr Theo Kruger
Mr Phillip Smith
Mr Stuart Thomson
Mr Ralph Baumgarten
Ms Kim Johnson

Mr Derek Salter
Mr Larry Aberman
Mr Philip Viljoen
Dr Rolf Annas
Mr Andre Carstens
Mr Mike Scurr
Ms Ursula Rigby
Ms Anja Lareman
Ms Busi Mgwanya
Mr Leon Noussis
Mr Alexis van der Merwe

3. Apologies

Mr Stuart Hermansen (SH)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 25 November 2020.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 25 November 2020.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 12 November 2020.

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 12 November 2020 and resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

5.2 BELCom Wupperthal Sub-Committee Minutes dated 20 November 2020.

The Committee resolved that the minutes be carried over for consideration.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

None

6.1 Recusals

None

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the outcomes of the following appeals matters:

- Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 10046, 58 Lymington Way, Zonnebloem.
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 164592, 48 Riverside Road, Fernwood, Newlands.
- Proposed Telecommunications mast, Erf 204, 12 Burger Street, De Rust.

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

There were no cases to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

Nothing to report.

8.4 Wupperthal

For Noting

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Closeout Reports

Nothing to report.

9.4 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Noted.

9.5 Discussion of agenda

Noted.

10. Appointments

10.1 None.

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 None

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 405, 11 Oldfield Road, Sea Point: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SEA POINT/ERF 405

Case No: 20102604ND1027E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Mr Bruce Wilson (Applicant), Mr Derek Salter (Secretary: Firmount Neighbourhood Action Group), Mr Andy Nold (Public participant), Mr Larry Aberman (Public participant), Mr Gordon Metz (SFB representative) and Mr Philip Viljoen (Public participant) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The existing buildings do not have sufficient significance to warrant retention.
- The main consideration is therefore the design of the replacement structure.
- The sensitivity of the interface between the subject site and park (a grade IIIA resource) was discussed.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objection in principle to the demolition of the existing structures. The appropriate design of the replacement structures in relation to the context is however critical, particularly with regard to the interface with the adjacent park which is a IIIA graded resource. The Committee requires further information with regard to this interface where there is an opportunity for improvement. The setback line on this side of the property could also be better explored to the benefit of both the Applicant and Community.

ND

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Completed Additions and Alterations, Erf 2675, 27 Rugley Road, Vredehoek: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / VREDEHOEK /ERF 2675

Case No: 19101702SB1029E

Section 34 application, plans and other relevant documents were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Oscar Schmidt (Architect) was present and took part in discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Photographs of the unauthorized dormer window in relation to its immediate neighbour were submitted.
- It was clear from these photographs that the unauthorized dormer window is a virtual match of the one next door.

RECORD OF DECISION:

HWC cannot condone illegal work. A letter in terms of S.51 of the NHRA is to be sent to the Applicant.

The Committee does not believe that the unauthorised work sufficiently impacts on the public view of this building to warrant a recommendation that charges be laid.

SB

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 2243, 9 Rose Street, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN /PAARL/ERF 2243

Case No: 20071304ND0713E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Ms Carla Clara Camino (Owner), and Dr Rolf Annas (Chairman of Drakenstein Heritage Foundation) were present and took part in the discussion. Mr Andre Carstens, the author of the drawings was present and able to hear the discussion but was not able to comment due to connectivity.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The submission includes unauthorised work, but also includes proposals for new work.
- The documentation does not distinguish between what is unauthorised and what is proposed.
- The documentation does not provide sufficient information for an accurate understanding of the significance of the subject building.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee reiterates that it cannot consider this item in the absence of the information required. The Committee notes that the outstanding information as recorded in the minutes of 29 July 2020 has not yet been provided despite the Committee calling for this to be presented at this meeting. Given the circumstances explained by the owner, the Committee is prepared to hold this item over until the meeting of 27 January 2021 to give sufficient time for the owner to get appropriate advice and adequate documentation submitted to HWC for this Committee's consideration.

The Committee strongly recommends that the owner obtains input from an appropriately qualified and experienced architectural heritage practitioner to address the Committee's concerns.

ND

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 8717, 19 Olyven Street, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 8717

Case No: 20090304ND0909E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Dr Rolf Annas (Chairman of Drakenstein Heritage Foundation) was present and took part in the discussion. Mr Andre Carstens, the author of the drawings was present and apparently able to hear the discussion but was not able to comment due to connectivity.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The additional information required by the Committee as recorded in the minutes of 30 September 2020 (item 13.12) has still not been provided.

This Committee is prepared to give the applicant an opportunity to submit the required information for tabling at its next meeting on 10 December 2020, failing which the Committee will proceed with its legal options.

ND

13.4 Revised Roof Proposal on Erf 44201, University of Cape Town , Upper Campus, Rondebosch: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 44201

Case No: 18112006HB1121E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Laura Milandri (Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects) and Mr Mike Scurr (Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects) were present and took part in the discussion.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed revision of the roof material to Rheinzink: colour “prismo red” as recommended by the architect, subject to sample testing on site with the understanding that, should this be deemed less appropriate than envisaged, the architect revert to HWC with alternatives.

KB

13.5 Proposed Restoration, Erf 55307, 43 Vineyard Road, Claremont: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 55307

Case No: 20101305SM1013E

HELD OVER:

The matter was held over for tabling at the next BELCom meeting to be held on 10 December 2020.

SM

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 27957, 5 Franklin Street, Observatory: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/OBERVATOR/ERF 27957

Case No: 20102209ND1029E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Mr Theo Kruger (Architect) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The subject property falls within a proposed HPOZ.
- The proposal is at odds with the streetscape comprising rows of terrace houses graded IIIC on both sides on the street.
- Inappropriate aspects of the proposals include unsympathetic massing, scale, articulation and street interface.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee cannot support the application in its current form as it will have a highly negative impact on a streetscape comprising development of contextual significance within a proposed HPOZ.

In order for the Committee to consider more favourably other alternatives for the property, these must be accompanied by a heritage statement and heritage indicators informed by a streetscape analysis of Franklin Street amongst others.

ND

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 86417, 10 Camp Road, Muizenberg: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MUIZENBERG/ERF 86417

Case No: 20100511TZ1007E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Ms Ursula Rigby (Heritage Practitioner), Mr Stuart Thomson (Architect) and Mr Philip Smith (CoCT) were present and took part in the discussion.

RECORD OF DECISION:

HWC cannot condone illegal work. As the owner was not legally responsible for the illegal work, the Committee does not recommend that charges be laid. To facilitate the process a heritage agreement must be entered into with HWC to provide for mitigation of the negative heritage impacts.

The Committee supports the mitigation as recommended in Heritage Report dated September 2020 Draft 02, prepared by Ursula Rigby subject to further details being provided regarding distinguishing between old and new, the retention of significant trees on the property, mitigation of the main entrance gate piers and the design of the external enclosure of the mud room.

The final proposals as approved to form part of the heritage agreement.

TZ

13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 9795, Spaanschemat River Road, Constantia: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CONSTANTIA/ERF 9795

Case No: 20200928TZ1007E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Ms Anja Lareman (Architect), Ms Busi Mgwenya, Mr Ralph Baumgarten and Mr Phillip Smith (CoCT) were present and took part in the discussion.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee generally supports the proposals but requires the following refinements:

1. Retaining stubs where internal walls are to be removed.
2. Retaining the existing gable profiles on the rear elevation unless clearly substantiated to the contrary.
3. Expressing the existing colonnade of posts on the enclosed rear veranda in front of the glazing line.
4. Exploring the hiping back of the ends of the pool house roof to reinforce the homestead as the focus of the architectural composition.
5. Simplifying the fenestration of the glazing on the long sides of the pool house.

The Committee recommends that landscaping and roof ventilation (e.g. by ridge vent) be explored to reduce heat build up in the pool house.

TZ

13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 54715,18 Highwick Avenue, Claremont: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 54715

Case No: 20070204TZ0720E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Mr Philip Smith (CoCT), Mr Leon Noussis (Applicant), Ms Kim Johnson (Applicant) and Mr Alexis van der Merwe (UCRRA) were present and took part in the discussion.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The building is located within an area that includes various significant structures even though it does not fall within an HPOZ. Consequently, the Committee needs to satisfy itself that sufficient information has been provided for it to be clear as to the subject building's significance.

A heritage statement is therefore required at the very least for the Committee to determine to what extent it would need to intervene to ensure that heritage significance is not negatively impacted, particularly given that the CoCT has graded this building grade IIIB and it falls within a proposed HPOZ.

It is recommended that the applicant obtain assistance from a suitably qualified and experienced architectural heritage specialist to assist.

TZ

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 14:40

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

10 December 2020

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____