



**APPROVED MINUTES OF A MEETING OF HERITAGE  
WESTERN CAPE (HWC)  
INVENTORIES, GRADING AND INTERPRETATION COMMITTEE (IGIC) HELD ON 17<sup>TH</sup> OF AUGUST  
2023, AT 09H00 HELD IN THE MAIN BOARDROOM AT THE PROVINCIAL ARCHIVE BUILDING AT  
NO.72 ROELAND STREET, CAPE TOWN.**

---

**1. Opening and Welcoming**

The Chairperson, Mr. Ron Martin, opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**IGIC Committee**

Mr. Ron Martin (RM)  
Mr. Glynn Alard (GA) (11:50)  
Ms. Jenna Lavin (JL)  
Ms. Laura Milandri (LM)

**HWC Staff**

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel (JW)  
Ms. Naushina Rahim (NR)  
Ms. Cecilene Muller (CM)  
Ms. Xola Mlwandle (XM)  
Ms. Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)  
Ms. Zahraa Ismail (ZI)  
Mr. Olwethu Dlova (OD)

**Visitors**

Mr. David Hart  
Ms. Nomthunzi Jacobs  
Adv. Nicholas Smith  
Mr. Riad Davids  
Ms Sandra van der Merwe  
Dr. Stephen Townsend  
Mr. Sabelo Mweni

Ms. Harriet Cliff  
Ms Claire Abrahamse  
Ms. Ilze Wolff  
Mr Reinier Visser  
Ms. Mishkah Collier  
Ms. Melodie Campbell

**Legal Advisor**

Ms. Naushina Rahim (NR)

**3. Apologies**

Dr Wandile Kasibe  
Ms. Penelope E Meyer

**Absent**

None

**4. Approval of the agenda dated 4<sup>th</sup> of August 2023.**

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated **4<sup>th</sup> of August 2023** with minor edits L.M moved to adopt the approval of the agenda and J.L seconded.

**5. Approval of the previous minutes**

**5.1 IGIC Minutes dated 5<sup>th</sup> of May 2023.**

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes dated 5<sup>th</sup> of May 2023. Ms. J.L moved to adopt the approval of the agenda and L.M seconded.

**5.2 IGIC Minutes dated the 23<sup>rd</sup> of June 2023.**

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes dated 23<sup>rd</sup> of June 2023. L.M moved to adopt the approval of the agenda and R.M seconded.

**6. Disclosure of Interest**

6.1 J.L item 9.1 & 13.2

**7. Confidential matters**

7.1 None

**8. Appointments**

8.1 Item 17.1. UCT Conservation Framework -Grade II verification (11H00 -12H30)

**9 Administrative Matters**

9.1 City of Cape Town Development Focus Area, exemptions.

Ms. Jenna Lavin recused herself and left the meeting.

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave a presentation.

Mr David Hart (CoCT Official), Ms. Harriet Cliff (CoCT Official), Ms. Melodie Campbell (CoCT Official) and Ms. Mishkah Corlie (CoCT Official) were present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed:

- The subject item was discussed at the previous IGIC Committee meeting on the 23<sup>rd</sup> of June 2023.
- At the meeting of 23 June 2023, the committee recommended that a social history expert be appointed to assess the social significance of sites currently mentioned in the exemption reports, and to make note of any other sites within the proposed exemption areas.

- The social historian should note the socio-political context which includes significant past and continuous forced removals and dislocation of the communities. Also, the current communities must be viewed at a larger scale than the boundaries of the DFAs.
- The committee also recommended that the social significance of the Phillippi Horticultural Area (PHA) as a remnant of a larger cultural landscape which was typified by an agricultural land use, with attributes relating to sense of place needs to be assessed. The IGIC required a proposed grading for the PHA before considering the proposed exemption area.
- The CoCT addressed a clarification seeking letter dated 24 July 2023 to the committee in order to understand the scope of the recommendations provided as an outcome of the meeting of 23 June 2023.
- In discussion regarding the Phillippi Horticultural Area, the CoCT representatives noted:
  - The proposed exemption area is already industrialised.
  - Declaration of this exemption area will take pressure off the agricultural core of the PHA.
  - There are only three sites of heritage significance within the exemption area, all of which are proposed to be added to the register.
  - The Springfield School site was recently approved for demolition at HOMs.

#### **RECOMMENDATION/ COMMENT**

The committee recommended that:

- The requirement for the appointment of a social history expert be waived, provided that the social history section of each exemption application report be improved and include, at a minimum, the settlement pattern history of the proposed exemption area.
- The application for the Ottery/Lansdowne exemption area can be considered separately from the agricultural cultural landscape of the Phillippi Horticultural Area.

**JW**

#### **9.2 Report back on Closeout Reports**

#### **9.3 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

NR reported back on the following Appeals and Tribunal matters:

##### **Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 55183, 24 Bishopslea Road, Claremont**

##### **DECISION**

The appeal is dismissed.

The appeal committee endorsed the findings of BELCom.

The heritage design indicators were appropriate to the site and the precinct. The replacement building conformed to the approved heritage design indicators.

##### **Proposed Erf: 576, 21 Quick Street, Stanford: NM**

##### **DECISION**

The appeal is upheld.

The development proposal is contrary to the heritage guidelines which form part of the heritage survey and which have been formally adopted by the Overstrand Municipality and which are endorsed by the Appeals Committee.

**Proposed Erf 917, Church Street, Worcester: NM**

**DECISION**

The appeal is dismissed.

The decision of BELCom is upheld.

**Proposed Erf 82, 11 Blackheath Road, Three Anchor Bay: NM**

**DECISION**

The appeal is upheld.

The revised plans to be submitted to the case officer for noting and stamping.

**Proposed Erven 2480, 2481 & 2482, Mossel Bay: NM**

**DECISION**

The appeal is partially upheld.

The Clearview fence is to be replaced with galvanized palisade fence in the same position as the Clearview fence indicated in the drawing number S01a.

9.4 **Report back on Council Meetings**

10. **Site inspections and inspection reports**

10.1 UCT Upper, Middle, Lower and Health Sciences Campuses for the Grade II verification

11. **Policy matters**

11.1 None

12. **Surveys**

12.1 None

13. **Proposed nominations of Provincial Heritage Sites**

13.1 Athlone Power Station, Athlone (MA)

Public Participation Documents circulated.

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave a presentation .

Adv Nicholas Smith, Ms Nomthunzi Jacobs (Langa Municipality Official), Mr David Hart (CoCT Official), Riad Davids (Athlone Ward Councilor), Ms Sandra van der Merwe (DOCOMOMO Official) and Mr Reinier Visser (Cape Institute for Architecture) were present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed:

- The Provincial Heritage Site (PHS) nomination was put forward by DOCOMOMO in 2020. A revised nomination with revised boundaries was submitted in 2022, as a result of engagement with the site owner, City of Cape Town.
- The item was tabled at numerous IGIC Committee meetings in 2021 and 2022.
- The committee noted that the site has a Grade II significance.

HWC IGIC Minutes 17<sup>th</sup> of August 2023

- The exemptions granted in terms of S48(3) of the NHRA published in the provincial gazette 8742 and dated 6 April 2023 was also mentioned.
- The City of Cape Town's representatives noted that proclamation of the site as a Provincial Heritage Site was not preferred, but that in that the City was willing to allow the nomination provided that the existing exemptions and revised site boundaries were applied.

## RECOMMENDATION

The committee recommended that the current exempted areas, structures, and activities granted in terms of S48(3) of the NHRA, continue to be excluded as part of the proposed PHS declaration. The committee recommends the application to the HWC Council for final approval.

**JW**

### 13.2 De Novo, Kraaifontein:( MA)

Public Participation Documents circulated.

Ms. Jenna Lavin recused herself and left the meeting.

Ms. Cecilene Muller gave presentation.

## DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed:

- The application is for a proposed PHS declaration.
- The matter was heard at the previous IGIC Committee meeting dated the 5<sup>th</sup> May 2023.
- A site inspection was undertaken on the 22<sup>nd</sup> of February 2022 by previous IGIC members
- The different heritage layers and uses for the site were discussed.
- The 30-day consultation period has been concluded informing the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works.

## RECOMMENDATION

The committee resolved to endorse the broader 60-day public consultation process in terms of Section 27.

**CM**

### 14. Provincial Heritage Site plaque replacement

14.1 None

### 15. Sections 27, 28, 29, 30 & 31 Formal Protections

15.1 None

### 16. Proposed Provisional Protection

16.1 None

HWC IGIC Minutes 17<sup>th</sup> of August 2023

**17. Proposed Exemptions**

17.1 None

**18. Conservation Body Registration**

18.1 Bo-Kaap Tourism Association, Bo-Kaap, Cape Town. (NM)

Application to register as a Conservation Body

Ms. Cecilene Muller gave presentation.

**DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed:

- The application is for registration of Bo-Kaap Tourism Association to be registered as conservation body in Bo-Kaap area.
- Responsible tourism and the sustainable use of the Bo-Kaap heritage resources were emphasized.
- The proposed geographical area of interest overlaps with areas already covered by the Bo-Kaap Civic Association and Bo-Kaap Youth Movement. Although noted, IGIC does not see the overlap as problematic.
- 

**RECOMMENDATION**

The committee endorsed the application of the Bo-Kaap Tourism Association to register as a Conservation Body with HWC.

**CM**

18.2 Duiwenshok Conservancy, Cape Town. (NM)

Application to register as a Conservation Body

Ms. Cecilene Muller gave presentation.

**DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed:

- The application is a proposal for Duiwenshok Conservancy to be registered as a Conservation Body.

**RECOMMENDATION**

The committee endorsed the application of the Duiwenshok Conservancy to register as a Conservation Body with HWC.

**CM**

18.3 Montagu Heritage Association, Montagu, Cape Town (NM)  
HWC IGIC Minutes 17<sup>th</sup> of August 2023

## **DISCUSSION**

Removed from the agenda because the organization is registered with HWC

**CM**

## **19. Conservation Body Management Plan**

19.1 Paarl 300 Foundation, Paarl, Drakenstein Municipality. (MA)

Amendment of conservation body boundaries in terms of S25

Ms. Cecilene Muller gave a presentation.

### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following matter were discussed:

- The application is for an amendment of a conservation boundary of the Paarl 300 Foundation was discussed.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

The committee endorse and approved the amendment application of the Paarl 300 Foundation boundary to align with that of the Drakenstein Heritage Foundation.

**CM**

19.2 Parkscape Association:

Amendment of the Parkscape Association Constitution

Ms. Cecilene Muller gave a presentation.

### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed:

- The application was heard on the 5<sup>th</sup> of May 2023 with further requirements requested.
- The potential conservation body was requested to amend its constitution to reflect HWC mandate as indicated by the NHRA which focus on cultural heritage.
- The letter submitted on Tuesday 16<sup>th</sup> August 2023 by Parkscape Association was discussed.

### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

The committee requires the Parkscape Association to submit a constitution that reflects the conservation and management of cultural heritage in a designated geographical boundary. An integrated map with GPS coordinates be submitted indicating clear geographical boundaries.

**CM**

19.3 Wellington Heritage Foundation:

A map of conservation body boundaries

HWC IGIC Minutes 17<sup>th</sup> of August 2023

Ms. Cecilene Muller gave a presentation.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed:

- The application was previously heard on the IGIC Committee meeting dated the 5<sup>th</sup> of May 2023.
- The further requirements for a map and minutes were met with the submission of the required information.

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

The committee endorsed the application of the Wellington Heritage Foundation to be registered as a conservation body with Heritage Western Cape.

CM

## **20. Surveys/Inventories**

### **20.1 Grade II verification & Heritage Agreement, UCT. (MA)**

UCT Conservation Framework and Heritage Agreement

Ms. Cecilene Muller gave a presentation.

Dr Stephen Townsend (Consultant), Ms Clair Abrahams (Consultant), David Hart (CoCT Official) and Harriet Cliff (CoCT Official), were present and took part in the discussion.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed:

- The Item was previously heard on the IGIC Committee meetings on the 5<sup>th</sup> of May 2023. The item was also heard on the HWC IACom Committee meeting on the 21<sup>st</sup> of June 2023, when the Heritage Agreement was discussed.
- The consultant and legal advisors discussed the heritage agreement in depth on the 18<sup>th</sup> of July 2023. An outcome is the redrafting of the heritage agreement and a task list indicating tasks that need to be actioned by UCT and HWC respectively.
- A site inspection was undertaken on 13<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> of July 2023 by IGIC members who were joined by the consultant team to the UCT Campuses, except the Hiddingh Campus, to verify the Grade II heritage resources.
- The mention of memorials and monuments was discussed.
- The committee approved the inventories as presented in terms of the Conservation Framework.
- More detailed statement of significances and clear boundaries for the proposed PHS's will be drafted by the consultant/s in consultation with HWC staff for gazette notices pertaining to the declaration of the PHS's.
- CoCT will assist with the termination of the HPOZ in which Hiddingh Campus currently falls.



## **DECISION**

The committee approved the UCT inventories proposed for the campuses as set out by the UCT Conservation Framework on condition that:

- The proposed PHS area of the Baxter Theatre be amended to include the northern entrance canopy and the garden up to Woolsack drive.
- The proposed PHS area at the Health Sciences Campus be amended to reflect the built boundary.

## **RECOMMENDATION/COMMENT**

The committee recommends the Heritage Agreement (Section 5.4.4.) be revised to include the following:

- Placement and visual treatment of services and facilities, such as electrical services, HVAC systems, generators and refuse areas.
- Interpretation and signage giving information regarding areas of heritage significance.
- Treatment of memorials and statues of heritage significance.

**CM**

### 20.2 Updated Voortrekker Road, Exemption Report (MA)

Updated Report

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave a presentation.

Ms. Harriet Cliff (CoCT Official), Mishkah Collier (CoCT Official) and Mr. Davit Hart (CoCT Official) were present and took part in the discussion.

## **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed:

- The item was previously heard at the IGIC meeting on the ~~on the~~ 4<sup>th</sup> of November 2022 and 5<sup>th</sup> of May 2023.
- The application is for the exemption of a section of Voortrekker Road from the general protection under S.34 of the NHRA, as a high proportion of buildings older than 60 years within the area have been identified as "not conservation worthy" by the City of Cape Town.
- The committee undertook a site inspection on the 2<sup>nd</sup> of April 2023.
- The committee requested the report include research on intangible heritage, specifically to include the social history of the Goodwood forced removals and social significance of Die Akkers area.
- An updated report was received dated June 2023.
- The committee noted that the application is still incomplete as the further requirements were not met.

**RECOMMENDATION/ COMMENT**

The committee gave the following comments regarding the application:

- Regarding the S.34 exemptions, the committee is satisfied with the amended inventory, subject to the findings of the Public Participation Process.
- Regarding the S.38 exemption, the committee is not satisfied with the research provided for the Social History.
- The next iteration of the report will be submitted to IGIC including the findings of the public participation process. In this updated submission, the report should include an improvement on Social History (section 2.2) with specific inclusion of forced removals in, and social significance of Die Akkers.

**JW**

**21. Other Matters**

21.1 None

**21. Adoption of Resolutions and Decisions**

The Committee unanimously adopted the decisions and resolutions, with GL proposing and JL seconding the proposal.

**21. Date of next meeting:** 3<sup>rd</sup> of November 2023

**21.1 CLOSURE:** 15:45

**MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** 3<sup>rd</sup> of November 2023 \_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_