

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of the Impact Assessment Committee (IACOM)
of Heritage Western Cape (HWC) held via MS Teams
at 09H00 on Wednesday, 22 January 2025**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr David Gibbs, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present. The Committee observed a moment of silence in memory of the late Dr Nicholas Bauman.

2. Attendance

Members

Mr David Gibbs (DG) (Chair)
Dr Antonia Malan (AM)
Ms Sarah Winter (SW)
Ms Katie Smuts (KS)
Mr John Wilson-Harris (JWH)
Mr Chefferino Fortuin (CF)
Mr Dave Saunders (DS)
Ms Heid Boise (HB) (co-opted)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM) (co-opted)

Staff

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJh)
Ms Sofia Vy Mell Briel (SVMB)
Emily-Jane Vowles (EJV)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Chiara Singh (CS)
Mr Ruan Brand (RB)
Mr Shichavo Vhukeya (SV)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Ms Colette Scheemeyer (CSc)

Observers

None

Visitors

Mr Graham Jacobs
Ms Anine Trumpelmann
Ms Uryke de Preez
Mr Johan Malherbe
Ms Erna Sills
Mr Jeremy Rose
Mr Leonard Heydenrych
Mr Tarryn Solomon
Ms Kirsty Westcott
Ms Ilse Viljoen
Mr Shilo Hope
Mr Piet de Beer
Ms Amanda Fritz-Whyte
Ms Georina Westraadt
Mr Andrew Thomas September

Mr Andrew Matterson
Mr Henry Aikman
Mr Willem Bruwer
Mr Janse van Rensburg
Ms Christelle Louw
Mr David Halkett
Ms Tali Bruk
Ms Bridget O'Donoghue
Mr Franck Kabila
Mr Matthew Hirsch
Mr Cleef Danfred Fortuin
Mr Achmad Bassiers
Mr Clive Theunissen
Mr Deon Cloete
Ms Fi Smit

3. Apologies

Ms Samantha Lee (SL)

3.1. Absent

None

4. Approval of the Agenda

4.1 Agenda dated 22 January 2025

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 22 January 2025 with minor changes.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Minutes dated 13 November 2024

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 13 November 2024 and resolved to approve them as circulated without amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest and acceptance of the code of conduct

- DG: item 15.1

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None.

8. Appointments

None

9 Administrative Matters

9.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the following Appeals matters:

- Erf 2334, 20 Church Street, Prince Albert
- Farm 610, 612 near Riebeek-Kasteel
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 922, 34 Durbanville Avenue, Durbanville
- Erf 2806, 16 Church Street, Tulbagh
- Erf 52671, 20 Stanley Road, Claremont
- Erf 1061 Remainder, 12 Main Road, Hout Bay
- Erf 1361, 37 Ocean View Drive, Green Point

9.2 Erven 381, 384-RE, 385 and Portion of 386-RE, 2 & 4 Mill Street, Oranjezicht

Case No: HWC23042606CN0530

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

RECORD OF DECISION:

1. The Committee resolved to endorse to appointment of Mr Graham Jacobs as the suitably qualified Heritage Practitioner to advise on work to Lincoln House, as per the HIA mitigation measures.
2. Mr. Graham Jacobs will oversee the remaining work/ works. Regular reports on the design development, technical detailing and conservation methods followed in the restoration process should be requested by Mr. Jacobs.
3. Any on-site modifications or adjustments not covered by the intent of this report, and which require HWC approval are to be submitted to HWC in terms of Section 34 of the NHRA.
4. A close out report should be submitted to HWC by Mr. Graham Jacobs within 6 months of Practical Completion.

CN

10. Standing Items

10.1 Site Inspections/Virtual Assessments undertaken:

- Proposed Redevelopment on Erven 367-Re & 617, Strand Street Quarry, Bo-Kaap, Cape Town

10.1.1 Farm 839, Casa Maris Estate CMP, Stellenbosch: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH /FARM 839

Case No: X111019JB17

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Graham Jacobs (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Both BELCom and IACom endorsed the CMP which is well articulated.
- The diagrams indicate the original Farm 839 overlaid on the Toll House precinct.
- The extent of the protected area should include areas of archaeological potential.
- The condition of the approval in respect of interpretation is strongly supported and needs to conform with original RoD.
- Practical use of wagon routes for hiking may require a degree of filling of the erosion for safety.

COMMENT:

The IACom together with the BELCom recommends that the Council approve the CMP and recommends further that the Toll House precinct at its optimal extent (including areas of archaeological potential) be nominated as a PHS. The condition of the provincial approval of the

estate includes an interpretative component and archaeological monitoring conditions; both of which must be complied with and implemented.

SB

**10.1.2 Farm 1579 Portion 9, Kleinbosch, Paarl - Interim Report: MA
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ FARM 1576 PORTION 9**

Case No: 22032911SB0405E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Uryke du Preez (project administrator) and Mr Johan Malherbe (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The reports noted:
 1. Gedenk school;
 2. Du Toit House; and
 3. Malherbe House.
- Changes in plan are proposed in response to new architectural information and client requirements. The proposed changes in plan are minor and not of concern.
- Discussion centered around Du Toit House gables; noting that the approved elevation drawings indicated a return to the earlier wolweneus gables, whereas the current elevation drawings propose retaining the existing full gables. These appeared to be 1920's alterations. The fragility of the building and the retention of heritage fabric motivated of the decision not to demolish the existing gables. This motivation was accepted by the Committee.

RECORD OF DECISION:

Both the IACom and BELCom approve the interim reports prepared by Anne-Marie Fick Heritage Consultant dated November 2024 the drawings prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects dated September 2024, numbered Gedenkskool (5101 rev A, 5201 Rev A, 5202 Rev A, 5301 Rev A, 5302 Rev A, 5303 Rev A), Du Toit House (4101 Rev A, 4201 Rev A, 4202 Rev A, 4203 Rev A, 4301 Rev A, 4302 Rev A) and Malherbe House (3101 Rev A, 3201 Rev A, 3202 Rev A, 3203 Rev A, 3301 Rev A, 3302 Rev A).

SB

10.2 Report back from Council and other Committees

Nothing to report.

10.3 Discussion of the Agenda

For discussion.

10.4 Potential/proposed Site Inspections

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11. SECTION 38(2) RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP (NID)

11.1 None

12. SECTION 38(1): INTERIM COMMENT

12.1 None

13. SECTION 38(4) RECORD OF DECISION (ROD)

13.1 None

14. SECTION 38(8) NEMA RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

14.1 None

15. SECTION 38(8) NEMA INTERIM COMMENTS

15.1 Proposed Redevelopment on Erven 367-Re & 617, Strand Street Quarry, Bo-Kaap, Cape Town: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / BO-KAAP / ERVEN 367-RE & 617

Case No: HWC24030710SJ0515

DG recused himself and joined the applicant for this item. The Committee subsequently nominated the DS to chair this item.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

The Committee members provided a report back on the site inspection undertaken on 29 November 2024.

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue (heritage consultant), Mr Piet de Beer, Mr Jeremy Rose and Ms Kirsty Westcott were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Excavation of quarry to accommodate the field.
- Noted that the dimension of the field.
- Nature of the rise of the terrace building.
- Geo technical netting.
- Integration of living heritage.
- Interface between existing housing and club house-scale.
- Traffic considerations.
- Cutting back of stoep to accommodate pedestrian walkway.
- The Committee noted that the HIA is the product of the public participation exercise with all interested parties as part of the NEMA process.

FINAL COMMENT:

The Committee has resolved to endorse the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), Strand Street Quarry, dated 31 October 2024, prepared by Bridget O'Donoghue, as having met the provision of Section 38(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act (NHRA), with specific reference to the following recommendations on page 251:

1. This HIA be endorsed by HWC as meeting the requirements contained in the Response to the NID, dated 3 June 2024;
2. The statement of significance and the heritage design indicators proposed in the report be accepted;
3. The Urban Design Framework, Guidelines and the SDP drawing package for the development of the site be approved. The detail design stage to resolve the retention or reduction of the historic stoep on the semidetached building facing Strand Street;
4. The concept Landscape Plan be approved;
5. The Living Heritage study and the concept proposals for expressing the cultural values of Bo Kaap be approved;
6. The Archeological Impact Assessment be approved;
7. The Traffic Impact Assessment be approved; and
8. The Visual Impact Assessment and the recommended mitigation measures to inform the detail design be approved.

Specific recommendations:

1. The proposed field is named a multi sports field and not a rugby field;
2. The field is accessed by various sporting codes and recreational users, all managed on a fair basis;
3. The netball court should be a multi-use court and be fitted with interchangeable nets for use for netball and basketball;
4. The area below the sports field is only used for vehicle parking and storage (i.e. no armaments are stored in this area);
5. Continued public engagement with the Interested and Affected parties (I&AP) continues in the detail design process.

Detail Design Phase recommendations:

1. The Urban Design Framework, Guidelines and the SDP drawing package, Landscape Plan and the community's cultural expression within the development are developed into a detail design phase;
2. The proposed buildings along Strand street should ensure the facade activation onto Strand Street and the opportunities for users from these proposed buildings to view towards Table Bay;
3. The detail design stage resolves the retention or reduction of the historic stoep on the semidetached building facing Strand Street;
4. Security measures around the Metro Police precinct and between the publicly accessible site and the field be resolved in the detail design;
5. Traffic assessment developed for the improved safety into the site that is shared by the public pedestrian access and vehicular Metro Police;
6. Endeavour to reduce the scale and footprint of the proposed Metro Police building and consider façade materials in order to visually contribute to the project and the quarry face;

7. The advertisement and promotion of the project site within Strand Street for the extent between the site and the proposed extended parking area is developed, for example mural, street and other artworks.

Archaeological Recommendations:

1. Monitoring of geo-technical excavations into the quarry bed for archaeological remains, and to document stratigraphy and bedrock elevation in the quarry bed. Recording any remains and salvaging if feasible.

The IACom recommends further that approval be made subject to the following additional conditions:

1. Further investigation to be undertaken to establish whether the stoep in its current form can be retained by making amendments to the street environment. The outcome of the investigation to be submitted to HWC for review and approval.
2. Final building plans for all heritage buildings graded IIIA to be submitted to HWC for approval.

SJ

16 SECTION 38(8) NEMA FINAL COMMENTS ON ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

16.1 Proposed Redevelopment on Erf 8442-RE, Frater Estate, De Zoete Inval Farm, Paarl: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ ERF 8442-RE

Case No: 22022506CH0228E

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Ms Cindy Postlethwayt (heritage consultant) and Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The further mitigation as per previous requirement reflects in the revised SDP.
- Density has been adjusted accordingly.

FINAL COMMENT:

The Committee has resolved to endorse the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), titled Heritage Impact Assessment (Pre-Application Phase) v2 Proposed Redevelopment (Frater Estate) of Erf 8442-Re, Paarl (De Zoete Inval) Farm) dated November 2024, and prepared by Ms. Cindy Postlethwayt, Professional Heritage Practitioner, as having met the provision of Section 38(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act (NHRA), with specific reference to the following recommendations on page 5 and 83:

1. The committee endorses the HIA report as having met the requirements of Section 38(3) of the NHRA.
2. In terms of Section 38(8) of the NHRA, the committee supports the proposed preferred alternative development described in Annexure F of the HIA report, subject to the mitigation measures included in Section 16 of the report. All proposed mitigation measures must be

included in the Final Environmental Management Programme and any further planning and design documentation that follows this phase of approvals (e.g.: SDP and Building Plan).

3. The committee approves the demolition of the buildings older than 60 years but proposed to be graded Not Conservation Worthy in this report.

CH

**16.2 Proposed Development (runway and associate infrastructure) on Portion 4 of Farm 474 Joostenbergs Kloof, Portion 10 of Farm 724 Joostenbergs Vlake, The Remainder of Farm 724 Joostenbergs Vlake, Portion 23 of Farm 724 Joostenbergs Vlake, Portion 7 of Farm 942 Kliprug, The Remainder of Farm 474 Joostenbergs Kloof, A portion of Portion 3 of Farm 474 Joostenbergs Kloof, Durbanville: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / DURBANVILLE/ MULTIPLE FARM PORTIONS**

Case No: HWC23101215SB1102

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant), Mr Andrew Thomas September (CoCT), Mr Deon Cloete (Cape Winelands Airport), Mr Leonard Heydenrych (Durbanville Heritage Society) and Ms Amanda Fritz-Whyte were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The position relative to the urban edge.
- Dr Townsend report.
- Structures were in ruins.
- 80-year history dating to World War II.
- Concerns relating to impact of the airport on the Durbanville environment.
- Concerns related to the impact on Farm and other historic farms in the area.

FINAL COMMENT:

The Committee has resolved to endorse the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), dated October 2024, and prepared by Aikman Associates, as having met the provision of Section 38(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act (NHRA), with specific reference to the following recommendations on page 29:

1. The preparation of a Landscape Master Plan that includes a tree survey/tree planting and management strategy, an irrigation/stormwater strategy, detailed fencing and boundary interface proposals, detailed signage proposals, and a consolidated lighting proposal.
2. Further visual specialist input will be needed at the level of the Land Use Planning application and the future SDP planning phases.

And including mitigation measures in the VIA prepared by Filia Visual dated September 2024 on page 113 to 129.

SB

- 17 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP**
17.1 None
- 18 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN INTERIM COMMENT**
18.1 None
- 19 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN FINAL COMMENT**
19.1 None
- 20 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP**
20.1 None
- 21 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION INTERIM COMMENT**
21.1 None
- 22 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION FINAL COMMENT**
22.1 None
- 23. SECTION 27 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES**
23.1 None
- 24. SECTION 47 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLANS**
24.1 None
- 25. ADVICE**
25.1 None
- 26. SECTION 42 HERITAGE AGREEMENTS**
26.1 None
- 27. OTHER**
27.1 None
- 28. Adoption of decisions and resolutions**
The Committee agreed to adopt the decisions and resolutions as recorded above.
- 29. CLOSURE:**
The meeting adjourned at 13:15
- 30. DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 19 February 2025**

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR:

DATE:

SECRETARY:

DATE: