

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of the Impact Assessment Committee (IACOM)
of Heritage Western Cape (HWC) held at the 1st Floor Boardroom, Protea Assurance
Building, Green Market Square, Cape Town
at 09H00 on Wednesday, 11 June 2025**



1. Opening and Welcome

NOTE: Due to the Chairperson, Mr. David Gibbs, being unable to attend the meeting, and tendering apologies, Ms Waseefa Dhansay presided over the election of an Acting Chairperson in terms of the rule 12(5) of the Rules of Order and Conduct at Meetings of HWC. The Committee elected Mr Dave Saunders to chair the meeting.

The Acting Chair, Dave Saunders, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Dr Antonia Malan (AM)
Mr Dave Saunders (DS)
Ms Sarah Winter (SW)
Ms Katie Smuts (KS)
Mr John Wilson-Harris (JWH)

Staff

Mr Ruan Brand (RB)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJh)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)
Ms Sinalo Kalase (SK)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Nuraan Vallie (NV)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Emily-Jane Vowles (EJV)
Ms Chiara Singh (CS)
Ms Sofia Vy Menell Briel (SVMB)

Observers

None

Visitors

Ms Cindy Postlethwayt
Mr D. Jacobs
Ms Ursula Rigby
Mr Johan Olivier
Prof Walter Peters
Mr Bruce Wilson
Ms C Jamal
Mr F Koks
Mr Y Williams
Ms Jessie Mcttroy
Mr Andrew Flint

Ms Susan Sheldon
Ms Lama Settley
Mr David Talba
Mr Tony Barbour
Ms Berendine Irrgang
Mr Ron Martin
Mr N Jamal
Ms J Koks
Ms Shireen Martin
Mr Fredy Janeke
Mr Luyanda Mpatsasa

3. Apologies

Mr David Gibbs (DG) (Chair)
Mr Chefferino Fortuin (CF)

3.1. Absent

None

4. Approval of the Agenda

4.1 Agenda dated 11 June 2025

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 11 June 2025 with minor changes.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Minutes dated 14 May 2025

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 14 May 2025 and resolved to approve them as circulated without amendments.

5.2 Minutes dated 20 May 2025

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 20 May 2025 and resolved to approve them as circulated with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest and acceptance of the code of conduct

None

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None.

8. Appointments

None

9 Administrative Matters

9.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the following Appeals matters:

- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1397, Bonne Esperance Boutique Guest House, 19 Van Riebeeck Street, Stellenbosch
- Erf 1212-RE, Strandfontein Pavilion, Baden Powell Drive, Strandfontein
- Erf 1061-RE, 12 Main Road, Hout Bay
- Erf 557, 18 Alexandra Avenue, Oranjezicht
- Erf 775-RE, 469 Main Road, Paarl

**9.2 Upgrade of R310 (MR168 and TR2/1) and Quarterlink on TR2/1, Baden Powell Drive, Stellenbosch: MA
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH / R310 UPGRADE / X110831TG02**

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

COMMENTS:

The Committee was unanimous in recording its dissatisfaction that original comments and recommendations made by the Committee have been ignored and have not been carried through to the final environmental authorization. This has resulted in irreparable damage to the scenic qualities of the R310 and its associated rural landscape and significant heritage resources.

Given the above, HWC is not in a position to endorse the road edge treatments that have been undertaken. The choice of materials and the engineering detail of the sidewalks is of an urban standard and have a negative impact on the rural qualities of this route through the winelands.

9.3 IACom member review

The fact that the Committee has recently lost two of its members was discussed. Committee members were requested to put forward names of appropriately skilled individuals who may be suited to fill the vacant positions.

9.4 Minimum Standard for HIA submission

For noting.

10. Standing Items

10.1 Site Inspections/Virtual Assessments undertaken:

- Proposed Development on Erf 9013, 29 Morgenster Avenue, Somerset West
- Erven 4507-RE, 4508, & 4509, Nedbank and FNBs, Cnr St Georges Street & Shortmarket Street, Cape Town City Centre
- Farm 1500, Between N1 and Old Paarl Road, Paarl

10.2 Report back from Council and other Committees

Nothing to report.

10.3 Discussion of the Agenda

For discussion.

10.4 Potential/proposed Site Inspections

- D'Olyfboom Farm RE 29112, Paarl
- Farm 1259; Erven 583; 1613; 1751; 1752; 1753, Paternoster Waterfront, Paternoster

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11. SECTION 38(2) RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP (NID)

11.1 None

12. SECTION 38(1): INTERIM COMMENT

12.1 None

13. SECTION 38(4) RECORD OF DECISION (ROD)

**13.1 Erven 4507-RE, 4508, & 4509, Nedbank and FNBs, Cnr St Georges Street & Shortmarket Street, Cape Town City Centre: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CAPE TOWN CITY CENTRE / ERVEN 4507-RE, 4508 & 4509**

Case No: HWC24010803SJ0108

Ms Sofia Vy Menell Briel introduced the case.

Dave Saunders reported back on the site inspection undertaken by the Committee on 23 May 2025.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- CoCT comments pertaining to the proposed addition and to the proposed new apertures at street level.
- Remodeling the façade of the new additions.
- Fenestration detailing of the proposed new additions.
- The nature of the proposed projecting pergola at the top of the building.
- The Street interface and the nature of the proposed new breaks in the ground floor base of the three buildings.
- The principle of the adaptive reuse with particular reference to the finely detailed and intact Barclays Building.
- Level of detail of concept design and the lack of more information pertaining to the proposed new work.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

An amended VIA is to be provided which reflects the responses from I&APs with particular reference to the pergola.

Further consideration of the FNB and Bank of Africa elevations and fenestration to be less disruptive of the existing heritage fabric.

SVMB

13.2 Proposed Development on Erf 9013, 29 Morgenster Avenue, Somerset West: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SOMERSET WEST/ ERF 9013

Case No: HWC24092511CSI1610

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection undertaken on 23 May 2025.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The HIA submitted complies with S38(3) of the NHRA.
- There is no objection to the demolition of buildings as proposed in the HIA.
- Interface of the proposed development and the adjacent Grade II landscape.
- The Committee noted that the landscape has a Grade II status.
- It was confirmed that the site and the road leading past it were not inside a PHS.
- The Committee raised concerns about the massing and scale of the development proposed along the river edge of the property facing towards Morgenster. The discussion included the comparison of two storey terrace like building morphology versus a three storey more apartment block type format.
- The developer was asked whether a rethink of the massing of development on the property was possible.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requires that further consideration be given to concerns pertaining to the potential negative impact of a three-storey apartment block at the interface of a protected natural environment i.e. the Lourens River and a Grade II cultural landscape. In order to mitigate this impact, consideration should be given to the reconfiguration of the proposed development in order to reduce the height of buildings at the interface to the river and to fragment the block and avoid the presence of a solid built form along this interface.

CSI

13.3 Proposed Redevelopment on Erf 31990-RE, 23 Main Road, Mowbray: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ MOWBRAY/ ERF 31990-RE

Case No: HWC24071109CN0717

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection undertaken on 23 May 2025.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to endorse the final drawings numbered CS_000, CS_010.1, CS_000.1, CS_001, CS_002, CS_003, CS_004, CS_005, CS_006, CS_007, CS_008, CS_009, CS_010, CS_200, revision 05, dated 26 May 2025 as prepared by Bruce Wilson Architects.

The HIA dated September 2024 prepared by Johan Cornelius and Kobus van Wyk and Specialist Studies are endorsed as meeting the requirements of S.38(3) of the NHRA and the recommendations as follows:

1. The indicators and responses contained in both reports are endorsed.
2. The provisional design recommendations and resultant proposed building envelope are endorsed in order to allow the developer to proceed.

The approvals contained in this decision are valid for 5 years from the date of this decision. This period may be extended on good reason being shown and at the discretion of HWC, provided that application for extension must be made prior to the effluxion of the 5-year period.

CH

**13.4 D'Olyfboom Farm RE 29112, Paarl: NM
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / PAARL/ FARM RE 29112**

Case No: HWC23060606SB0608

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Friday, 27 June 2025.

SB

**13.5 SDP Amendment on Erf 173714-Re, East Quay Building, East Quay, Clock Tower Precinct, V&A Waterfront: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / V&A WATERFRONT / ERF 173714-RE**

Case No: HWC25052001SJ0520

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Proposal in 2024 to reuse the I&J Building dating to 1920s and 1940 addition was endorsed.
- A new intended tenant requires an internal makeover that includes removal and storage of timber elements.
- The reversibility of the changes.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to endorse the recommendations contained in the SDP amendment document titled SDP8F amendment prepared by Ursula Rigby dated 16 May 2025 with the closeout report to be submitted to HOMs within 30 days of practical completion.

SJ

13.6 Proposed Development on Multiple Erven, 15 Voortrekker Road, Salt River Market, Cape Town: NM

HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CENTRAL CITY / ERVEN 15292, 15293, 15294, 10559, 10560, 10561, 10562, 10615, 10619, 10620, 10621, 176308

Case No: HWC23100301SJ0526

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Promoting an active integrated market space.
- The potential impact on the Bromwell Road Precinct.
- The importance of further detailed design to ensure urban contextual fit.
- Inappropriate reference to the precedent of the Conradie development, noting that the context was very different.

RECORD OF DECISION:

1. The Committee endorsed the HIA as meeting the requirements contained in the HWC Response to the NID, dated 19 October 2023.
2. The statement of significance and the heritage design indicators proposed in the report are accepted.
3. The set of drawings submitted to HWC in this HIA are to be date-stamped by HWC for a record of the proposal.
4. The SDP is to be submitted to HWC for an Interim Comment, the recommendation that HWC require the following design development items:
 - a. The use of more appropriate urban precedent, if any, for the design proposal
 - b. The developer must investigate with the CCT, the possibility of providing access to the precinct and Salt River Community Hall via Foundry Road and the area under the Voortrekker Road Railway Bridge. This would improve access to the precinct, including the Community Hall, from Salt River and enable residents of the development to access Salt River and Salt River Station without crossing Voortrekker Road.
 - c. The developer must investigate the option of incorporating 3 bedroomed units into the range of accommodation options (Social and Affordable components). This would make the development more attractive to families with two or more children and make the development more socially inclusive and compatible with Salt River.
 - d. The developer to investigate the opportunity to provide space adjacent and or linked to the community hall that can be used by community organisations from Salt River. This would strengthen the social links between the development and Salt River
 - e. Create space for an ECD centre as part of the development.
 - f. Develop design on the articulation of the facades.
5. The site's structures, except for the Hall and the former Manager's Office are approved for demolition.
6. Install interpretive signage on the publicly accessible site precincts, such as the plaza. This signage should be a component of the Landscape Plan implementation.
7. The following archaeological mitigation measures are to be included in the S38(3) ROD:
 - a. Archaeological monitoring during site clearance and initial excavations should be carried out.

- b. If any finds are made then, depending on their nature, recommendations on how to proceed would be formulated. Monitoring frequency can reduce once it becomes apparent how sensitive the site is; and if any archaeological material or human burials are uncovered during development then work in the immediate area should be halted. The find would need to be reported to the heritage authorities and may require inspection by an archaeologist. Such heritage is the property of the state and may require excavation and curation in an approved institution.
8. A registered Engineer, experienced with historic buildings, to provide a Method Statement on the interface of the historic Hall and proposed buildings to ensure that no negative structural impacts to the Hall results from the proposed development. This Method Statement will be subject to approval by HWC.
9. A Landscape Plan to be prepared by a registered Landscape Architect and include all soft and hard landscaping. The Landscape Plan includes a vegetated interface between the development and Voortrekker Road. This plan to be approved by HWC.
10. Local Businesses must be considered for the occupation of the retail use accommodation on the ground level. Where possible accommodate existing fresh produce market within the ground floor business component of the development. This will strengthen the link between the development and Salt River. The buildings should provide affordable small market spaces at ground floor recognizing that the market use of the site its primary heritage significance.
11. The developer should investigate the option of installing CCTV cameras at key access points to the site, including along Voortrekker Road, Bromwell Street, Foundry Road (assuming access to the precinct is provided from Foundry Road as recommended above), and Under the Bridge area.
12. Establish lighting in Under the Bridge area and access via Foundry Road at entrance and along interface with Voortrekker Road.

The approvals contained in this decision are valid for 5 years from the date of this decision. This period may be extended on good reason being shown and at the discretion of HWC, provided that application for extension must be made prior to the effluxion of the 5-year period.

SJ

**13.7 Erf 33030, Cressy Road, Garlandale: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GARLANDALE/ERF 33030**

Case No: HWC24101108XM0304

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site was previously a cemetery of the Anglican Church but could have been used for burials before 1867. The Black River cemetery served several churches and communities after the flu epidemic of 1918.
- It was exhumed by archaeologists under a SAHRA permit in 2017/18. Mary Patrick made several recommendations in her report dated 2019 but Covid delayed implementation.
- The exhumation was controversial at the time.
- There may be traces of unexhumed human remains.
- HOMS recommended a Grade IIIA grade, which is standard for burial grounds.

COMMENT:

The Committee has resolved that the HIA does not comply with the provisions of 38(3) of the NHRA for the following reasons:

1. The Mary Patrick report needs to be presented in its entirety and its relevance to the current proposal needs to be assessed by a suitably qualified archaeologist in an updated AIA as per the RNID.
2. The updated AIA is to include a mapping overlay process identifying various periods of use of the surrounding contexts throughout its history of occupation.
3. The above information must be compiled in a revised integrated HIA that complies with s38(3) and is subject to a further 30-day consultation period with all identified I&APs.

SB

14 SECTION 38(8) NEMA RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

14.1 None

15 SECTION 38(8) NEMA INTERIM COMMENTS

15.1 None

16 SECTION 38(8) NEMA FINAL COMMENTS ON ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

**16.1 Farm 1500, Between N1 and Old Paarl Road, Paarl: MA
CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / FARM 1500**

Case No: 18102913AS1207E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection undertaken on 23 May 2025.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The proposal dated 2021 previously approved.
- New proposal is an agri-business precinct with substantially same impact.
- Visual impact is the major heritage issue, particularly in context of cumulative developments.

FINAL COMMENT:

The Committee has resolved to endorse in terms of S38(8) the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), dated April 2025, and prepared by Cindy Postlethwayt, as having met the provision of Section 38(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act (NHRA), with specific reference to the following recommendations on page 36:

1. In terms of Section 38(8) of the NHRA the Committee supports the proposed rezoning, subdivision and Site Development Plan for the property, and the Drakenstein Agri-Industrial Park Farm 1500,
2. Paarl Design Guidelines: Urban, Architectural & Landscape dated 03 November 2023, all attached as Annexure C to this report, subject to the mitigation measures provided in Section 13 of this HIA.

In addition to the above the Committee requires the use of the tree belts to mitigate the visual impact of industrial development on the transport corridor and its two major roads (N1 and R101) in relation to the greater rural landscape. This landscape plan to be endorse by HWC prior to the submission of final building plans.

The approval contained in this decision / comment is valid for 5 years from the date of this decision. This period may be extended on good reason being shown and at the discretion of HWC, provided that application for extension must be made prior to the effluxion of the 5-year period.

SB

16.2 Farm 1259; Erven 583; 1613; 1751; 1752; 1753, Paternoster Waterfront, Paternoster: NM HM / WEST COAST / SALDANA BAY / PATERNOSTER / FARM 1259; ERVEN 586, 1613, 1751, 1752, 1753

Case No: HWC24050209EJV0516

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Friday, 27 June 2025.

EJV

16.3 N1 Roadway, Worcester: NM HM / CAPE WINELANDS / BREEDE VALLEY / WORCESTER / N1 ROADWAY, MULTIPLE FARMS AND ERVEN

Case No: HWC23110822SB1120

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Details of the proposed road upgrade.
- The appropriate speed to be used to engineer the changes.
- The impact on the rich rural landscape.
- The loss of cross movement along the route due to safety standards.
- The fact that the upgrade of the said portion of route was being proposed with no reference to the next phase of upgrade of the N1 to the north.
- It was noted that the reason for this is that the existing contract was for a specific portion of the upgrade of the N1 as presented to the Committee

INTERIM COMMENT:

The Committee resolved that the HIA does not comply with the provisions of S.38(3). The following information is deemed to be required:

1. The outcome of the public participation for the current EIA process.

2. Further motivation from SANRAL as to why portions of the route cannot be restricted to 100km per hour limitation to achieve a proposed route of less negative impact on the landscape.
3. A Social Historical study as requested in response to the NID.
4. Contextual information locating this project within the proposed wider road upgrades to the North of this section of the N1.

RB

**16.4 Erf 279, Clanwilliam: NM
HM / WEST COAST / CEDERBERG / CLANWILLIAM / ERF 279**

Case No: HWC24051407EJV0618

Emily-Jane Vowles introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Limited information on the property related to earlier settlement.
- Limited information on the earlier connections of the site with its surrounding precincts.

INTERIM COMMENT:

The Committee resolved that the HIA does not satisfy the requirements of Section 38(3) of the NHRA for the following reasons:

1. An assessment of cultural landscape significance has not been adequately addressed.
2. There is no assessment of the status and significance of the remaining built fabric within the Bo Dorp.
3. The relationship of the site to the Bo Dorp and its history, morphology and built form has not been addressed.
4. The formulation of heritage indicators based on the above has not been addressed.
5. The above information must be compiled in a revised integrated HIA that complies with s38(3) and is subject to a further 30-day consultation period with all identified I&APs.

EJV

**16.5 Farm 449 Portions a-RE and 26, Gouritz, Mossel Bay: NM
GARDEN ROUTE / MOSSEL BAY / GOURITZ / FARM 449 PORTIONS 1 REMAINDER AND 26**

Case No: HWC24012310EJV1119

Emily-Jane Vowles introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Open cast mining adjacent to an existing mine, with future rehabilitation.
- No significant heritage resources.
- No objections.

FINAL COMMENT:

The Committee has resolved to endorse the S38(8) Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), titled "Proposed Open Cast Surface Sand Mine on Remaining Extent of Portion 1 of Farm Melkhoutfontein No. 449, Gouritz River, Hesseua Municipality, Riversdale Magisterial District, Western Cape", dated January 2025, and prepared by Jonathan Kaplan of ACRM, as having met the provision of Section 38(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act (NHRA), with specific reference to the recommendations on page 29:

1. No archaeological mitigation is required prior to mining operations commencing.
2. A site inspection of each 1.0ha mining block must be conducted after mining operations have concluded, and before rehabilitation takes place. Cores, and formal tools, including MSA points, backed pieces and scrapers, and ESA bifaces such as handaxes should be collected, analyzed and a report written up and submitted to HWC HOMS.
3. The Environmental Control Officer (ECO) must be briefed by the archaeologist, prior to mining operations commencing and trained in the collection of archaeological resources.
4. Should any unmarked human remains be uncovered during mining operations, all work must immediately cease, and the finds reported to the contracted archaeologist.
5. A protocol for finds of buried fossil bones, the Fossil Finds Procedure (FFP), must be included in the Environmental Management Plan (EMP) for the proposed development. The Fossil Finds Procedure provides guidelines to be followed in the event of fossil bone finds in the excavations.
6. The above recommendation must be incorporated into the Environmental Management Plan for the proposed development and monitored by the ECO

This comment is valid for 5 years from the date of this decision. This period may be extended on good reason being shown and at the discretion of HWC, provided that application for extension must be made prior to the effluxion of the 5-year period.

EJV

17 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

17.1 None

18 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN INTERIM COMMENT

18.1 None

19 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN FINAL COMMENT

19.1 None

20 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

20.1 None

21 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION INTERIM COMMENT

21.1 None

22 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION FINAL COMMENT

22.1 None

23. SECTION 27 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES

23.1 None

24. SECTION 47 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLANS

24.1 None

25. ADVICE

25.1 None

26. SECTION 42 HERITAGE AGREEMENTS

26.1 None

27. OTHER

27.1 None

28. Adoption of decisions and resolutions

The Committee agreed to adopt the decisions and resolutions as recorded above.

29. CLOSURE:

The meeting adjourned at 16:30

30. DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

9 July 2025

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR:

DATE:

SECRETARY:

DATE: