

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Monday, 8 April 2024 at 08:30,
via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport (SB)	(Chairperson)
Ms. Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)	(Specialist Heritage Officer)
Ms. Corne Nortje (CN)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chane Herman (CH)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms Emily Jane Vowles (EJV)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms Chiara Singh (CSI)	(Heritage Officer)

Staff

Ms. Aneeqah Brown (AB)	(Secretariat)
Ms. Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)	(Admin)
Ms. Waseefa Dhansay (WD)	(Assistant Director: Professional Services)

Legal Advisor

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)	(Deputy Director: Legal)
Ms. Naushina Rahim (NR)	(Assistant Director: Legal)

Observers

None

Visitors

Mr Peter Costopoulos – Item 13.9
Mr Trevor Thorold – Item 14.45

3. Apologies

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile (KB) (Heritage Officer)

Absent

None

4. Acceptance of the Code of Conduct

Members and staff raised hands in the MS Teams platform to indicate acceptance of the Code of Conduct.

5. Approval of Agenda

5.1. 8 April 2024. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits.
SJ moves to adopt the agenda and CN seconds.

6. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

6.1 3 April 2024. Held over to 15 April 2024.

7. Disclosure of conflict of interest

None.

8. Confidential matters

None.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Site inspections undertaken

9.1.1 Erven 90088-RE and 90090, 204 Main Road, Kalk Bay (CN)

- Site inspection conducted on 3 April 2024
- Graded PHS
- Stop Works Order issued.
- Site inspection report tabled under item 9.3.1.

9.1.2 Erf RE/634 Palace Barracks, Palace Hill Road, Simonstown (WD)

9.1.3 Erf 3236, 154 Bree Street, Cape Town (SJ)

- Site conducted on 2 April 2024
- Stop works ordered was issued.
- Section 34 application to be submitted and the following conditions, should the application be approved, must be implemented: the work must be monitored suitably by a qualified architect and a close out report must be submitted.

9.2 Proposed Site Inspection

None

9.3 Site Inspection Reports

9.3.1 Erven 90088-RE and 90090, 204 Main Road, Kalk Bay (CN)

- Site inspection conducted on 3 April 2024
- Graded PHS
- Reason for Site Inspection: Heritage Western Cape (HWC) conducted a site visit on Wednesday, 3 April 2024 upon receiving a complaint from a member of the public and photographic evidence of maintenance and repairs to the house has commenced without a permit.
- Findings and Discussion: The HWC official took a walkabout of the site and noted that some cracks in the walls have been repaired with what looks like normal cement, other cracks have been opened and some areas have received new paint (which is also not believed to be the correct paint). The contractors on site stated that they are only appointed to repair the eastern façade of the house. However, it's evident from the photos that more maintenance to the window frames, gutters and internal cracks. Additionally, one of the tenants stated that the ground storey has mold issues internally, which might suggest water ingress.
- Recommendations:
 - The site inspection report to be tabled at HOMS on 8 April 2024.
 - Applicant to submit a S27 Minor Works Application.
 - HOMS to advise on the correct paint and cement for the proposed maintenance and repairs.
- HOMS notes the site inspection report.
- The committee resolved to request that a suitably qualified architect with heritage experience or heritage practitioner undertake the S27 application to be submitted to HWC.

9.3.2 Erf 6127, 35 Marine Drive, Hermanus (CH)

- Site inspection conducted on 1 April 2024
- IIIB outside HPOZ

- Reason for site inspection: to note approved boundary wall capping on Erf 6127, Marine Drive and whether it impacts the stone boundary wall on the adjacent property (Erf 7182, 39 Marine Drive).
- The Committee noted that the work completed on Erf 6127 was actioned in accordance with the HWC approvals date January 2023 and December 2023. The stone boundary walls on Erf 7182 has not been compromised.

9.3.3 Erf 36, 2 Vredehoek Avenue, Oranjezicht (SJ)

- A full set of revised plans with design and heritage indicators that motivate the use of elements and materiality, along with consultation comments to be submitted.

9.4. Preparation for upcoming Committee meetings

9.4.1 Appeals – 9 April

9.4.2 IACom – 17 April

9.5. Tribunal updates (Legal)

9.5.1 24 Bishopslea Road, Claremont (PM)

9.6. Interim and Close out Reports.

9.6.1 Montagu Pass Reports 4, 5, 6 (SJ)

- The contents of the 3 reports were noted by the committee.

9.7. Incomplete Applications

- 14.4
- 14.11
- 14.15
- 14.20
- 14.24
- 14.25
- 14.28
- 14.30
- 14.31
- 14.32
- 14.33
- 14.35
- 14.36
- 14.37
- 14.38
- 14.43
- 14.47
- 14.48
- 14.50

9.8. Archaeological Matters

9.9. Illegal Works Database (Stop works orders)

9.9.1 Erf 3236, 154 Bree Street, Cape Town – 02.04.24 (SJ)

9.9.2 Erven 90088-RE and 90090, 204 Main Road, Kalk Bay (CN)

9.10 Permit deadline

8 April – 13:00

17 April – 09:00

23 April – 13:00

10. Administrative Matters

11. Monitoring by practitioner

12. Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

13 MATTERS ARISING

**13.1 Erf 1805, 143 High Level Road, Green Point, S34- Additions &Alterations
Case No.: HWC24020507CH0226**

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information was received on 12 and 28 March 2024.
- The proposal is for extensions to the rear and new concrete ramp.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- GPRRA supports the proposal.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

**13.2 Erf 4545, 15 &17 Avenue, Mossel Bay, S34-emergency
Case No.: HWC24031103CH0313**

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is to demolish the top section of the spire/tower, down to the roof height of the church.
- The application was submitted as an emergency application due to health and safety concerns as the tower has shown signs of defects, the steel elements have started to rust inside the concrete and as a result thereof the tower is crumbling.
- The structural engineers report states that the weight of the church bell and the weight of the structure itself is contributing to the collapse.
- Various engineers and builders were consulted, and it appears that the tower cannot be repaired and thus the proposal is to demolish the tower.
- Mossel Bay Heritage supports.

- The replacement of the tower will be done over a 5 year period once the required funds are obtained.
- Unknown
- Outside HPO

FURHTER REQUIREMENTS

Clarity on the emergency status and updated images of tower and current conditions. All parties to be invited once information is received.

CH

13.3 Erf 49262, 4 Firdale Road, Newlands, S34- Additions &Alterations Case No.: HWC23101722CN1019

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 26 February and 9 March 2024.
- The proposal is for a garage extension.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- NRA supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

13.4 Erf 8675, 2A Commercial Street, Paarl, S34-Minor Works Case No.: HWC24030503CN03074

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 14, 19 & 29 March 2024.
- The proposal is for internal alterations including demolition of internal walls.
- Ungraded
- Inside HPO
- Drakenstein Mun has no objection.
- DHF has no objection.
- Paarl 300 supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

**13.5 Erf 2412, 199 Upper Buitenkant Street, Vredehoek, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC23100601KB1113**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item on behalf of Ms Khanyisile Bonile.

Mr Peter Costopoulos was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3 April 2024.
- The proposal is for internal alterations and a new mezzanine storey within the existing footprint of the building. Two skylights, a chimney and a door are proposed to the rear.
- Clarity was obtain around the chimney.
- CoCT supports.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CIBRA supports the proposal.
- The Body Corporate supports.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

**13.6 Erf 1617, 6 Wexford Road, Vredehoek, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24013009KB0131**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item on behalf of Ms Khanyisile Bonile.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3 April 2024.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

**13.7 Erf 634, 14 Belmont Avenue, Oranjezicht, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC23110302KB0116**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item on behalf of Ms Khanyisile Bonile.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3 April 2024.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

- CIBRA objects and noted measuring and elevations not accurate.
- The Committee supports the application as the objections raised by CIBRA is not based on heritage grounds.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

13.8 Erf 56105, 10 Zion Road, Claremont, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC24021416SB0215

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29 March
- Proposed additions to existing house, garage and swimming pool. Previous owner changed all doors & windows in addition so change in height and slight widened.
- Graded III B
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CB comments: does support the fenestration as the aluminum impact the resource and recommends wooden.
- Work has not started.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Windows schedule and revised plans to address the concerns of the conservation body.

SB

13.9 Farm 815, Phillipi, S38(4)-NID Case No.: 18023002WD0607M

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 April 2024.
- Proposed fence & security cage-electrical equipment for additional security. Above and below ground borehole chambers
- There has been a number of previous application which have been approved. Each phased work be submitted as NID, previous condition.
- Archaeology: Ephemeral Stone Age shell scatters and site is disturbance hence low archaeological impact.
- Palaeontology: moderate and low - according to SAHRIS. The chambers proposed under this application will be constructed exclusively in disturbed ground because the existing underground chambers and pipelines have already been excavated through the area beneath each proposed aboveground chamber. Therefore, no impacts are expected.
- Visual: There will be some visual impact to historical structures in places but won't be significant. The aboveground chambers might be noticeable and have a visual impact, but they're not considered a big change from similar structures in the area. Despite this, their presence isn't seen as a big issue compared to the benefits of the overall project. The project's goal is to enhance the aquifer's quality, which will have a positive impact in the end.

- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

**13.10 Remainder of Portion 33 and Remainder of Portion 31 of Farm 222,
Farm Haasendal, Kuils River, S38(8)-NID
Case No.: HWC24022919SB0313**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 April 2024.
- Proposed double storey residential development with off street parking and associated infrastructure
- Archaeology: Screening report indicated archaeology as high, however support documentation indicated the site to be previous disturbed by the surrounding development. Unlikely for find significant finds in context. Anticipated impact low.
- Palaeontology: According to paleontologist, the site is covered with white covers and underlain by granite, therefore the anticipated impact as low.
- Visual: low given the proposal.
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

**13.11 Portion 4 of Varsche Rivier 260 material housed at Iziko Musuems, S35- Permit
Case No.: HWC24011101SB0119**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 April 2024.
- Application is for analysis and dating prepared by Teresa Steele, collaborating University of California, Davis: Department of Anthropology institution. The material comes from two sites - Varsche Rivier 001 and 005 which was excavated over two seasons. The application is for destructive analyses for stable isotopes, Sr isotopes and radiocarbon dation of 164 samples of unworked ostrich eggshells and 37 small/medium bovid teeth. The aim of the research is
 1. Firstly, it wants to understand changes in where people gather food during a certain historical period using a method called strontium isotopes.
 2. Secondly, it aims to improve our understanding of the ancient environment by analyzing stable isotopes of carbon, nitrogen, and oxygen.
 3. Lastly, it wants to enhance the accuracy of the timeline of the archaeological site using radiocarbon analysis. Iziko states that the study will not compromise the collection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the Section 35 application.

**13.12 Portion 23 of Farm Nooitgedacht no 74, Koelenhof, Stellenbosch, S38(8)-HIA
Case No.: 22092304NK0923E**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 April 2024.
- Phase 2 and final HIA. No significant archaeological or palaeontological resources have been identified within the area proposed for
- development. The primary heritage significance of this site lies in its contribution to the broader significant cultural.
- landscape of Stellenbosch.
- Since 2007, the area under review has been recognized as suitable for development. This was reiterated in the Stellenbosch Municipality Spatial Development Framework (MSDF) in March 2023. A study in 2018 found the site has low cultural value, which was approved by the Heritage Western Cape (HWC). While the site's heritage significance is limited, it holds some social importance with public access that should be preserved. The development should enhance the site's positive aspects while maintaining its character. Recommendations for incorporating heritage elements into the design are provided.
- A proposed development plan, similar to the Second Layout Alternative, was evaluated in a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) submitted to HWC. An updated plan, the Preferred Layout Alternative, has been adjusted based on heritage considerations. It mostly aligns with the heritage guidelines established in the HIA.
- There are around 10 to 15 mature Eucalyptus trees on the northeastern side of the site near the train station and railway line. Despite being labeled as "invasive aliens," these trees hold cultural significance and should be preserved, with additional planting to reinforce their presence.
- Public road surfaces should preferably use brickwork and laterite surfacing instead of tarmac.
- Since 2007, the area under review has been recognized as suitable for development. This was reiterated in the Stellenbosch Municipality Spatial Development Framework (MSDF) in March 2023. A study in 2018 found the site has low cultural value, which was approved by the Heritage Western Cape (HWC). While the site's heritage significance is limited, it holds some social importance with public access that should be preserved. The development should enhance the site's positive aspects while maintaining its character. Recommendations for incorporating heritage elements into the design are provided.
- A proposed development plan, similar to the Second Layout Alternative, was evaluated in a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) submitted to HWC. An updated plan, the Preferred Layout Alternative, has been adjusted based on heritage considerations. It mostly aligns with the heritage guidelines established in the HIA.
- There are around 10 to 15 mature Eucalyptus trees on the northeastern side of the site near the train station and railway line. Despite being labeled as "invasive aliens," these trees hold cultural significance and should be preserved, with additional planting to reinforce their presence.
- Public road surfaces should preferably use brickwork and laterite surfacing instead of tarmac.
- The use of tall and solid boundary walls, precast concrete fencing, exposed blockwork, and face-brick walling should be avoided. Instead, historic features like fences and hedges should be prioritized whenever feasible. Buildings in the proposed development should have boundary walls no taller than 1.2 meters for the solid part, but they can incorporate visually transparent fencing above this height.

- Roof pitches should generally range between 40 and 42 degrees, except for lean-to roofs. New buildings are recommended to have double pitched roofs with end gables.
- SIG supports on condition limitation of light population and height restriction - response to comment. Municipality did not comment with 30 days.

HELD OVER:

Referred to IACom on 17 April 2024.

SB

**13.13 Erf 754, 8 Cheviot Place, Green Point, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC23061909SB0826**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

Mr Stuart was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 April 2024
- Work start as per previous approval.
- CoCT conditional approves - "All these elements contribute to the significance of the property and should remain intact. The removal of the timber floors and ceilings are a great concern. Although the plans suggest that these will be retained, they will need to be removed with the utmost care and will need to be skillfully reinstated."
- GPRRA supports the proposal.
- Given the engineering expertise requirements, the committee is circulating the application to BELCom for the engineering and built environment expertise.
- New plans to be obtained and circulated to all I&APs before the BELCom committee meeting.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 24 April 2024.

SB

**13.14 Erf 172302, 18 Beach Road, Muizenberg, S34 – Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24031416SB0319**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 April 2024.
- Proposed new external roof.
- Minor works application
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SB

**13.15 Farm 237, Old cemetery in De Heer-se-Bos, Vogelstruistraat, Elim, S27-Addition
Case No.: HWC24040304SB0326**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 April 2024
- Proposed memorial wall at the cemetery.
- There are three proposal, neither will have a negative impact on the cemetery of graves.
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SB

**13.16 Portion 11 of Farm 1277, Malmesbury, S38(8)-NID
Case No.: HWC24022307SB0229**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 April 2024.
- Proposed 25m high mast and associated infrastructure
- No anticipated impact heritage resources.
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- Since there is no reason to believe that reason will be impact.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

**13.17 Erf 36, 2 Vredehoek Avenue, Oranjezicht, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC23032211RG0404**

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 22 February 2024.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- Work has started.
- Work undertaken spiral staircase and roof terrace were undertaken by previous owners (c. 2009).
- Proposed work: New garage door with plaster band on facade of house, addition to rear of roof.
- CoCT EHM: supports the proposal.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.

COMMENT

A full set of revised plans with design and heritage indicators that motivate the use of elements and materiality, along with consultation comments to be submitted.

SJ

**13.18 Erf 864, Unit 1, Mimosa Court, 277 Beach Road, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC23112804SJ1129**

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 April 2024.
- Work has been completed.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Balcony enclosure in frameless glass; removal of the existing windows and doors between lounge and dining room; internal reconfigurations.
- CoCT EHM: support
- SFA: no response
- SFB: no comment as work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

**13.19 Erf 96826, 121 Campground/Palmyra Road, Newlands, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24011809SJ0220**

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 2 April 2024.
- Work has not started.
- Proposal is for conversion of existing garage to carport and internal alterations and reconfiguration of bathrooms.
- CoCT EHM: support
- GLCA: no objection

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

**13.20 Erf 11238, 99 Berg River Street, Paarl, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC23083109CSI03012**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 December 2023.
- work applied for has not started and is a deviation from work previously applied for
- The building is not graded and not located within an HPO
- The applicant has motivated for the roof structure to be larger and for a new fire escape door which was requested by the Drakenstein Municipality.
- Comment has been provided by the Drakenstein Municipality, The Drakenstein Heritage Foundation, and the Paarl 300 Foundation and all support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

14. NEW MATTERS

**14.1 Erf 166 & 167, 19 Central Close, Pinelands, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24032533CH0326**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape photographs required.

CH

**14.2 Erf 2383, 3 Kleineweide Street, Stellenbosch, S34-Total Demolition
Case No.: HWC24032505CH0326**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape photographs, SG diagram, Stellenbosch Municipality comment and proof of correspondence sent to SHF.

CH

**14.3 Erf 34186, 11 Bolton Road, Gleemoor, Athlone, S34-deviations
Case No.: HWC24032614CH0327**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape photographs required.

CH

**14.4 Erf 34682, 18 Belmont Road, Rondebosch, S34-Additions
Case No.: HWC24032801CH0403**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Application form, internal photographs, streetscape photographs.

CH

14.5 Erf 576, Castle Rock House, 83 Main Road, Simons Town, S38(4)-NID
Case No.: HWC24022613CH0326

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is to construct a new single residential dwelling.
- Property is approximately 6 933sqm in extent.
- The current land use is agriculture and surrounding land uses are residential.
- Palaeo: within a low and insignificant area
- The visual impact will be low given the scale of the proposed new dwelling.
- The linear orientation aids in screening the building from the Main Road.
- The impacts to archeology are believed to be low.
- From an architectural perspective, the dwelling will be light weight and has been designed to consider the natural character and landscape.
- No heritage resources have been identified that could be impacted upon by the proposed work
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Applicant recommends no further studies.
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Chance finds procedure to be included.

CH

14.6 Erf 885, 66 Main Road, Sea Point West, S34- Additions &Alterations
Case No.: HWC24031808CH0326

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Application submitted for partial demolition, additions and alterations.
- The proposal is for an addition of a six-storey residential building above the existing IIIIB building.
- The original colonade and commercial use at the ground level will remain. The residential component will be set back from the existing parapet.
- Graded IIIIB
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- SFA did not comment within 30 days.
- SFB did not comment within 30 days.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

14.7 Erf 95, 43 Huguenot Street, Franschhoek, S34- Additions &Alterations
Case No.: HWC24032611CH0326

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is to construct a new street boundary wall and carport to the second dwelling. The street boundary wall comprises of masonry capped piers with plinth lines and moldings, and infill vertical steel palisades.
- The overall height is 1,2m to 1,4m.
- Work is complete.
- The Franschhoek Heritage & Ratepayers Association supports.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

14.8 Erf 1184, 99 Beach Road, Strand, S34-Deviation
Case No.: HWC24031816CN0325

CH

APPLICATION INCOMPLETE:

Title Deed, POA, Company Resolution and SG diagram

14.9 Erf 1652, 50 van der Stel, Stellenbosch, S34-Total Demolition
Case No.: HWC24031201CN0325

CN

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for the total demolition of the dwelling house and outbuildings for the new owner to build a new house.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Stellenbosch Municipality supports.
- SIG supports in principle and notes that the trees on the property and on the pavement are noted as having landscape significance.
- SHF did not provide comment in 30 days.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

CN

14.10 Erf 178630, 62 Hood Road, Penlyn Estate, S34-Total Demolition
Case No.: HWC24031805CN0325

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for demolition of all structures on site.
- CoCT did not comment in 30 days. CoCT supported the total demolition on the property in 2016.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

CN

14.11 Erf 17973, 82 Beach Road, Strand, S34-Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24021506CN0325

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for internal reconfiguration and upgrades to the Spur restaurant.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.12 Erf 223, 4 Weir Road, Milnerton, S34-TD Permit Extension
Case No.: HWC24032001CN0325

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Previous permit dated 24 June 2021
- The proposal is for the total demolition of the buildings on site to construct a block of flats.
- The City and FoBCA did not support the previous application for total demolition. Consequently, BELCOM approved the TD without conditions.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the permit extension.

CN

14.13	Erf 3127, 10 La Provence Crescent, Pinelands, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC24020512CN0325	
	INCOMPLETE APPLICATION: Company Resolution, CoCT comment, internal and streetscape photos.	CN
14.14	Erf 885, 66 Main Road, Sea Point, S34-Additions, Alterations & Partial Demolition Case No.: HWC24031808CN0325	
	Duplicate item referred to item 14.6	CN
14.15	Erf 9913, 29 Ninth Avenue, Fish Hoek, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC24022806CN0325	
	INCOMPLETE APPLICATION: Streetscape photos	CN
14.16	Erf 1143, 9 Rosemead Avenue, Oranjezicht, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC24022006CSI0328	
	INCOMPLETE APPLICATION: Streetscape mages required (Not Google)	CSI
14.17	Erf 121795, 34 14th Avenue, Windemere, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC24022311CSI0328	
	Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.	
	DISCUSSION	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Work applied for has not started. • Building is not graded and not within an HPO • Proposed changes are adding another story to the existing dwelling. • CoCT requested a number of changes to the plans which were complied with. • The site is ungraded • Outside HPO 	
	DECISION	
	The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.	CSI
14.18	Erf 13000, 142 Douglas Place, Woodstock, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No.: HWC24032605CSI0328	
	INCOMPLETE APPLICATION: External and streetscape images required.	CSI

14.19 Erf 323, 59 Loader Street, Greenpoint, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24032703CSI0328

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- S34 A&A, work applied for has not started.
- Building is graded IIIC and within an HPO
- Proposed additions are two floors to the current dwelling and alterations to the ground floor/first story of the dwelling.
- Comment has been provided by City of Cape Town and De Waterkant Civic Association who support the application.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

14.20 Erf 3368, 17 Haarlem Street, Ruyterwacht, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC21081007CSI0328

CSI

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form required, all photographs required.

14.21 Farm 445, Rogland, Riversdale, 38(8)-NID
Case No.: HWC24032702CSI0328

CSI

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- S38(8) NID application for a proposed 5-hectare open cast sand mine
- There are no significant impacts anticipated for any archaeological, paleo, or historical materials.
- There were two AIAs previously conducted in 1996 and 2007 in areas nearby the proposed development but these sites are 10km and 25km away and will not be impacted. A heritage survey was conducted in 2018 in an area approximately 15km from the proposed development and this site will not be impacted either.
- The paleo sensitivity is low according to the SAHRIS paleo sensitivity map
- There are no visible historical landmarks or sites of archaeological importance according to the heritage screener conducted by CTS heritage.
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Chance finds procedure to be included.

CSI

14.22 **Portion 0,1, 2 of Farm Vergelegen 737, Portion 0,2,3,4 of Farm Vergelegen 741, Portion 0,2 of Farm Vergelegen 744, Somerset West, S38(8)-NID**
Case No.: HWC24031910CSI0328

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- S38(8) NID application for the repairs along the Lourens River to prevent further infrastructure damage to Farm Vergelegen.
- The proposed repairs include: Construction of a new weir within a watercourse, development of Groyne Structures on each of the four eroded sites as part of river repair work, alien vegetation be removed from the river in the vicinity of the work and rehabilitation of the riverbank with indigenous wetland vegetation.
- There have been several heritage studies and AIAs conducted along the river at various sites according to the heritage screener provided by CTS heritage.
- The paleo sensitivity is low to moderate according to the SAHRIS paleo sensitivity map.
- Overall, there are no significant impacts anticipated for any archaeological or paleo resources.
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Chance finds procedure to be included.

CSI

14.23 **Remainder of the Farm Woodville 172/17 Seven Passes Road, George, S38(8)-NID**
Case No.: HWC24031904CSI0328

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- S38(8) NID application for an expansion of an existing runway and the construction of 5 new hangers.
- There are no known archaeological, paleo, or historical resources besides a historic coach house which is in ruins just outside of the farm boundary according to the heritage report provided by Perception Planning.
- There are no evident archaeological resources present according to fieldwork conducted on the 12th of March according to the report.
- The paleo sensitivity is insignificant according to the SAHRIS paleo sensitivity map.
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

CSI

14.24 **Erf 4143, 4 David Baird Crescent, Ruyterwacht, S34 - Additions**
Case No.: HWC24080108EJV0326

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

HWC requests local authority/municipality comment.

EJV

14.25 Erf 52943, 17 Crescent Road, Claremont, S34 - Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24022603EJV0326

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

HWC requests the correct application form specifically in reference to the proposed works being outside of the scope of Minor Works. HWC also requests SG Diagrams and local authority/municipality comments.

EJV

14.26 Erf 57603, 23 Budock Road, Claremont, S34 - Additions
Case No.: HWC24031814EJV0326

Ms Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Conversion of existing roof space into an additional bedroom with a new dormer window. Relocation of an existing flue pipe, reduction of a ground storey window and removal of a ground storey door.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

14.27 Erf 57899, 22 Devon Street, Claremont, S34 - Alterations
Case No.: HWC24031903EJV0328

Ms Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposed works include removing the existing street-facing wooden-framed windows and sash as they are damaged beyond repair and replacing them with matte white extruded aluminium sash windows. The new window openings will be enlarged to improve light and ventilation. This new window size is aligned with the neighbouring property and the character of the street.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

14.28 Erven 62856, 62857, 61690, 61691, 4 Tanel Road and 20 Induland Avenue, Lansdowne, S38(4) - NID
Case No.: HWC24032618EJV0328

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

HWC requests a screening tool, information pertaining to the heritage of the site, and annotated photograph.

EJV

**14.29 Farm 276, Portion 17, Farm Trikores, Tygervalley Road, Durbanville, S38(4) - NID
Case No.: HWC24030519EJV0327**

Ms Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- This application triggers 38(1)(a), 38(1)(c)(i), and 38(1)(d) as it involves the construction of a brick and column boundary wall with clearvu panels around the property to replace the existing damaged barbed wire and timber pole fence.
- The property is currently zoned as agricultural but is designated as a New Development Area as of March 2021. The property owner previously applied for mixed-use development (HWC19050708) in 2019 and as a result the property is currently undergoing a HIA.
- The archaeological walkover survey of the property in 2018 by ACRM revealed a small number of ESA quartzite tools, while the identification of structures, settlements, landscapes, and palaeontological resources revealed nothing of cultural significance.
- The heritage consultant concludes that no further studies should be required.
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

EJV

**14.30 Portion 23 of Farm No 499, Farm Modder Rivier, Worcester, S38(8) - NID
Case No.: HWC24031409EJV0328**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

HWC requests a company or trust resolution.

EJV

**14.31 Erf 1122, 12 Wisbeach Road, Sea Point, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24031920KB0325**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

new application form, Contextual photographs, and Locality plan and POA is required.

KB

**14.32 Erf 157830, 191 Main Road, Kalk Bay, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24022711KB0325**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

POP required.

KB

14.33 Erf 66211, 4 De Villiers Road, Wynberg, S34-Additions & Alterations-Minor Works
Case No.: HWC24020519KB0325

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape, motivation.

KB

14.34 Erf 8717, 19 Olyven Street, Paarl, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC 24030702KB0307

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item on behalf of Ms Khanyisile Bonile.

DISCUSSION

- Work has not started, proposal is for addition of a double garage and internal alteration which include new kitchen, dining room and bedroom in the existing loft.
- Located outside special character and it is not graded.
- Drakenstein municipality, Paarl 300 and DHF support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

14.35 Erf 8735, 236 Main Road, Paarl, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24032612KB0326

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form, more contextual photos, Paarl 300 and DHF comment required.

KB

14.36 Erf 173920, 99 Rodger Street, Woodstock, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24030515KB0305

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape photographs, motivation and POA required.

KB

14.37 Portion 26 of the farm Rietvalley, no 76 Middelplass, De Rust, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No.: HWC24032509KB0305

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

The comments from de rust heritage conservation association and Simon van der steel foundation south cape comments required.

KB

14.38 Erf 809, 89 Baron van Rheede Street, Oudtshoorn, S34- Additions &Alterations
Case No.: HWC24022702SB0301

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed converting portion into restaurant, storage and co-room. Requires that 2 windows be removed and replaced with doors.
- Mun comments: Support
- CB comments supports the proposal.
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SB

14.39 Erf 95451, 72 Barnet Street, Gardens, S34-MW
Case No.: HWC24021505SB0301

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed demolition of existing stairs, new stairs built in new locations and drywall on the first floor.
- CoCT Support
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SB

14.40 Fisheries Factory Midden Housed material housed at Iziko Museum, S35-Permit
Case No.: HWC24022905SB0301

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- In 1975, the Fish Factory Midden site was excavated and findings were reported two years later by Robertshaw (1977).
- This site, situated near the Paternoster fisheries factory, was one of two sites mentioned in publications, although many other Paternoster shell middens have been sampled through Cultural Resource Management projects without being radiocarbon dated. Excavations at the Fish Factory Midden uncovered six squares until reaching sterile sands below.
- Shell lenses were grouped into six layers, with conventional radiocarbon dates obtained for four layers, but with an inverted date for Layer 6. Various cultural remains such as stone artifacts, indigenous ceramics, and ostrich eggshell beads, as well as vertebrate remains from over a

dozen species and Cape rock lobster calcareous mandibles, were recovered.

- Additionally, several marine shell samples were set aside for further analysis. Robertshaw's report in 1977 documented these excavations. Site was first excavated in 1975 and only trace remain today however excavated material housed at Iziko as sample of the midden.
- Propose destruction analysis of organic material with radiocarbon date in order to understand chronological sequence of the stratigraphic layers.
- Although previous radiocarbon dates were obtained, these are problematic in layer 6. Further layer 2 and 4 have no date. This application is to obtain a date for layer 2-4 and re-date layer 6. Radiocarbon dating will be done locally at iThemba labs in Joburg.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Images of the sample material, the percentage that will be destroyed as result of the radiocarbon dating. Further, the totality percentage sample size vs the collection. Detail methodology on how the samples will the taken.

SB

**14.41 Portion 11 of Farm 221, off Botfontein Road, Kraaifontein, S38(8)-NID
Case No.: HWC24022909SB0301**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Developed unauthorised storage facility - S24G NEMA application.
- Palaeontology: low - according to SAHRIS
- Visual: Site is within 3C Cultural landscape
- Further, there is an HIA underway for the Botfontein East Mix used development but there is a lack of heritage resource on site.
- Consultant recommends no further studies
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resource will be impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

**14.42 Portion 6 of Farm Harkeville No 423, Knysna, S38(4)-NID
Case No.: HWC24022601SB0301**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

The application form to be signed by property owner, Title deed, POA, SG and site photos required

SB

**14.43 Erf 17314-RE, Clock Tower Precinct, V&A Waterfront, S38(4)-NID
Case No.: HWC24031810SJ0327**

HELD OVER:

Heritage Officer to obtain the drawings and matter to be tabled once drawings and relevant annexures received.

SJ

14.44 Erf 2639, Oude Molen, Off Alexander Road, Pinelands, S34 & S35 - Permit Case No.: HWC24032535SJ0326

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Mr Trevor Thorold was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Proposal is for comprehensive refurbishment of the homestead to make building habitable and compliant with regulations. A new fire escape and minor alterations will be undertaken as well as the reconstruction of the west wall that collapsed in September 2016. The western wall includes 4 sash windows in keeping with the Georgian architectural language.
- Excavations to be overseen by TerraMare Archaeology due to high archaeological sensitivity.
- Site is worthy of Grade 2.
- CoCT EHM: conditional support (4 conditions)
- VASSA: supported
- CiFA: supported with comments -

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Please obtain a second reference number and payment for the S35 application.
2. Repository agreement and visual diagram of where archaeological monitoring will take place.
3. Appointment letters and CVs for the monitoring architect and archaeologist.
4. A conservation methodology practice and specifications document to supplement the documentation.

SJ

14.45 Farm 956, Historic Werf, Soetmelksvlei (Donkerhoek), Klapmuts Road, Simondium, S38(4)-NID Case No.: HWC24032513SJ0327

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- A water mill has been constructed on the historic Soetmelksvlei/Donkerhoek werf without formal heritage authorization as it was believed to be part of the HWC 2021 approval.
- The water mill does not negatively impact the living museum.
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resource impacted,

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SJ

14.46 Vergenoegd Low Estate, 1 Vergenoegd Road, Faure, Somerset West: S34-Minor Works: Deviation Case No.: TBC

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

New reference number and POP to be obtained.

SJ

14.47 Vergenoegd Low Estate, 1 Vergenoegd Road, Faure, Somerset West: S27-Minor Works: Deviation Case No.: TBC

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

New reference number and POP to be obtained.

SJ

14.48 Erf 2049, 16 Bridle Road, Oranjezicht, S34- Total Demolition Case No.: HWC23101907SJ0328

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Proposal is for the total demolition of the existing structure.
- Site is surrounded by Table Mountain PHS.
- Architecture is not significant or noteworthy. C. 1945.
- CoCT EHM: support.
- CIBRA: requested replacement structure, no reference to comment without replacement structure.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

SJ

14.49 Erf 3223, 2 Juffernbrunch Street, Stellenbosch, S34- Total Demolition Case No.: HWC24032617SJ0328

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for demolition of remaining boundary wall. Construction of new boundary wall and new structure (24 units, student housing).
- The work has not started.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Consultation comments and clarification regarding the original structure on site.

SJ

14.50 Erven 2433 & 9419, Iziko Old Town House, 149 Longmarket Street, IOTH Gas Suppression upgrade Case No.: HWC24031508SJ0402

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for new gas suppression system.
- Monitoring documents have been supplied.
- The work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

The gas suppression system must be included in the close-out report for the Iziko Old Town House, application HWC23120606SJ1206.

SJ

15. Other Matters

16. Adoption of Resolutions and Decisions

CH moves to adopt and CN seconds the adoption of resolutions and decisions.

17. Closure: 11:40

18. Date of Next Meeting

15 April 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR: _____

SECRETARY: _____

Annexure A – HWC Heritage Officer Meetings

Abbreviations

APHP - Association of Professional Heritage Practitioners
AHP - Agulhas Heritage Society
BKCA -Bo-Kaap Civic Association
BKYM - Bo-Kaap Youth Movement
CIBRA - City Bowl Ratepayers '& Residents Association
CoCT – City of Cape Town
CTHT – Cape Town Heritage Trust
CRM - Cultural Resources Management
DRHCA - De Rust Heritage Conservation Association
Docomomo South Africa
DHS -Durbanville Heritage Society
EHM – Environmental Heritage Management department
FoBCA- Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area
FE - Friends of Elim
GLCA- Greater Lynfrae Civic Association
GPRRA - Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association
HVA- Harfield Village Association

ASAPA - Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists
ABHC - Associated Bibbeys Hoek Conservancy (Knysna)
BELCOM - Built Environment and Landscapes Committee
CBCRA -Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association
CSDBOA - Clifton-On-Sea & District Bungalow Owners Association
CTHF - Cape Town Heritage Foundation
CRRA - Constantia Ratepayers & Residents Associations
CMP – Conservation Management Plan
DWCA - De Waterkant Civic Association
DHF - Drakenstein of Heritage Foundation
EMPr - Environmental Management Program
FHRA -Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayer Association
FoCVGB - Friends of Constantia Valley Green Belts
GBRM - Great Brak River Museum
GVHAG- Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group
GCS - Greyton Conservation Society
HRF - Heldeberg Renaissance Foundation

HMB - Heritage Mossel Bay
HVTA - Hex Valley Tourism Association
HBRRA - Hout Bay & Ratepayers and Residents Association
HIA - Heritage Impact Assessment
ILASA - Institute for Landscape Architecture in South Africa
KBHA - Kalk Bay Historical Association
KBSJRR - Kalk bay-St James Ratepayers & Residents Association
LKID - Lower Kenilworth Improvement District
MHCS - Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society
NCW – Not Conservation Worthy
NEMA - National Environmental Management Act (No. 107 of 1998)
NID - Notification of Intent to Develop
NCOA - Noetzie Conservancy Owners Association
OH - Oudtshoorn Heritage
Paarl300 Foundation
PRRA - Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association
PACF - Prince Albert Cultural Foundation
SAHRA - South African Heritage Resources Agency
SRHS - Salt River Heritage Society
SFB - Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association
SvdSF - Simon van der Stel Foundation Cape Town
STHS - Simon's Town Historical Society
SHF - Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation
SHCT - Stillbaai Heritage Conservation Trust
GHT - George Heritage Trust
RVRA- Rustenburg Valley Residents Association
TRHCS - Touws River Heritage and Conservation Society
VASSA - Vernaclar Architecture Society of South Africa
WUECAG - Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group
WCAC - West Coast Aboriginal Council
WAAC - Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee
WHCS - Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society
WRRRA - Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association

HOMs - Heritage Officers Meeting
HPO – Heritage protects overlay

HWC – Heritage Western Cape
IACom - Impact Assessment Committee
IGIC - Inventories, Gradings and Interpretations Committee
KHS - Kommetjie Heritage Society
MGHS - McGregor Heritage Society
NHC - Napier Heritage & Conservation
NASDB - Nelspoort Agency of Sustainable Development body
NHRA - National Heritage Resources Act (No. 25) of 1999
NRA - Newlands Residents Association
OCA - Observatory Civic Association
OHAC - Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee
PPP - Public Participation Process
PHCT - Pniel Heritage and Cultural Trust
RMCA - Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee
SAHRIS - South African Heritage Resources Information System
SPFA - Sea Point for All Group

SHC - Stanford Conservation Trust & Stanford Heritage Committee
SIG - Stellenbosch Interest Group
SHA - Swellendam Heritage Association
OWVS - Old Wynberg Village Society
TVHF - Tulbagh Valley Heritage Foundation
UCRRA- Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association
WERRA - Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association
 Ward 2 Forum
WCC- Whale Coast Conservation
WRA - Woodstock Residents Association
WECA - Wynberg East Civic Association