

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Monday, 5 February 2024 at 08:30,
via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport	(Chairperson)
Ms. Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)	(Specialist Heritage Officer)
Ms. Corne Nortje (CN)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Khanyisile Bonile (KB)	(Heritage Officer)

Staff

Ms. Aneeqah Brown (AB)	(Secretariat)
Mr. Reagon Fortune (RF)	(Admin)

Legal Advisor

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)	(Deputy Director: Legal)
Ms. Naushina Rahim (NR)	(Assistant Director: Legal)

Observers

None

Visitors

Mr. Faizal Sayed
Sheikh Riad Fataar
Ms Susan Brice
Mr Ashley Warren
Mr Clive Theunissen

3. Apologies

3.1. Absent

None.

4. Acceptance of the Code of Conduct

Members and staff raised hands in the MS Teams platform to indicate acceptance of the Code of Conduct.

5. Approval of Agenda

- 5.1.** 5 February 2024. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits.
SJ moves to adopt the agenda and CN seconds.

6. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

- 6.1** 25 January 2024. CN and KB
6.2 29 January 2024. CN and KB

7. Disclosure of conflict of interest

None.

8. Confidential matters

None.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Site inspections undertaken

9.2 Proposed Site Inspection

9.3 Site Inspection Reports

9.4. Preparation for upcoming Committee meetings

9.4.1 Appeals

9.5. Tribunal updates (Legal)

9.6. Interim and Close out Reports

9.6.1. Iziko Bertram House: Close Out Report (SJ)

- The Committee resolved to endorse the close-out report.

9.6.2. Iziko Bo-Kaap Museum: Close Out Report (SJ)

- The Committee resolved to endorse the close-out report.

9.6.3. Iziko Koopmans De Wet House: Close Out Report (SJ)

- The Committee resolved to endorse the close-out report.

9.6.4. Iziko National Museum: Close Out Report (SJ)

- The Committee resolved to endorse the close-out report.

9.6.5. Iziko Rust & Vreugd: Close Out Report (SJ)

- The Committee resolved to endorse the close-out report.

9.7. Incomplete Applications

Incomplete applications are noted under items.

9.8. Archaeological Matters

9.8.1 Middledorp Housing development on farm paternoster no. 34, and portion 2 of farm paternoster no. 34, St Augustine Road, paternoster (SB)

Case No: 14082203AS0827E

The Committee resolved to endorse the report by prepared by ACRM dated December 2023 and the recommendations on page 15:

1. Construction Phase excavations and bulk earthworks for services (including new roads, stormwater, sewerage, electricity, etc) in the Paternoster CBA area must be monitored by a professional archaeologist. Test excavations conducted in the open space area alongside St Augustine road have shown that this area is an sensitive, vulnerable and threatened archaeological landscape (Kaplan 2016, 2024 in prep).

2. The letter appointing the Archaeologist must be submitted to HWC before commencing any subsurface work.
3. KML Data or geographic data should be forwarded to HWC for future records

9.9. Illegal Works Database (Stop works orders)

- 9.9.1 Erf 754-Re, 8 Cheviot Place, Green Point (SB)
9.9.2 Portion 59 of 484/14 Port Beaufort (SB)

10. Administrative Matters

- 10.1 Erf. 16109, Corner of Camp and Manitoa Streets, Saldanha Bay. (Commonly known as "Vingerhoedhuis")

- The Committee resolved to endorse the drawings: 11792, 11793/2020 prepared by L2 Architectural Draughting Consultants (PTY) LTD dated January 2024 as meeting the required of the tribunal ruling dated 18 January 2024

11. Monitoring by a practitioner

None

12. Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

13 MATTERS ARISING

- 13.1 **Erf 4438, 2 Cheve Street, Paarl, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC23120102CH1214

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item on behalf of CH.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29 January 2024
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Paarl300 supports the proposal
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the proposal
- DHF supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

- 13.2 **Erf 870, 3 Antrim Road, Greenpoint, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC24012602CH0116

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape images required.

13.3 Erf 55585, 26 Draper Street, Claremont, S35-Test pit report
Case No: HWC23101716SB1017

Ms Stephanie Barnardt- Delpont introduced the item.

Mr. Faizal Sayed, Sheikh Riad Fataar and Ms Susan Brice were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29 January 2024.
- The site had been approved for development and obtained permission for CoCT (did not trigger NHRA at the time). After careful consideration, and an objection from the public, it was noted that there is a historical burial ground on site.
- Conditions: HWC to be informed immediately if any archaeological material is uncovered, including human remains. Additional information received on the 9 Nov.
- The development work on Erf 55585 at 26 Draper Street in Claremont was stopped by Heritage Western Cape in November 2022 due to concerns raised by a member of the public, suggesting the site might be a historical burial ground. TerraMare Archaeology was appointed to conduct test excavations to determine if evidence of human burials or remains exists.
- Two trenches were dug on the site in December 2023, but no concrete evidence of human remains was found. Artefacts, including fragments of a gravestone, were discovered, but they were not associated with identifiable graves. The presence of former grave shafts was noted, but they lacked evidence of human remains. The artifacts found in the fill suggested that if graves once existed, they may have been removed in the past.
- It is unlikely that there are human remains or graves on Erf 55585. The recommendation is to lift the stop works order on the site."

DECISION

The Committee resolved to endorse the report and the findings prepared by TerraMare Archaeology dated 29 January 2024.

1. Archaeologist to be appointed, letter to be submitted to HWC prior to subsurface work.
2. Archaeologist to monitor any sub surface work prior to development.

Stop works order to be lifted

SB

13.4 Erf 750, 5 De Mond Close, S35 – Emergency
Case No: HWC23121210SB0124

Ms Stephanie Barnardt- Delpont introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The application is for the exhumation and recovery of human remains that were exposed during a housing development.
Background:
- During the excavation of foundation trenches for a new house at Mr. Wynand Lategan's property (Erf 750, De Mond Close 5, Elands Bay), the Contractor Hannes Stemmet of Cascor Projects Construction accidentally discovered a human skeleton about 1 meter below the surface. The site is situated on flat terrain near Verlorenvlei mouth, close to the Sishen railway line, and within 400 meters of the rocky shore.

- The remains were found in what seemed to be an erosion channel turned into a grave, complete with a retaining wall and rough clasts covering. Shell midden material was also observed in the trench floor. Work was immediately halted, the area cordoned off, and protection measures put in place. Some bones were displaced in the foundation trench, and it's possible that more remains are in the undisturbed section.
- The South African Police Service (SAPS) was notified, and although no crime was suspected, the cranium was recovered by HWC and placed into temporary storage at Iziko.

Proposed action:

- These remains are considered culturally and scientifically valuable, potentially shedding light on the ancient Khoisan inhabitants of the area. Scientific analyses, such as radiocarbon dating, isotopic analysis for diet, and ancient DNA studies, may provide valuable information.
- To proceed with these analyses, the responsible authorities need to grant a permit. The plan is to carefully remove and document the disturbed remains, conduct further examinations of the excavation area, and transport the remains to a designated repository. The hope is that these analyses will contribute to our understanding of the history and heritage of South Africa's early inhabitants.
- The West Coast region, where these remains were found, has a rich archaeological heritage dating back at least 1 million years. The coastal areas, in particular, have provided insights into the lifeways of Khoisan people. The document emphasizes the importance of preserving and studying these archaeological sites, considering the rich history and heritage they represent.
- The proposed actions align with established protocols and regulations aimed at protecting South Africa's heritage. The document also highlights the significance of ongoing archaeological research in providing insights into the cultural, social, and biological aspects of South Africa's early inhabitants, specifically the Khoisan people. The involvement of the Guriqua/Xam community is acknowledged, and their comments on the matter are awaited.
- Reburial plan: page 23
- Consultation: The archaeologist has attempted in contacting the Paramount Chief has not received further response.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to endorse the application and the reburial plan on condition;

1. The parties enter into heritage agreement after the exhumation and failure to enter this agreement within 3 months. HWC will enforce a stop works order as condition of the permit not fulfilled.
2. Human remains to be reburial within one calendar year from exhumation.

Any additional studies conduct on the human remains, need to be done with separated section 36 application once human remains are in safe temporary storage.

SB

13.5 Sarpen Energy security centre PV plant development on Erf RE 713, Paarl, S38(8)-NID Case No: HWC23121307SB1213

Ms Stephanie Barnardt- Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29 January 2024.
- Archaeology: low according to the screener
- Palaeontology: low with patches of moderate sensitivity
- Visual: low as there is small-scale development surrounding the site
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Chance finds procedure to be included.

SB

13.6 Farm 168, 17 Middle Street, Wupperthal: S31-Additions & Alterations Case No: 21062302MS0706

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Drawings are to be checked as meeting BELCom requirements of 09 November 2023.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as meeting BELCom requirements, on condition that;

1. Lime wash is to be used on all heritage fabric.

SJ

13.7 Erf 35508, Bergenhof Estate, Carolina Road, Paarl: S38(8)-NID Case No: HWC23022007SJ0306

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Completed NID form.

SJ

13.8 Erven 88332, 88323, 88324 & 88325, Rodwell House, 4 Mosselle Road, St James: S34-Alteration Case No: HWC23112205SJ1208

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29 January 2024
- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO
- KBRRA supports the proposal
- CoCT supports the proposal
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

13.9 Erf 166500, 236 Lower Main Road, Observatory: S34-Minor Works for Internal Alterations
Case No: HWC24011107SJ0111

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 26 January 2024
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.10 Erf 65238-RE, 109 Rosemead Avenue, Kenilworth: S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24010814SJ0109

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 26 January 2024.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

13.11 Erf 1692, 11 Clovelly Avenue, Vredehoek: S34-Minor Works for Internal Alterations
Case No: HWC24012203SJ0122

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29 January 2024
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.12 Erf 369, 15 Rochester Road, Bantry Bay: S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC23102515SJ0119

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29 & 30 January 2024
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- SFA supports the demolition
- SFB supports the demolition
- CoCT supports the demolition

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

SJ

13.13 Erf 449, 18 Dixon Street, Cape Town: S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24080109SJ0116

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29 January 2024
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- DWCA did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.14 Erf 36, 2 Vredehoek Avenue, Oranjezicht: S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23032211RG0404

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 05 February 2024.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection.

13.15 Erf 45232, 9 Silwood Road, Rondebosch: S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23120801SJ1208

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 30 January 2024.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT does not support the proposal.
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

13.16 Erf 4507, Nedbank (Mutual Life Insurance), 85 St George's Street Corner Longmarket Street; Erf 4508, FNB (Bank of Africa) Building, 81 Shortmarket Street Corner St George's Street; Erf 4509, FNB (Barclays) Building, 82 Adderley Street Corner Shortmarket Street, Cape Town: S38(4)-NID for Proposed Redevelopment
Case No: HWC24010803SJ0108

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 31 January 2024
- Graded IIIA (all 3 sites)
- Inside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following specialist studies;

1. Architectural emphasis (fabric analysis, historical analysis);
2. VIA on townscape context at varying scales with a focus on the ground level interface.

SJ

13.17 Erf 89805, 7 Duignam Road, Kalk Bay: S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24012604SJ

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO

DECISION

The Committee supports deviations to the replacement structure with previous conditions as per BELCom permit implemented:

1. Existing stonework is expertly incorporated into the new plinth.
2. Should the site not be developed in accordance with the approved plans within 3 years of the granting of the demolition permit, any proposed development thereafter must be resubmitted to HWC for approval.

SJ

13.18 Erf 403, 2 The Grange Ave, Camps Bay, S34- Total Demolition
Case No: HWC23111311KB1120

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Company resolution required.

KB

13.19 Erf 1863, 29 3rd Street, Eastern Ext, George Township: S38-NID Development of telecommunication mast and Base Station
Case No: HWC23101803KB1018

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 31 January 2024.
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

KB

13.20 Erf 91807, 5 Hayes Road, Wynberg: S34-Alteration and Addition
Case No: HWC23072105KB0726

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29th January 2024
- Graded NCW
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- WECA did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

13.21 Erf 18660, 5 Bremer Street, Tijgerhof , Cape TownS34- additions and alterations
Case No: HWC23071302KB0718

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 28 January 2024
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

13.22 Erf 173606, 16 Firtree Street, Plumstead: S34-Alterations and Additions
Case No: HWC23112215KB1124

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

Mr Ashley Warren was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 24th January 2024
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

13.23 Erf 55797, 22 Feldhausen Street, Claremont, S34-Alterations and Additions
Case No: HWC23040511KB0411

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 22nd January 2024
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- UCRRRA supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

- 13.24 Erf 8717, 28 Malan Street, Paarl-, S34- Alterations and Additions**
Case No: HWC23102518KB1027

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Internal and contextual images required.

KB

- 13.25 Erf 122213, 28 Thyphoon Street, Facreton, S34- Alterations and Additions**
Case No: HWC23102522KB1115

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape images required.

KB

- 13.26 Erf 48885, 18 Amhurst Avenue, Newlands: S34-Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC23103013KB1206

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29th January 2024
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- NRA supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

- 13.27 Erf 4221, 46 Taronga Road, Rondebosch, S34- Alterations and Additions**
Case No: HWC23102406KB1106

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape and external images required.

KB

13.28 Erf 855, 287 Main Road, Sea Point- S34- additions and alterations

Case No: HWC23102401KB1031

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29th January 2024
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

13.29 Erf 2155, Corner Truter and De Jager Street, Riversdale, S34-Total Demolition

Case No: HWC24011802KB0118

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Plan that indicating the outline to be demolished

KB

13.30 Erf 1067, 14 Finchley Road, Camps Bay: S34-Alterations and Additions

Case No: HWC23103027KB1115

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

SG, Locality plan and streetscape images required.

KB

13.31 Erf 1408, 1B Glengariff Road, Middelhof Unit 15, Three Anchor Bay, S34-A&A-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23120103CN1201

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 30 January 2024
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The proposal is for internal alterations to the apartment.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

13.32 Erf 156869, 57 Prestwich Street, Cape Town City Centre, S34-A&A-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24010819CN0116

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 30 January 2024
- Minor works application
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- The proposal is for a new balcony and roof canopy to match previously built additions.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

13.33 Erf 2838, 148 Buitengracht Street, Bo-Kaap, S27-A&A-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23112909CN1201

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 16, 17 and 30 January 2024
- Minor works application
- Graded II
- Inside HPO
- BKCA has no objections
- The proposal is to remove all broken, cracked and loose plaster of the exterior walls, gables and beading, stabilising the walls, re-plaster and paint.
- The work that has started are the removal of old plaster and stabilisation.

DECISION

The Committee is supportive of the proposed interventions. In order for Heritage Western Cape (HWC) to issue a permit, the following is required:

1. The applicant is to appoint a suitably qualified consultant with the appropriate heritage experience to oversee the proposed work
2. HWC is to be provided with the details of the consultant and their CV confirming suitability to oversee the work
3. A letter of appointment to be signed by the applicant and consultant

Once the above has been fulfilled, HWC will provide the required permit.

CN

13.34 Erf 1485, 151 Kloof Street, Gardens, S34-A&A-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24011610CN0119

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 30 January 2024.
- Minor works application
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.
- The proposal was for internal alterations.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CN

14. NEW MATTERS

14.1 Erf 120, Corner of Lang & Boom Streets, Aurora, Piketberg, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24012209KB0126

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Application is for minor works
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

14.2 Erf 14207-Re, 103 Mountain Road, Woodstock, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24011804KB0125

INCOMPLETE

The Committee does not deem the application as minor. WAAC and WRA comments required.

KB

14.3 Erf 391, 42 High Street, Darling, S34- Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC23112901KB0129

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Swartland Municipality supports the proposal.
- FOBC did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

14.4 Erf 50816, 8 Mons Avenue, Claremont, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC23111411KB0123

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Contextual photos and fully complete application form required.

KB

14.5 Erf 52688, 1 Hall Street, Claremont, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24011613KB0125

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- GLCA did not comment within the 30-day commenting period

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

14.6 Erf 55356, 13 Mark Road, Claremont, 34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24012207KB0126

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- UCRRA does not support the proposal

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Revised plans indicated what work has been completed and what work still needs to be carried out.

KB

14.7 Erf 636, 1 Gericke Street, Paarl, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24010820KB0124

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Internal images required.

KB

14.8 Erf 88259, 22 Main Road, St James, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24012509KB0126

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Internal and contextual photos

KB

14.9 Erf 98013, 34 Milner Road, Rondebosch, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24012502KB0126

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Applicant to confirm in writing that no work has started, and supply current images required.

KB

14.10 Erf 2930, 21 Esperance Street, Parow, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24012504KB0126

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Contextual Photos and Revised plans indicating the work that has started and what still need to be executed

KB

14.11 Erf 1056-Re, Smart Living Education Centre, Bay Road, Urban Park, Green Point, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC23080809SJ0126

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Title Deed, Green Point Ratepayers' & Residents' Association

SJ

14.12 Erf 1236, 32 Rottingdean Road, Bakoven, Camps Bay, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC23120803SJ0124

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Company resolution and streetscapes photographs required.

SJ

14.13 Erf 13162, 92 Main Road, Paarl, S27-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24011805SJ0129

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Mr Clive Theunissen was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Graded II
- Inside Special character protected overlay zone of Paarl
- Paarl300 supports the proposal
- DHF supports the proposal
- Drakenstein Municipality had no objection to the proposed work

DECISION

The Committee is supportive of the proposed interventions. In order for Heritage Western Cape (HWC) to issue a permit, the following is required:

1. The applicant is to appoint a suitably qualified consultant with the appropriate heritage experience to oversee the proposed work
2. HWC is to be provided with the details of the consultant and their CV confirming suitability to oversee the work
3. A letter of appointment to be signed by the applicant and consultant

Once the above has been fulfilled, HWC will provide the required permit.

SJ

14.14 Erf 2528, 21 Van Zyl Street, Roundhay, Somerset West, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: SJ0123

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

POP, CoCT EHM and HRF comments required

SJ

14.15 Erf 505, 11 A&B Graham Road, Sea Point, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24012515SJ0125

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape photographs, conservation body comments, CoCT comment required.

SJ

14.16 Erf 52152, 5 Basset Road, Claremont, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24012307SJ0124

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

COCT comment submitted is for the incorrect site, streetscapes images, trust resolution

SJ

14.17 Erf 555-RE, 237 High Level Road, Sea Point, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC23112316SJ0124

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- SFA has no objections
- SFB has no objections

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

SJ

14.18 Erf 875, Manor House Building, Kirstenbosch National Botanical Garden, S34-Minor Works for Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24011603SJ0124

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application

- Ungraded
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee is supportive of the proposed interventions with the following conditions:

1. A close out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

SJ

14.19 Erf 97222, 9 Heatherton Road, Claremont, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24012318SJ0124

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- GLCA has no objections

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.20 Erven 481-Re & 23382, 87 Tulbagh Street, Worcester, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC23121805SJ0126

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Breede Valley Municipality had no objections
- Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society had no objection

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.21 Portion 4 of Varsche Rivier 260 of Destructive Analysis of 164 samples of unworked ostrich eggshell (OES) and 37 small and small/medium bovid teeth, from rock shelter sites Varsche Rivier 001 (Reception Shelter) and Varsche Rivier 005 (Buzz Shelter), S35-Destructive Analysis
Case No: HWC24011101SB0119

Ms Stephanie Barnardt- Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Application is for analysis and dating prepared by Teresa Steele, collaborating University of California, Davis: Department of Anthropology institution. The material comes from two sites - Varsche Rivier 001 and 005 which was excavated over two seasons. The application is for destructive analyses for stable isotopes, Sr isotopes and radiocarbon dating of 164 samples of unworked ostrich eggshells and 37 small/medium bovid teeth. The aim of the research is
- Firstly, it wants to understand changes in where people gather food during a certain historical period using a method called strontium isotopes.
- Secondly, it aims to improve our understanding of the ancient environment by analyzing stable isotopes of carbon, nitrogen, and oxygen.
- Lastly, it wants to enhance the accuracy of the timeline of the archaeological site using radiocarbon analysis. Iziko states that the study will not compromise the collection

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Clarity on actual sample size being used and percentage of what will be destroyed.

SB

14.22 Erf 365, Voortrekker Road, Piketberg, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24010826SB0124

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

New application form to be submitted, demolition plan, Internal photographs of the structure, clearer photographs of the outside of the building, clearer streetscape and the surrounding context, comment from the local municipality, proof of advertisement on site for the demolition in question

SB

14.23 Erf 504, Voortrekker Road, Darling, S38(4)-NID -Alternation and addition to building
Case No: HWC23121802SB0125

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape images, S34 application required.

SB

14.24 Pipeline relocation on Farm 6154, off R407, Swartberg Pass, Scholtzekloof, Prince Albert, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23112304SB0125

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Site images required.

SB

14.25 Tourist accommodation on Farm 558 Jongensgat, Hessequa, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC24012301SB0123

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

new application form required.

SB

14.26 Tourist accommodation and associated infrastructure on Farm 146 Omklaar, Robertson S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23112310SB0124

Ms Stephanie Barnardt- Delpont introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Total development footprint: 2105m² and the site is very remote.
- Archaeology: low, as per the screening report.
- Palaeontology: low, as the site contains sandstone and shale of Table Mountain Group formation which seldom contains palaeontological resources.
- Visual on the Cultural Landscape: 6 cabins, 2 ablution facilities, 2 staff housing, yoga decks, electricity via a small solar PV which may be a visual intrusion on the remote site.
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- Heritage resources will be impacted by the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following:

1. Visual Impact Assessment on cultural landscape

SB

14.27 Embedded generation and energy storage alternatives on Portion 101-Re of Farm 217, Hartenbos, Mossel Bay, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC24011815SB0119

Ms Stephanie Barnardt- Delpont introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Municipal project for sustainable energy with alternative layouts which won't impact heritage.
- Archaeology: low given the findings of the heritage statement; low density of artefacts.
- Palaeontology: low as the site has been extensively transformed.
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

14.28 Consent Use Renewable Energy Structure & Tourist Facility on Farm Paddock 257-Re, near Vanrhysndorp, S38(8)-NID

Case No: HWC24012508SB0126

Ms Stephanie Barnardt- Delpont introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Archaeology: There have been very few AIAs and studies conducted in the area; however, given the scale and the limiting footprint size of the development, it is unlikely to have an impact.
- Palaeontology: unknown, according to SAHRIS
- Visual: Low given the scale.
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

14.29 Consent Use Renewable Energy Structure & Tourist Facility on Portion 354 of Farm Vredendal 292, Vanrhysndorp Division, near Vredendal, S38(8)-NID

Case No: HWC24012510SB0126

Ms Stephanie Barnardt- Delpont introduced the item.

- Archaeology: There have been several AIAs conducted in the area; the archaeological resources of the area are well known, and given the nature of development, they are unlikely to be impacted negatively.
- Palaeontology: unknown, according to SAHRIS
- Visual: Low given the scale.
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DISCUSSION

- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

14.30 Subdivision and rezoning on Farm Rijks Ridge 396-Re, Tulbagh, S38(4)-NID

Case No: HWC23112002SB0123

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

NID application form required.

SB

14.31 Erf 123, 31 Cummings Street, Wellington, S34-Additions &Alterations

Case No: HWC24012304CN0124

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Drakenstein Municipality has no objection
- Paarl300 has no objections
- Wellington Heritage Foundation has no objection.
- The proposal for a living room extension and a covered patio at the rear, a gas installation, rainwater harvesting tanks and solar panels on the roof.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.32 Erf 1409, 1A Glengariff Road, Unit 13 & 14 Three Anchor Bay, S34-Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition

Case No: HWC24011102CN0123

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The proposal is for internal alterations and reconfigurations, as well as a loft conversion. The proposals for both apartments are the same.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.33 Erf 3423-RE, 220 Buiten Street, Northpine, S38(8)-NID

Case No: HWC24011604CN0129

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The property measures approx. 3ha in extent and the current land use is vacant. The current zoning is General Business 4 and the surrounding land uses include GR1, GI1, GB1, Vacant pockets and Utility Zones.
- The proposal is for a mixed-use affordable housing residential development that will include 423 affordable housing opportunities, social housing, GAP housing, retail and commercial components, internal roads, and engineering services.
- Applicable Heritages:
 - Archaeo: Early 20th c. agricultural buildings existed on the site. No anticipated impact during excavations.
 - Palaeo: Blue = Protocol for finds
 - Trees: The site is 137m from the Old Oak Trees at 281 Old Paarl Road. In c.2010 the trees were considered for nomination as Champion Trees and are graded IIIC. The trees are seen as a rare grouping of Oak trees.
 - Graves: As the crow flies, the site is 460m from the early 20th century Old African Methodist Episcopal Church Cemetery.
- The HP does recommend that an HIA is not required since heritage resources will not be impacted.
- Recommendation is for NFS
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

CN

14.34 Erf 45127, 8 Lothian Road, Rondebosch, S34- Additions &Alterations

Case No: HWC24012210CN0123

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The proposal is for a new garage, a patio to the front and side, internal alterations, and a new deck with a braai.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.35 Erf 4652-RE, 18 Wingfield Street, Wellington, S34- Additions &Alterations

Case No: HWC24012208CN0124

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Ungraded
- Drakenstein Municipality has no objection.
- Wellington Heritage Foundation has no objection.
- DHF cannot condone on authorized work and but has no objection.
- Paarl 300 does not support and cannot comment on work already completed.
- The completed work includes living room extension, garage, solar panels, boundary wall, patio, laundry, aviary and swimming pool. The proposed work includes a lean-to on back stoep, shade port and expansion of solar panels on roof.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CN

14.36 Erf 64517, 3 Kenilworth Crescent, Kenilworth, S34- Additions &Alterations

Case No: HWC24012505CN0125

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Plans, streetscape photos, comments if not Minor Works

CN

14.37 Erf 775-RE, 469 Main Road, Paarl, S27-Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition

Case No: HWC24011803CN0125

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded PHS
- Inside Special character area overlay zone of Paarl
- Drakenstein Municipality has objections.
- DHF they cannot comment fully and require a full set of drawings indicating elevations and sections, a complete list of historical material to be removed and alterations to be made, and that the plans should be coloured to SANS 10400 Part A. DHF further states that they strongly object to parking in front of the building and is of the opinion that the parking should be moved to the back of the property. The applicant provided the requested info, but no new comments were received.
- Paarl 300 supports.
- The proposal is to repair cracks, replace thatch roof with corrugated metal roof sheeting in motivation, but plan speaks of slate tiles, demolish internal walls, strengthen the gable, upgrading the loft and install a new staircase, as well as a lean to roof and timber deck. Alterations the outbuilding (old barn) is also proposed, as well as landscaping of the property that will include the removal of several trees. The alterations will create guest accommodation in the house and outbuilding.

- Referred the application to BELCOM for their expertise on the complete remodeling of the significant heritage resource.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 28 February 2024.

CN

14.38 Erven 142, 143, 144, 7288 and 9059, Various Roads (22 Nassau Avenue, 33 Aberdeen Road, 88 Dummer Street, 25 John Rumle Street and 1 Marianne Close), Parel Vallei, Somerset West, S38(8)-NID

Case No: HWC24012503CN0126

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The properties are combined 6ha in extent, but the erven are separate. The current land use is public open space, with a zoning of Open Space 2 and Transport 2 and the surrounding land uses are residential.
- The proposal is for flood reduction measures to be constructed in the catchment area and streams. A stormwater detention pond is proposed as Project 5. Another stormwater detention pond with two micro ponds is proposed as Project 6. Channel rehabilitation is proposed as Project 7 and three in-line stormwater detention ponds are proposed as Project 14.
- Applicable Heritages:
 - Archaeo: It is possible that isolated stone artefacts may occur in the area, but none were seen during the survey. Historical archaeology is not expected due to the recent age of the houses in the area. No significant impacts expected.
 - Palaeo: SAHRIS blue area. Fossils are thus theoretically possible but not expected to occur. In any case, much of the sediment to be disturbed is likely relatively recent floodplain deposit and any fossil content would reflect relatively recent deaths (Holocene). No significant impacts expected.
 - Building Structures: No heritage structures were seen and it is clear that no structures of any sort lie within the project areas. The Parel Vallei homestead lies some 200 m south of the study area. No anticipated impacts.
 - Slavery: Unknown, but it is likely that Parel Vallei would have had slaves on it. Where these slaves worked cannot be determined, but significant places associated with slavery will not be present in the study areas due to their highly transformed state. Descriptions of Heritage Impact: No significant impacts expected.
 - Other: The many trees in the area can be considered part of the cultural landscape because of their visual amenity value. While some trees are likely to be fairly old – many trees are noted to be present on the 1953 aerial imagery. Some historical trees and many recent invasive alien trees will be removed from the project areas to facilitate construction of the ponds. This is not seen as significant given the recent age of the surrounding urban fabric.
- The HP believes there will be no negative impacts to heritage resources and does not recommend an HIA.
- Recommendations is for NFS with a protocol for finds.
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Protocol for finds to be included.

CN

14.39 Farm 949-RE, 48 Hindle Road, Driftsands, Stellenbosch Farms (Cape Town), S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23112201CN0129

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Typology and what types of mixed uses info, POA and Company Resolution and Streetscape photos required.

CN

14.40 Portion 45 of Farm Simons Vlei No. 791 via Simonsvlei Road, Paarl, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC24012202CN0129

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Title Deed, Company Resolution, Locality Plan, Streetscape photos and SG diagram required.

CN

15. Other Matters

16. Adoption of Resolutions and Decisions

CH moves to adopt and CN seconds the adoption of resolutions and decisions.

17. Closure: 13:00

18. Date of Next Meeting

12 February 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR: _____

SECRETARY: _____

Annexure A – HWC Heritage Officer Meetings

Abbreviations

APHP - Association of Professional Heritage Practitioners

AHP - Agulhas Heritage Society

BKCA - Bo-Kaap Civic Association

BKYM - Bo-Kaap Youth Movement

CIBRA - City Bowl Ratepayers' & Residents Association

CoCT - City of Cape Town

CTHT - Cape Town Heritage Trust

CRM - Cultural Resources Management

DRHCA - De Rust Heritage Conservation Association

Docomomo South Africa

DHS - Durbanville Heritage Society

EHM - Environmental Heritage Management department

FoBCA - Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area

FE - Friends of Elim

GLCA - Greater Lynfræ Civic Association

GPRRA - Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association

HVA - Harfield Village Association

HMB - Heritage Mossel Bay

HVTA - Hex Valley Tourism Association

HBRRA - Hout Bay & Ratepayers and Residents Association

HIA - Heritage Impact Assessment

ILASA - Institute for Landscape Architecture in South Africa

KBHA - Kalk Bay Historical Association

KBSJRR - Kalk bay-St James Ratepayers & Residents Association

LKID - Lower Kenilworth Improvement District

MHCS - Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society

NCW - Not Conservation Worthly

NEMA - National Environmental Management Act (No. 107 of 1998)

NID - Notification of Intent to Develop

NCOA - Noetzie Conservancy Owners Association

OH - Oudtshoorn Heritage

Paarl300 Foundation

PRRA - Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association

PACF - Prince Albert Cultural Foundation

SAHRA - South African Heritage Resources Agency

SRHS - Salt River Heritage Society

SFB - Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association

SvdSF - Simon van der Stel Foundation Cape Town

STHS - Simon's Town Historical Society

SHF - Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation

SHCT - Stillbaai Heritage Conservation Trust

GHT - George Heritage Trust

RVRA - Rustenburg Valley Residents Association

TRHCS - Touws River Heritage and Conservation Society

VASSA - Vernaclar Architecture Society of South Africa

WUECAG - Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group

WCAC - West Coast Aboriginal Council

WAAC - Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee

WHCS - Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society

WRRRA - Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association

ASAPA - Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists

ABHC - Associated Bibbys Hoek Conservancy (Knysna)

BELCOM - Built Environment and Landscapes Committee

CBCRA - Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association

CSDBOA - Clifton-On-Sea & District Bungalow Owners Association

CTHF - Cape Town Heritage Foundation

CRRA - Constantia Ratepayers & Residents Associations

CMP - Conservation Management Plan

DWCA - De Waterkant Civic Association

DHF - Drakenstein of Heritage Foundation

EMPr - Environmental Management Program

FHRA - Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayer Association

FoCVGB - Friends of Constantia Valley Green Belts

GBRM - Great Brak River Museum

GVHAG - Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group

GCS - Greyton Conservation Society

HRF - Heldeberg Renaissance Foundation

HOMS - Heritage Officers Meeting

HPO - Heritage protects overlay

HWC - Heritage Western Cape

IACom - Impact Assessment Committee

IGIC - Inventories, Gradings and Interpretations Committee

KHS - Kommetjie Heritage Society

MGHS - McGregor Heritage Society

NHC - Napier Heritage & Conservation

NASDB - Nelspoort Agency of Sustainable Development body

NHRA - National Heritage Resources Act (No. 25) of 1999

NRA - Newlands Residents Association

OCA - Observatory Civic Association

OHAC - Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee

PPP - Public Participation Process

PHCT - Pniel Heritage and Cultural Trust

RMCA - Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee

SAHRIS - South African Heritage Resources Information System

SPFA - Sea Point for All Group

SHC - Stanford Conservation Trust & Stanford Heritage Committee

SIG - Stellenbosch Interest Group

SHA - Swellendam Heritage Association

OWVS - Old Wynberg Village Society

TVHF - Tulbagh Valley Heritage Foundation

UCRRA - Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association

WERRA - Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association

Ward 2 Forum

WCC - Whale Coast Conservation

WRA - Woodstock Residents Association

WECA - Wynberg East Civic Association