

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Monday, 10 June 2024 at 08:30,
via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Ms. Sneha Jhupsee officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)	(Chairperson)
Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport (SB)	(Specialist Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chiara Singh (CSI)	(Heritage Officer)
Emily Jane Vowles (EJV)	(Heritage Officer)

Staff

Ms. Aneeqah Brown (AB)	(Secretariat)
Ms. Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)	(Admin)
Ms. Waseefa Dhansay (WD)	(Assistant Director: Professional Services)
Ms. Colette Scheermeyer (CS)	(Deputy Director)

Legal Advisor

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)	(Deputy Director: Legal)
-------------------------	--------------------------

Observers

Ms Soraya Ho-Kim

Visitors

Ms Nicolene Visser	Item 13.27
Mr Ernest Robinson	Item 13.27
Mr Shane Stewart	Item 13.7
Mr Raymond Smith	Item 13.1
Ms Emmylou Bailey	Item 14.34
Mr Jonathan Kaplan	Item 14.41
Ms Ursula Rigby	Item 14.36
Mr Clive Theunissen	Drakenstein Matters
Ms Claire Abrahamse	Item 14.54

3. Apologies

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile (KB)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Corne Nortje (CN)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chane Herman (CH)	(Heritage Officer)

Absent

None

4. Acceptance of the Code of Conduct

Members and staff raised hands in the MS Teams platform to indicate acceptance of the Code of Conduct.

5. Approval of Agenda

10 June 2024. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits.
EJV moves to adopt the agenda and CSI seconds.

6. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

- 6.1.** 3 June 2024. The Committee resolved to approve the minutes.
EJV moves to adopt the agenda and SJ seconds.

7. Disclosure of conflict of interest

None.

8. Confidential matters

None.

9. Standing Items

9.1. Site inspections undertaken.

- 9.1.1.** Portion 81 of Stellenbosch Farm 918 (adjacent to Broadlands homestead), Somerset West (SB)
Official provided verbal feedback on the site inspection, report to be tabled in due course.

9.2. Proposed Site Inspection

9.3. Site Inspection Reports

None

9.4. Preparation for upcoming Committee meetings

9.4.1. Appeals 13 June 2024

9.4.2. HOMs 19 June 2024

9.4.3. IACom 20 June 2024

9.5. Tribunal updates (Legal)

None

9.6. Interim and Close out Reports

None

9.7. Incomplete Applications

13.16; 14.17; 14.18; 14.40, 14.12; 14.13; 14.14; 14.15; 14.19; 14.24; 14.25; 14.26; 14.27; 14.28; 14.29;
14.30; 14.32; 14.33; 14.37; 14.38; 14.39; 14.42; 14.44; 14.46; 14.48; 14.50; 14.53; 14.55

9.8. Archaeological Matters

9.8.1. Erf 40338, 29 Albus Drive, Sunset Beach, Milnerton (SB)

Case officer to liaise with City of Cape Town official to investigate the matter further.

9.9. Illegal Works Database (Stop works orders)

None

9.10. Permit deadline

11 June 2024, 10h00.

10. Administrative Matters

11. Monitoring by practitioner

11.1 Erf 24290, 37 Upper Camp Road, Alexandra Hospital, Maitland (HWC23091309EJV0318)

- The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources. The committee endorsed the appointment of Johan Cornelius to monitor the proposed work.

1. Work to be done strictly in accordance with the HWC stamped plans.

2. Appointment of Johan Cornelius to monitor the proposed work.

3. A close-out report must be submitted to HWC within 30 days of practical completion of the work

12. Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

13. MATTERS ARISING

13.1 Erf 3179, 233 Bree Street, Cape Town, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC23111302CH0520

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item on behalf of Ms Chane Herman.

Mr Raymond Smith was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3 June 2024.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- Proposal is to re-instate the original (pre-1967) three-bay façade and street fencing, correct the Watson Street roofline and parapet cornice, while addressing ill-considered fenestration type, proportion and placement.
- To facilitate additional office space, it is also proposed to add a top-floor space to the rear portion of the roof area (on top of the 1967 addition), with setback from Breë Street façade. A clear glass balustrade will be inserted behind the parapet wall.
- General maintenance & refurbishment are also proposed.
- Work has not started.
- CIBRA supports.
- CoCT supports on condition that the glass balustrade surrounding the roof deck be removed. CoCT further recommends that there be a 1m high masonry parapet wall to the existing building to satisfy the need for a balustrade wall. It was also suggested, but not conditioned, that there be a plastered moulding to the new top-floor addition.
- The Committee noted that the glass balustrade is set back from the original parapet lines and the use of glass would not be appropriate in the HPOZ. This particular streetscape was identified by CoCT's EHM as a 'special streetscape'.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Drawings to be revised particularly with regards to the balustrade. The glass is to be changed to a simpler design such as a 1m high masonry parapet wall or to incorporate simple steel handrails.

CH

13.2 Erf 452, 30 Main Road, Hermanus, S34-Deviation Case No: HWC24051432CH0522

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item on behalf of Ms Chane Herman.

DISCUSSION

- Information was received on 31 May 2024 and 3 June 2024.
- Application is for deviations from the proposed SDP/concept design for the replacement building. Previously in 2022, HWC approved the demolition of the existing and the replacement structure (residential accommodation).
- This current proposal is for an additional storey consisting of dormer roofs and balconies to create a buffer from the road to be in line with the residential character. The dormers are particularly proposed to lessen the scale of the building.
- The work has not started.
- OHAC provided comment stating that the third storey heavily massed braai chimneys are to be

dematerialised and the heavily massed fire escape staircase to be reconsidered along the end of Flower Street.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 27 June 2024.

CH

13.3 Erf 10789, 6 Marias Street, Strand, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24052711CH0517

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item on behalf of Ms Chane Herman.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 June 2024.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Proposal is for the addition of a covered patio, braai, carport and swimming pool.
- Work has not started.
- Work is to the rear of the building.
- CoCT supports.
- HRF supports"

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

13.4 Erf 19850, 83 Justin Street, Brooklyn, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23111604KB1206

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item on behalf of Ms Chane Herman.

DISCUSSION

- Information provided to case officer on 2 March 2024.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Work has been completed.
- The application is for as-built additions (lounge, two bedrooms and domestic quarters).
- The work is complete.
- CoCT requires the HWC approval.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CH

13.5 Erf 94460, 4 Darters Road, Gardens, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24051410CH0520

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item on behalf of Ms Chane Herman.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3 June 2024.
- Graded IIIA

- Inside HPO
- Proposal is for internal alterations.
- Work has not started.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

13.6 Erf 9479, York Street, George, S34- Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24051439CH0520

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item on behalf of Ms Chane Herman.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 June 2024.
- Proposal is for maintenance and minor upgrades to the existing structure.
- Ground floor: will remain for commercial use with maintenance proposed to the interior and exterior.
- First and second floor: new fenestration and minor internal alterations to the kitchens and bathrooms. Alternations to the existing modern addition at the rear and the intersections of three new apartments to the rear.
- According to the heritage statement: The structure is not graded however it would be a proposed grading of IIIC for its low local architectural cultural significance. If considered within its context, the proposed grading is IIIB.
- The work has started but was ceased until the HWC process has concluded. This work included changing the steel windows to aluminium on the west elevation (this has been clouded on the drawings).
- George Municipality did not provide comment in 30 days.
- SvdS Foundation did not provide comment within 30 days.
- George Heritage Trust supports and believes that the building should be on the George's heritage inventory and would like to motivate for a IIIB grading.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

13.7 Erf 357-RE, 11 St. Quintons Road, Unit 18, Oranjezicht, S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC24050805CN0521

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje

Mr Shane Stewart was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3 June 2024.
- The proposal is for a new roof loft area, skylights, structural roof repairs and internal alterations to existing apartment.
- CoCT supports the proposal.

- Graded NCW
- Inside HPO
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CN

13.8 Erf 4269, 13 Main Road, Somerset West, S34-Total Demolition Case No: HWC24041203CN0521

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 30 May & 3 June 2024.
- The proposal is to demolish the neglected and delapidated old stable building. A tree recently fell on the roof and caused further damage to the building.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- Work has not started.
- Structural engineers report concludes: the building is in a dangerous state and it would be more cost effective / sustainable to demolish the building and re-build it to the exact dimensions (with modern building materials) provided by Vinitra Consulting's plans.
- Recent M&R application to main house recently processed by SJ approved 19.03.24.
- CoCT is not in support of the demolition of the building as the opportunity exists for informed restorations/reconstruction of the building to allow for the adaptive reuse thereof.
Consideration should thus be given to the appointment of a suitably experienced heritage architect to provide input into any proposed interventions given the IIIB significance and for such interventions to be shown on a building plan which is to be approved by the authorities concerned (prior to any further work being undertaken). Suggested conditions:
 1. That consideration be given to following a holistic approach by requesting a NID submission in accordance with the requirements of Section 38 of the NHRA (which could possibly include a HIA) rather than assessing the demolition and/or additions and alterations to buildings older than 60 years individually as stand-alone Section 34 submissions.
 2. That consideration be given to the appointment of a suitably experienced heritage architect to provide input into any proposed interventions given the IIIB significance and for such interventions to be shown on a building plan which is to be approved by the authorities concerned (prior to any further work being undertaken).
- HRF objects and states that:
 1. The HRF oppose the granting of the requested permit for the total demolition of this barn / building, based on the current information provided.
 2. The application provides no meaningful review of the Heritage Status of the building.
 3. We note that per the City website it is graded 3B as a "late 19th century farmstead with possible earlier fabric and "Requires investigation".
 4. The building occupies a very visible contextual position and is a landmark at the entrance to the town.
 5. We thus encourage a more informed review of the Heritage status and recommendations as to the best way to deal with the building, such by a suitable qualified Heritage practitioner.
 6. The building has been identified as being at risk for some time and has subsequently deteriorated
 7. The HRF thus encourage the urgent review and approval of a constructive solution, ideally with a reconstruction and stabilization with a suitable adaptive reuse.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Applicant to submit an emergency application to stabilise the building.
2. HWC is requesting plans for the replacement structure, to assess its impact on the heritage value of the property and the HPO.
3. HWC is requesting a heritage statement with design informants should the design of the replacement structure not be like-for-like.

CN

13.9 Erf 550-RE, 303 High Level Road, Fresnaye, S34-A&A&Partial Demolition Case No: HWC24040522CN0410

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje

DISCUSSION

- Information received 28 May and 5 June 2024.
- The proposal is for internal alterations on the ground floor and the addition of a 1st floor to the building.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.
- CoCT support
- SFB support
- SFA support

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

13.10 Erf 9474, 29 Plein Street, Stellenbosch, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24013017CN0410

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 28 May and 3 June 2024.
- The proposal is for create a gym within a section of the building and to add signage for the new gym including board above the door and flags on the corner.
- SHF did not provide comment in 30 days.
- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO
- Work has not started.
- SIG had questions and the applicant provided responses:
 1. How will services (sewage pipes) be dealt with, should the bathrooms be moved to the proposed position? We are keeping sewage/all waste pipes in current positions; we will run short piping to existing waste pipes if required to not make too many changes to the existing waste infrastructure. Hot and cold-water pipes will be run through new non-load-bearing gyprock/partition walls.
 2. Annexure G refers: the additional sign in the 'steeg' opposite Poke Bowl is not supported. Will the applicant consider omitting it from the proposal? Applicant response - Ok, that is fine not to have, so we can however have the branded flags up on the corner (FNB is also happy for us to hang them from the flagpoles) and have the sign above the doors? SIG issued a letter of support thereafter.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources on the condition that the signage in the "steeg" be omitted and should signage be proposed, another S34 application must be submitted to HWC.

CN

13.11 Erf 125726, 28 Malan Crescent, Ysterplaat, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24051404CSI0515

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- information received on the 30 May and 3 June 2024.
- Further requirements included a new application form, locality map, streetscape photographs, and comment from CoCT
- Work applied for has not started.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Proposed additions are for two new dwellings and a domestic servant quarters
- CoCT provided comment and support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.12 Erf 4491, 67 Wynn Street, Fairfield Estate, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24050701CSI0408

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on the 20th and 31st of May 2024.
- Further requirements included comment from CoCT regarding the amended plans, streetscape photographs, and the locality map.
- Work has not started.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPOZ
- The proposed addition is for another dwelling to be added to the existing dwelling.
- CoCT provided comment and support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.13 Erf 53235, 4 Lincoln Street, Claremont, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24050610CSI0424

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Additional information received on the 5th of May and 4th of June
- Further requirements included proof of payment and comment from HVA
- Work applied for has not started
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO but within the Harfield Village LOA
- Proposed work is for a dining area extension to the existing kitchen with an outdoor pergola deck area.
- CoCT and HVA provided comment and support the application

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.14 Erf 6159, 5 Short Street, Parow, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24032521CSI0520

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Additional information received on the 6th of June 6
- Further requirements included an updated comment from CoCT regarding the amended plans
- Work applied for has not started.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Proposed addition is for the extension of the existing dwelling and other internal alterations.
- CoCT previously did not support the current application as the plans are not up to scratch but they have since given their support as the plans have been amended.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.15 Erf 815, 2 Holmfirth Road, Sea Point, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24031802CSI0514

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Additional information received on the 24th of May and 3rd of June
- Further requirements included a title deed, company resolution, and comment from SFA
- Work applied for has not started.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Proposed work is for internal and external additions and alterations including the replacement of the windows.
- CoCT, SFB, and SFA have provided comment and support the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.16 Farm 1/1749, Old Hermon Road off the R44, Elandsberg, S38(4) – NID
Case No: HWC24053105CSI0514

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

The letter supplied is not sufficient. A company resolution which specifically allows the person to make application to HWC is needed.

CSI

13.17 Erf 11497, 41 Kyle Street, Strand, S34 – Minor Works
Case No: HWC24032701EJV0409

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 30 May 2024.
- Installation of external security fencing in the same style as the neighbouring properties, replacement of bathroom tiling and fixtures, replacement of beetle-ridden wooden flooring
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- HRF approves
- The committee discussed the level of detail provided on the drawings.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

13.18 Erf 28697, 1 Princess Street, Mowbray, S34 – Additions & Alterations; Deviation
Case No: HWC24053106EJV0502

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 7 June 2024.
- Owner deviated from previously approved plan HWC22091907MS0919E by extending the NE elevation dormer window and changing the window sizes on the NW, NE and SW elevations and adding skylights.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- RAMPAC has no objections.
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

EJV

13.19 Erf 50548, 23 Ranelagh Road, Rondebosch, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24051002EJV0502

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9, 13, 31 May 2024.
- The dwelling has been allowed to fall into a state of disrepair which now necessitates replacing the rotten wooden windows and doors with aluminium, replacing the roof sheeting, and replacing the bathroom fittings. Owners also intend to add an ensuite bathrooms to each bedroom.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

13.20 Erf 7952, 14 Drakenstein Street, Somerset West, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24032007KB0405

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 30 April and 30 May
- As-built additions of an ensuite bedroom, patio, garden store and pool, extending the footprint of the structure.
- CoCT declined to comment as the property is NCW; HRF supports
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

EJV

13.21 Erf 89777, 108 Norman Road, Kalk Bay, S34-As built
Case No: HWC24042904SB0413

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 22 May 2024.
- Applicant is applying for a Heritage Permit because the property is within an HPOZ and the building work is over 60 years old.
- There have been no unauthorized modifications or proposed alterations.
- The submitted building plans seek approval for the existing as-built structures in accordance with previously approved plans.
- The section of the building encroaching onto the Main Road has been there for many years, similar to other buildings along the road.
- The current owner, who is elderly, urgently wants to sell the property for relocation to,

necessitating the need for as-built approval.

- No unauthorised or proposed work, regularization of plans on CoCT records.
- CoCT has requested comment from HWC.

COMMENT

The proposal does not trigger the NHRA. A letter of no trigger to be issued.

SB

13.22 Erf 92, 27 Church Street, Stanford, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23110902SJ1113

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 June 2024.
- Original application approved 20 April 2022.
- A Section 51 letter was issued for deviation from previously approved plans.
- A new set of drawings has been submitted for this application for the new wing of the house.
- The work has started as per the previous HWC application..
- The proposal is for an additional bedroom wing to the existing house.
- SHC: support with comment: the walls of the new addition and existing structure must be plastered & painted to be compliant with the HPOZ and Stanford Style Guide.
- OHAC supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that the walls of the new addition and existing structure must be plastered & painted to be compliant with the HPOZ and Stanford Style Guide.

SJ

13.23 Erf 41392, 82 Hadley Street, Belville, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24020114SJ0209

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Demolition plan and CoCT comment required.

SJ

13.24 Erf 90, 31 Peak Drive, Pinelands, S34-Restoration & Reconstruction
Case No: HWC24041901SJ0419

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Proposal is repairs to existing dwelling that was subject to fire damage. Intention is to restore it back to original form with like-for-like replacements.
- Previous application: addition of braai room.
- CoCT EHM: support
- PRRA: support

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.25 Erf 28390, 423 Main Street, Paarl, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24030504SJ0503

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 27 May 2024.
- The work has not started.
- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO
- Proposal is for shade ports toward the rear of the building - not visible from the street and not touching the existing fabric.
- DHAC: no objection (second comment on amended plans)
- Paarl300: supported
- DHF: no objection

COMMENT

The proposal does not trigger the NHRA. A letter of no trigger to be issued.

SJ

13.26 Erf 11397, 8 Withycombe Close, Constantia, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24041509SJ0520

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 2 June 2024.
- The work has not started.
- Proposal is to enclose the stoep area for an outdoor entertainment area as well as to protect from the weather.
- Ungraded
- CoCT EHM: support
- CRRA: signed form - no objection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.27 Erf 148, 55 Sands Road, Wilderness, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24051503SJ0520

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Ms Nicolene Visser and Mr Ernest Robinson were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3 June 2024.
- The work has not started.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Proposal is for replacement of windows and doors with modern fittings as well as a cladding on the external facades of the building. The intention is to make the building more weatherproof and low maintenance as it is not inhabited permanently.

- George Municipality: seeks HWC comment first.
- GHT: no objection
- SvdS: did not respond within 30-day period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.28 Portion 0 of Farm 174, Stellenbosch Square, Webersvallei Road, Jamestown, Stellenbosch, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC24052104SJ0521

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- A section 24G rectification process is required for the unlawful commencement of listed activities in terms of the Environment Conservation Act, (ECA), 1989 (Act No. 73 of 1989) and the National Environmental Management Act, (NEMA), 1998 (Act No. 107 of 1998) for the construction, upgrades and expansions at the Shell Stellenbosch Square Fuel Service Station, Western Cape, South Africa.
- Area: 4515sqm
- Construction commenced in 2004.
- Grey Paleo - zero

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted.

SJ

13.29 Erf 1367, 5 Ambleside Road, Pinelands, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24052709SJ0523

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 6 June 2024.
- The work has not started.
- Ungraded
- Proposal is for the renovation of an existing house that is dilapidated and has fallen into disrepair. The intention is to replace the roof structure and roof tiling with a new simpler structure to prevent further water damage and then address interior issues by stripping damaged fabric.
- CoCT EHM: support
- Ward Cllr Riad Davids: no objection

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

13.30 Erf 178079, Platteklip Upper Wash House, Van Riebeeck Park, Oranjezicht, S27-Alterations
Case No: HWC24022801SJ0402

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 May and 3 June 2024.
- The work has not started.
- Proposal is for alterations to the upper Wash House to convert the existing accommodation to more appropriate accommodation for longer stays. This will entail insertion of doors into ground floor bedrooms, new staircases to replace existing, and internal glazed walling. Externally, additional skylights will be implemented, a new chimney for the 2 bedroom unit, and revision of the stable door infill panels.
- The upper Wash House has been extensively altered prior to and then again by Lucien le Grange in 2004. The lower Wash House is still largely intact in its original condition.
- Inside Table Mountain PHS.
- CoCT EHM: support with condition - new doors are timber in same style and in same openings, solid panel at bottom and cottage pane panel at top, either two narrow double door leaves or two narrow single doors with abutting windows.

DECISION

The committee is supportive of the proposed interventions. In order for Heritage Western Cape (HWC) to issue a permit, the following is required:

1. The applicant is to appoint a suitably qualified consultant with the appropriate heritage experience to oversee the proposed work.
2. HWC is to be provided with the details of the consultant and their CV confirming suitability to oversee the work.
3. A letter of appointment to be signed by the applicant and consultant.

Once the above has been fulfilled, HWC will provide the required permit.

SJ

14. NEW MATTERS

14.1 Erf 3659, MediClinic, 21 Hof Street, Gardens, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24041101SJ0411

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Proposal is for the addition of solar PV panels to the roof of the 1958 extension of the Mediclinic building. This will also include the replacement of the existing heat pumps with more efficient ones.
- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.2 Erf 5457, Imhoff Farm, Main Road, Kommetjie, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24052714SJ0528

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Proposal is to convert an existing outbuilding (office and storeroom) into a restaurant. The dining area will open onto a lawn area outside the historic werf. Replacement of the existing flat corrugated asbestos cement roof with a similar roof. New French doors will be inserted along the front façade together. The rest of the alterations are internal.
- CoCT EHM: support with conditions - proposed laminated timber beams, contemporary eave detailing and diamondek roofing is not consistent with the current rustic/rural character of the farm and if implemented as currently proposed, would be a missed opportunity to add to the farm's character, instead of detracting/contrasting with it – detailing to be revised to be consistent with and complimentary to the character of the farm – specifically the three items mentioned above.
- Kommetjie Heritage Society: no comment received in 30-day commenting period.
- ClfA: no comment received in 30-day commenting period.
- CTHF: no comment received in 30-day commenting period.
- VASSA: no comment received in 30-day commenting period.
- Ward Cllr Simon Liell-Cock: no comment received in 30-day commenting period.
- Notices were placed around the site and at the local library.
- In response to the EHM conditions, the overhang has been designed as a separate element from the roof. The new canopy attaches below the roof eaves and may be removed in the future if need be. The canopy's timber elements will be painted and thus will not read as laminated timber. A clip-on profile along the edge of the diamondek sheets will conceal the profile of the sheets

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

1. A close-out report must be submitted to HWC within 30 days of practical completion of the work.

SJ

14.3 Erf 641-Re, 16 Upper Orange Street, Oranjezicht, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23112105SJ0524

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Proposal is for internal alterations with the addition of a new kitchen at ground level, bedroom in the attic space and replacing timber balcony as it is decaying. The timber columns are to be replaced with steel. A new pool will also be added. The heritage practitioner states that the timber balcony was a later addition by previous owners. There is a modern addition to the rear/west side of the historic structure.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT EHM: not supported - the timber columns and balustrades contribute to the high aesthetical, architectural and contextual significance. Even though the timber is not all original, EHM is opposed to the removal of the timber as it is in keeping with the architectural era of the house. The new material choice is not supported. Internal work is supported and retention of historic fire places is encouraged.

- CIBRA: support
- Comments from EHM were considered and drawings were revised to meet the conditions. The revised drawings were circulated to EHM with approval.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.4 Erven 95161 & 95140, Iziko Bertram House, Cnr Orange Street & Government Avenue, Cape Town, S27-Minor Works Case No: HWC24052802SJ0527

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Iziko Museums are installing Wifi as part of ICT infrastructure upgrades.
- Graded II
- Inside HPO
- Consultation: N/A MW

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.5 Erven 4196, 4203 & 4204, Iziko Koopmans De Wet House, 35 Strand Street, Cape Town, S27-Minor Works Case No: HWC24052803SJ0527

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Iziko Museums are installing Wifi as part of ICT infrastructure upgrades.
- Graded II
- Inside HPO
- Consultation: N/A MW

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.6 Erven 95910, 95951, 95952, 95953 & 95954, Iziko Rust en Vreugd, 78 Buitenkant Street, Cape Town, S27-Minor Works Case No: HWC24052804SJ0527

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Iziko Museums are installing Wifi as part of ICT infrastructure upgrades.
- Graded II

- Inside HPO
- Consultation: N/A MW

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

**14.7 Erven 95194, 95195, 95196, 95197, 95198, 95199, 95200, 95201, 95202, 95203 & 95204, Iziko South African National Gallery (ISANG), 80 St. Johns Road, Cape Town, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24052805SJ0527**

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Iziko Museums are installing Wifi as part of ICT infrastructure upgrades.
- Graded II
- Inside HPO
- Consultation: N/A MW

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

**14.8 Erven 9335, 4723, 4728, 4748 & 4729, Iziko Social History Centre (ISHC), 17 Church Square, Spin Street, Cape Town S27-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24052806SJ0527**

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Iziko Museums are installing Wifi as part of ICT infrastructure upgrades.
- Graded II
- Inside HPO
- Consultation: N/A MW

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

**14.9 Erf 95165 (3740), Iziko Slave Lodge, Corner of Adderley and Wale Streets, Cape Town, S27-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24052807SJ0527**

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Iziko Museums are installing Wifi as part of ICT infrastructure upgrades.
- Graded II

- Inside HPO
- Consultation: N/A MW

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.10 Erven 2433 & 9419, Iziko Old Town House, 149 Longmarket Street, S27-Minor Works Case No: HWC24052808SJ0527

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Iziko Museums are installing Wifi as part of ICT infrastructure upgrades.
- Graded II
- Inside HPO
- Consultation: N/A MW

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.11 Erf 96132, ISANG Annex Building, 80 St. Johns Road, Cape Town, S34-Minor Works Case No: HWC24052809SJ0527

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The work has not started.
- Iziko Museums are installing Wifi as part of ICT infrastructure upgrades.
- Graded II
- Inside HPO
- Consultation: N/A MW

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

14.12 Erf 1440, 60 Fourie Street, Heidelberg, S34-Minor Works Case No: HWC24052712SB0530

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

more internal, external and streetscape photographs, title deed, colour up plans, comments, motivation, SG Diagram

SB

14.13 Erf 2152, 91 Bree Street, Cape Town, CBD, S34-As-built Case No: HWC24052701SB0527

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

	updated photographs (internal, external and streetscape), SG Diagram	SB
14.14	Erf 2520, 41 Lake Road, Lotus River, S34-Total Demolition Case No: HWC24051434SB0528 REMOVED FROM AGENDA Duplicate item	SB
14.15	Erf 3850, 87 Main Road, Strand, S34-A&A Case No: HWC24052725SB0528 INCOMPLETE APPLICATION Comments from Helderberg Renaissance Foundation	SB
14.16	Farm 6971, 6967 Off Uitkyk Street, Bredasdorp, S38(8)-NID Case No: HWC24052201SB0527 Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item. DISCUSSION - proposed to subdivide the property to permit a single residential development comprising 60 opportunities, with ancillary roads, open spaces and infrastructure. - The site was originally part of Erf 1148 and owned by Cape Agulhas Municipality since 1922, primarily used for grazing before being purchased. - It is within the Urban Edge and planned for urban expansion according to the SDF. - No heritage resource was noted except for the Heuningberg Nature Reserve however the cultural landscape won't be impacted given the nature of the development. - Consultant recommends no further studies. DECISION The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted. Change finds procedure to be included.	SB
14.17	Farm 1076, Willemsfontein, Vredenburg, S38(8)-NID Case No: HWC24052734SB0527 INCOMPLETE APPLICATION site photos, title deed, SG required.	SB
14.18	Remainder of the Farm Trakas Kuilen No 15, Portion 1 of the Farm Trakas Kuilen No 15 Remainder of the Farm Witpoortje No 16, Off N12 (east of N12; approximately 62km south of Beaufort West) Central Karoo, Prince Albert, S38(8)-NID Case No: HWC24060517SB0530 INCOMPLETE APPLICATION New NID form, Title Deed, SG diagram	SB
14.19	Portion 24 (A Portion of Portion 5) Of Farm Port Beaufort No 484, Joseph Barry, Boulevard Barrydale, S34- Additions & Alterations	

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

streetscape, comments

SB

14.20 Portion 54 (portion of portion 30) of Farm Gustrouw 918, Mondeor Road, Somerset West, Stellenbosch and Cape Town, S38(4)-NID

Case No: HWC24053108SB0530

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Previously, a rezoning application was approved for the entire Portions 30, 51, 54, and 55 to allow for the Mondeor Eco School. However, the school did not take place as planned and now a new development is proposed for Portion 54.
- This development would include thirteen two-bedroom units, a larger workspace, a small restaurant, and a motor museum.
- The surrounding area consists of a mix of rural, community, business, and industrial uses.
- The development aligns with the relevant spatial policies and contributes to the much-needed housing and employment opportunities in the centrally located area.
- Site is vacant and no heritage resource noted on site.
- Consultant recommends no further studies.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted.

SB

14.21 Remainder Farm 26, 28 Die Kom, Seeduiker Street, Paternoster, S35-Dating

Case No: HWC24052738SB0527

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The first archaeological excavations in Paternoster were carried out by Robertshaw in 1977 at the Fisheries Factory Midden.
- Further surveys of surface contents were done by University of Cape Town staff and students in 1978. Rescue excavations in 1986 established the age of Paternoster North Midden to be around 3000-2000 BP.
- Impact assessment studies in subsequent years led to the discovery of more sites, but only PN1062 midden was dated to the third millennium BP.
- PN026 is another site sampled in Paternoster through archaeological impact studies. However, attempts to obtain radiocarbon dates for this site were unsuccessful.
- The destruction of marine shell samples from PN026 is aimed at establishing a chronological sequence and understanding precolonial settlement and subsistence patterns in Paternoster. at least 50 % of each sample will be destroyed for the purpose of AMS dating. A total percentage sample size vs the collection is less than 1.0 % for each of these ten samples.
- Iziko has signed the form.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to endorse the Section 35 application prepared by Antonieta Jerardino.

SB

14.22 Erven 32706-Re, 32707-Re, 32604-re, 32564-re 2 Kuil Street, 1 Eleventh Avenue, 43 Cornflower Street, 114 Bhunga Street, Cape Town, S38(4)-NID
Case No: HWC24060601SB0527

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed Consolidation and Subdivision to ensure that the buildings that are encroaching on cadastral boundaries are within their own respective cadastral boundary.
- Consultant recommends no further studies.
- City of Cape Town owned properties.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted.

SB

14.23 Erf 2833-Re, Great Brak River, Mossel Bay, S38(8)-HIA
Case No: HWC23090702SB1013

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- HOMs committee noted at the NID level that Palaeontological sensitive is very high.
- HIA Findings:
- The property is located within the urban edge and comprises areas already transformed/occupied, designated for "urban expansion" in the Mossel Bay MSDF (2022).
- The archaeological impact assessment identified no significant impacts to pre-colonial archaeological resources.
- The palaeontological sensitivity of the area is incorrectly indicated as very highly sensitive on the SAHRIS map. It is unlikely that any fossils occur in the soils covering the area.
- The very highly sensitive coding for the Enon Formation should be downgraded to moderately sensitive.
- No comments were received from the planning authority (Mossel Bay Municipality) or the Great Brak River Museum.
- Simon van der Stel Foundation (Southern Cape) indicated their support for the recommendation and conditions outlined in the Integrated HIA report.
- Mossel Bay Heritage commented with detail response and concerns.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Mossel Bay Heritage is to provide an opportunity to provide comment with all relevant documents.

SB

14.24 Erf 105, 51 Peninsula Road, Zeekoevlei, S34 - Partial Demolition
Case No: HWC24021908EJV0523

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

	Correct application form; CoCT comment; additional photographs required	EJV
14.25	Erf 122085, 78 Springbok Street, Kewtown, S34 - Additions & Alterations Case No: EJV0523 INCOMPLETE APPLICATION Proof of Payment or potential fee exemption required	EJV
14.26	Erf 1299, 15 Parish Road, Silverhurst, S34 - Total Demolition Case No: HWC24052005EJV0523 INCOMPLETE APPLICATION additional photographs; conservation body comment required	EJV
14.27	Erf 668, 46 Sedgemoor Road, Camps Bay, S34 - Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24052007EJV0523 INCOMPLETE APPLICATION consultation comments; streetscapes; Hayley Brigitte Augoustides must sign the application form too	EJV
14.28	Erf 72568, 70 A Woodley Road, Plumstead, S34 - Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24020907EJV0523 INCOMPLETE APPLICATION Correct application form; title deed doesn't name either of the owners listed on the application form; confirmation as to status of work; additional photographs; SG Diagram; municipality comment	EJV
14.29	Erf 85882, 1 Karper Street, Lakeside, S34 - Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24050203EJV0523 INCOMPLETE APPLICATION Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society comment	EJV
14.30	Erven 3075; 3078; 20000, New Eskdale Street, Paarl, S38(8) - NID Case No: HWC24040303EJV0408 INCOMPLETE APPLICATION company or trust resolutions	EJV
14.31	Erf 20262, 14 Rue de Jacqueline, Somerset West, S34 – Minor Works Case No: HWC24032502EJV0528 Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.	

DISCUSSION

- Work started under previous permit HWC20063004ND701E issued in July 2020 but has been completed once the permit lapsed and deviations have occurred. The unauthorised work includes the replacement of certain doors and windows on an outbuilding not older than 60 years.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Work has been completed.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. The full extent of the unauthorised work completed needs to be clearly indicated on the plans, either indicated in red or clouded in red as is typical of a rider or as-built plans. The plans provided, ssw20262 06300 Revision 01 sheets 1 to 3, refer to omitted works, works completed, and work in the future tense as if not yet complete. HWC would like to request as-built plans clearly indicating the unauthorised work completed.
2. Any work yet to be undertaken needs to be clarified and clearly indicated on the plans in colour, if proposed work is indeed being planned.
3. The extent of the heritage resource needs to be clearly communicated. HWC would like to be informed as to exactly which fabric on the property is older than 60 years.

EJV

14.32 Erf 249, 1 King Street, Stanford, S31 - Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24052801EJV0528

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Owner to sign the form or the PoA; application says 1 Quick Street instead of 1 King Street; streetscapes; SHC comment; locality map

EJV

14.33 Erf 53334, 49 Second Avenue, Harfield Village, S34 - Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24060604EJV0528

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

coloured-up plan; SG diagram; photographs; consultation comments

EJV

14.34 Portion of Erf 34687, 93 Beach Road; Portion of Erf Rem-1142, 1 Main Road; and Erf 34689: 77 Beach Road, Strand, S38(8) - HIA Case No: HWC23032306AM0324

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

Ms Emmylou Bailey was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The following is an HIA prepared by Emmylou Rabe Bailey of Hearth Heritage with specific desktop AIA (Emmylou Rabe Bailey) and a Townscape Study (Claire Abrahamse) for a proposed 11 977m² development of a more formalised and user-friendly beachside marketplace requiring resurfacing, lightweight structures for trade, landscaping, and a potential seawall barrier. The site is currently public open land being used for parking, public transport, general business and public amenities first developed in 1953 and most recent construction occurring in 2017 (repaving, reconcreting) without HWC approval. The desktop AIA noted archaeological visibility on site to be nearly zero due to the paving and concreting of the site, but reported on previous archaeological surveys (accessed on SAHRIS, the HWC database, and the Hearth Heritage

database as well as online journal repositories, although the area has not been subject to many academic studies) in the area that identified historic features such as the jetty and boat launch graded IIIB and IIIC respectively on site, and stone age shell middens off-site. The AIA concluded that there was no evidence to suggest in situ archaeological or palaeontological cultural resources are still present. Additionally, the anticipated negative impact of the proposed development on the archaeological and palaeontological resources is likely to be low due to the limited scale of the development and a history of previous construction and earthworks that would have already disturbed any resources in situ. The Townscape Study analysed and assessed the visual setting and character of the wider site, and situated it as adjacent the proposed Strand HPO thus serving to potentially enhance and buffer this area. It determined that while the site is devoid of any heritage fabric, it does retain a distinctive character including open public space that allows for uninterrupted sea views, the remaining historic markers of the old fishing village such as the jetty, slipway, and ad-hoc fishing market, as well as the contemporary features of the pavillion and a mature gumtree which serve as local landmarks and focal points. The Townscape Study concluded that the proposed development will impact on the townscape elements of the study area, but that the proposed upgrade to the current market area has the potential to improve the visual and social historic links between the beach and the town and alleviate the highly concrete experience of this public space if the recommended elements are incorporated into the scheme. The study also concluded in response to consultation comments that historic access to the beach and sea by the fishermen must be maintained and supported by any future development in the area, including providing exclusive parking to the fishermen. The trading area should not impact negatively on their ability to carry out fishing activities. This should be prerequisite for any future development on the site. And the site design and upgrade must compliment the history of the sea shore and story of place by including a broader design which considers the historic Strand Jetty and improved landscaping

HELD OVER:

Referred to IACom on 20 June 2024.

EJV

**14.35 Erf 10857, 60 Main Road, Fishhoek, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24052740CSI0527**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Work applied for has not started
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Deviation of a previously approved plan for internal alterations only
- CoCT have provided comment and support the application

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Clarity if the work on previous permit started and if the deviations have been completed as per the previous permit issued.

CSI

**14.36 Erf 1177, 49 Buxton Avenue, Oranjezicht, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23101603CSI0527**

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

Ms Ursula Rigby was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Work applied for has not started
- Building is graded IIIB and within an HPO
- Proposed work is for internal and external alterations and additions including a metal street facing verandah extension
- CoCT and CIBRA do not support the application and have requested for amendments to the plans.
- The applicant stated in an email that “initial comments obtained from the CoCT and CIBRA were taken into consideration in the design refinement and development process which complies with this reports Heritage Design Indicators. Thereafter, the Rev 5 set of drawings was recirculated to the CoCT and CIBRA. The updated comments from the CoCT and CIBRA were not fully supportive of the Rev 5 proposal. We have responded to the updated comments in Sections 9e and 9f of the heritage report (pg.s 41 and 42).The Architect and Owner have elected to proceed to HWC for a decision regarding the development proposal.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 27 June 2024.

CSI

14.37 Erf 157, Strandstraat, Jongensfontein
Case No: CSI0527

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

S34 application form and proof of payment

CSI

14.38 Erf 165443, 21 Sussex Street, Woodstock, S34 - Additions, Alterations, & Restoration
Case No: HWC24052704CSI0527

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Comment from CoCT required

CSI

14.39 Erf 21749, 25 Sixteenth Street, Kensington, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24052705CSI0527

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Comment from CoCT regarding amended plans, streetscape photographs, signed PoA

CSI

14.40 Erf 270, 14 Keerom Street, Robertson, S34 - Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24052708CSI0528

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Company resolution required and a plan that shows work that has already been undertaken and work that is yet to be undertaken

CSI

14.41 Erf 2732, West Coast Road, Yzerfontein, S38(8) - HIA
Case No: HWC24040912CSI0527

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

Mr Jonathan Kaplan was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed development:
Proposed development is a housing development which will be further subdivided into 42 erven

containing brick and mortar structures across 3 hectares.

- **NID summary:**
The potential archaeological resources noted in the NID consisted of shell middens, pottery, and stone tools based on previous studies conducted in Yzerfontein. The potential paeleo resources were noted in the NID and the area where the proposed development is to be built is known for having a high fossil density.
- **Archaeological findings:**
A walk down survey was conducted and there were no notable archaeological resources or evidence of early human occupation found on the surface level. There is no evidence of human remains or burials. The site was thus given an archaeological grading of IIIC/NCW by the heritage practitioner. The anticipated impact of digging deeper than surface level, however, is significant as various archaeological studies have been conducted in Yzerfontein and resources such as stone tools, ostrich eggshell beads, pottery, and faunal remains have been found.
- **Palaeontological findings:**
Pether conducted a desktop PIA in which he states that the project area is situated on Springfontyn Fm. coversands beneath of which are the calcreted Langebaan Fm. aeolian sands which overlie deposits of the Velddrif Formation. The latter may involve all or part of a sequence comprised of lower beach or shoreface shelly gravels, succeeded by lagoonal deposits and topped by recent pan deposits. The palaeontological sensitivity of the Springfontyn Fm. coversands is overall low, The palaeontological sensitivity of the Velddrif Fm. Is not classified (left clear) by the SAHRIS Palaeo Map, but in open-coast setting may be rated as low due to the dominance of extant shell species, while in sheltered settings may be rated moderate. The calcreted Langebaan Formation is classified to be of VERY HIGH sensitivity, due to previous fossil finds of significant scientific value, such as the fossils occurring on naturally exposed deflating palaeosurfaces, in quarries and in ancient hyaena lairs.
- **Cultural landscape:**
Regarding the cultural landscape, the housing development in Yzerfontein is rapidly increasing thus bringing more commercial and retail development to the area. The Rooipan and wetland vlei to the north of the development area acts as a natural buffer to any further development. A small salt mine is also located nearby.
- **Local Consultation:**
The commenting period for consultation is still open.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Commenting period will need to be concluded.

CSI

- 14.42 Erf 4453, 22 Alexander Street, Paarl, S34 - Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24052736CSI0527

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Applicant to clarify whether work has been completed as per Paarl 300 comment

CSI

- 14.43 Erf 64171, 28 Summerley Road, Kenilworth, S34 - Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24052702CSI0527

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Work applied for has not started
- Graded IIIB
- Within proposed Kenilworth HPO
- Proposed work is for a new boundary wall, pergola, and roll up entrance gate
- CoCT have provided comment and support the application

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

- 14.44 Erf 95622, 14 Hope Street, Gardens, S34 A&A - Minor Works**
Case No: HWC24052730CSI0528

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

New application form, comment from CoCT and CIBRA as this is an aesthetic change, streetscape and internal photographs

CSI

- 14.45 Erf 304, 2770, 3465, 1282, 3476, and 3465, 24 Dirkie Uys Street and 24-28 Akademie Street Franschhoek, S34 – Emergency, Total Demolition, and Partial Demolition**
Case No: HWC24052703CSI0527

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed work is for the removal of the remaining culverts and the replacement of the removed culverts.
- The engineers report states that due to the emergency nature of the repairs, the report does not include any historical or heritage analysis
- The design of the new culverts is for a like-for-like replacement being implemented except in respect to the opening size of the culvert. The opening size has been increased as much as practically possible to reduce the possibility of another culvert failure during flooding and to reduce flooding on surrounding properties.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

POA required - once received a decision will be taken via email.

CSI

- 14.46 Erf 11196, 16 Hof Street, Bellville, S34-Total Demolition**
Case No: HWC24052729CN0528

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape photos required.

CN

- 14.47 Erf 117628-RE, 35 Dixon Street, Cape Town City Centre, S34-Minor Works**
Case No: HWC24052707CN0528

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal was for internal alterations to all 3 storeys, and a covered balcony on the roof.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Work has been completed.
- DWCA supports the proposal.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CN

- 14.48 Erf 15612, 8 Coleridge Road, Salt River, S34-Additions, Alterations & Partial Demolition**
Case No: HWC24051502CN0524

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape photos, CoCT comments and confirmation if work has started.

CN

- 14.49 Erf 158154, 6 Loader Street, Cape Town City Centre, S34-Minor Works**
Case No: HWC24052706CN0528

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal was for internal alterations and a new mezzanine floor.
- CoCT supports.
- DWCA supports the proposal.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CN

- 14.50 Erf 167951, 71 Tobruk Road, Plumstead, S34-Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24052108CN0524

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape photos required.

CN

- 14.51 Erf 172278, 4 Camp Road, Maitland, S34-Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24052008CN0524

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for was for the addition of a 1st and 2nd storey.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CN

14.52 Erf 26682, 7 De Houtman Street, Belrail, Bellville, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24052715CN0524

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for an enclosed porch, a covered patio and domestic quarters.
- CoCT only states that an application is required to be submitted to HWC.
- Recommendation is for approval.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.53 Erf 342, 6 Bayview Terrace, Green Point, S34-Minor Works
Case No: CN0524

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

POP, Company Resolution, POA required.

CN

14.54 Erf 65238-RE, 109 Rosmead Avenue, Kenilworth Racecourse, Kenilworth, S34-MW
Case No: HWC24051504CN0527

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje

Ms Claire Abrahamse was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is to remove the internal walls below the Grandstand that currently delineate service spaces, storage spaces and tote desks where bets can be placed. The proposal is to initially “white box” the space, comprising the ground floor area below the stand, and later have it fitted out to incorporate a children’s play area in the c1982 extension. The façade facing the racecourse will be glazed at the children’s play area, and the current bleachers removed to create a paved forecourt to the racecourse.
- New restaurants/retail spaces as well as a space for tote machines and a mezzanine area is proposed within the central section of the stand (presumably with fabric dating to c1953). However, the historical analysis in Section 4 of this report indicates that even here, much of the fabric was likely altered in the 1980s. A restaurant is planned to be incorporated into the 3rd floor area of the c1988 extension. The City of Cape Town grade the building IIIC due to its typology, and Snelling and Bailey graded the structure NCW in their 2015 Phase 1 HIA, which has been endorsed by HWC.
- CoCT supports
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.55 Erf 90056, 1 Behr Road, Kalk Bay, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC23112417CN0524

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Completed application form, internal & streetscape photos, and motivation required.

CN

14.56 Erf 96717, 19 Harrow Road, Rondebosch, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24060523CN0528

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for changes to doors and windows, raising the boundary wall, and maintenance and repairs to the house. The braai room does not trigger the NHRA.
- Recommendation is for a Section 51 letter to be issued.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CN

14.57 Erven 381, 384-RE, 385 and Portion of 386-RE, 2 & 4 Mill Street, Oranjezicht, S38(4)-HIA
Case No: HWC23042606CN0530

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the item on behalf of Ms Corne Nortje

DISCUSSION

- The proposed redevelopment of the Lenox complex in Cape Town supports the repair and rehabilitation of the Lenox and Lincoln House buildings to convert them into a 47-room boutique hotel with associated facilities and an Artists Residency. The contemporary architectural insertions are intended to complement the unique narrative of the Lenox complex within the Gardens area.
- The heritage resources identified include:
 - The Lenox and Lincoln House buildings, which hold high visual prominence and are good examples of their architectural types, with Lincoln House graded IIIA and the Lenox graded IIIB.
 - The site's association with the historic Gortmolen estate and its archaeological significance, with remnant walling holding age, associational and technological significance.
 - The site's moderate local social significance as one of the last remaining residential hotel establishments in Cape Town
 - The complex's contribution to the Upper Orange and Mill Street streetscapes and its landmark status within the surrounding heritage-sensitive context
 - The HIA anticipates that the redevelopment will retain the Lenox site's landmark significance, add a contemporary layer to its history as a residential hotel, and showcase its earlier history through the retention and interpretation of the historic walling associated with Gortmolen. The tangible archaeological features, particularly the identified sections of historic walls, should be retained in a way that preserves their context and connection to the wider site.
 - The HIA recommends that Heritage Western Cape endorse the report, support the proposed development subject to the implementation of mitigation measures, and approve the demolition and partial demolition of structures older than 60 years on the property.

- **Studies Included:**
 - Architectural Analysis: Assessed the historical and architectural significance of the Lenox complex, including the design informants and heritage indicators.
 - Archaeological Impact Assessment: Evaluated the potential archaeological impacts of the redevelopment and proposed mitigation measures.
 - Townscape and Streetscape Assessment: Analysed the site's context within the Upper Table Valley and its significance within the broader heritage environment.
 - Socio-Historical Study: Explored the social significance of the Lenox complex, including its historical ties to the Gortmolen estate and its role in the development of the Upper Table Valley.
 - Visual Impact Study: Assessed the visual impact of the redevelopment on the surrounding context, concluding that there would be no significant visual impact.
- **Consultation:**
 - One comment was received from CoCT:
 - CoCT commended the extensive historical research and encouraged the acknowledgment and celebration of the site's layered history through interpretation panels, photo displays, and artwork. They endorsed the overall approach and detailed responses to the heritage indicators. They acknowledged some minor loss of historical fabric but supported the restoration of Lincoln House and the detailed architectural specifications. They recommended formal protection for Lincoln House and the Lennox Hotel on the heritage register. They suggested design improvements, including:
 - Improving the link between the Lennox North Wing, Mount Vernon, and Lennox West Wing.
 - Introducing roof dormers. Removing insensitive garage doors and incorporating fenestration that enhances the site and streetscape. Ensuring the roof form of the new building is similar to the south-facing roof form to mitigate its height.
- **Response to Comment by applicant:**
 - The endorsement of the research and assessment of significance was appreciated.
 - The additional design development suggestions were noted, but the wholesale lack of support for the current plans was considered unexpected and confusing. The issues raised were considered subjective and relatively minor to resolve, and it was suggested that they should not preclude approval of the development. The response disagreed with the contention that the plans would compromise the site's significance and contribution to its environs and streetscape.
- **Other Comments:** There were no other comments or objections, including from the City Bowl Residents and Ratepayers Association (CIBRA). It was suggested that minor design development issues would be resolved through conditions imposed on the final plans submitted to Heritage Western Cape (HWC) prior to Final Building Plan submission.
- Graded IIIA & Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO

HELD OVER:

Referred to IACoM on 20 June 2024 for their expertise due to the complexity of the site and due to concerns raised by CoCT.

CN

15. OTHER MATTERS

16. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

EJV moves to adopt and SB seconds the adoption of resolutions and decisions.

17. CLOSURE

12:55

18. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

19 June 2024.

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR: _____

SECRETARY: _____

Annexure A – HWC Heritage Officer Meetings

Abbreviations

APHP - Association of Professional Heritage Practitioners
AHP - Agulhas Heritage Society
BKCA - Bo-Kaap Civic Association
BKYM - Bo-Kaap Youth Movement
CIBRA - City Bowl Ratepayers ' & Residents Association
CoCT – City of Cape Town
CTHT – Cape Town Heritage Trust
CRM - Cultural Resources Management
DRHCA - De Rust Heritage Conservation Association
Docomomo South Africa
DHS -Durbanville Heritage Society
EHM – Environmental Heritage Management department
FoBCA- Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area
FE - Friends of Elim
GLCA- Greater Lynfræ Civic Association
GPRRA - Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association
HVA- Harfield Village Association
HMB - Heritage Mossel Bay
HMTA - Hex Valley Tourism Association
HBRRA - Hout Bay & Ratepayers and Residents Association
HIA - Heritage Impact Assessment
ILASA - Institute for Landscape Architecture in South Africa
KBHA - Kalk Bay Historical Association
KBSJRR - Kalk bay-St James Ratepayers & Residents Association
LKID - Lower Kenilworth Improvement District
MHCS - Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society
NCW – Not Conservation Worthy
NEMA - National Environmental Management Act (No. 107 of 1998)
NID - Notification of Intent to Develop
NCOA - Noetzie Conservancy Owners Association
OH - Oudtshoorn Heritage
Paarl300 Foundation
PRRA - Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association
PACF - Prince Albert Cultural Foundation
SAHRA - South African Heritage Resources Agency
SRHS - Salt River Heritage Society

ASAPA - Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists
ABHC - Associated Bibbeys Hoek Conservancy (Knysna)
BELCOM - Built Environment and Landscapes Committee
CBCRA -Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association
CSDBOA - Clifton-On-Sea & District Bungalow Owners Association
CTHF - Cape Town Heritage Foundation
CRRA - Constantia Ratepayers & Residents Associations
CMP – Conservation Management Plan
DWCA - De Waterkant Civic Association
DHF - Drakenstein of Heritage Foundation
EMPr - Environmental Management Program
FHRA -Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayer Association
FoCVGB - Friends of Constantia Valley Green Belts
GBRM - Great Brak River Museum
GVHAG- Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group
GCS - Greyton Conservation Society
HRF - Helderberg Renaissance Foundation
HOMs - Heritage Officers Meeting
HPO – Heritage protects overlay.

HWC – Heritage Western Cape
IACom - Impact Assessment Committee
IGIC - Inventories, Gradings and Interpretations Committee
KHS - Kommetjie Heritage Society
MGHS - McGregor Heritage Society
NHC - Napier Heritage & Conservation
NASDB - Nelspoort Agency of Sustainable Development body
NHRA - National Heritage Resources Act (No. 25) of 1999
NRA - Newlands Residents Association
OCA - Observatory Civic Association
OHAC - Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee
PPP - Public Participation Process
PHCT - Pniel Heritage and Cultural Trust
RMCA - Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee
SAHRIS - South African Heritage Resources Information System
SPFA - Sea Point for All Group

SFB - Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association

SvDSF - Simon van der Stel Foundation Cape Town

STHS - Simon's Town Historical Society

SHF - Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation

SHCT - Stillbaai Heritage Conservation Trust

GHT - George Heritage Trust

RVRA - Rustenburg Valley Residents Association

TRHCS - Touws River Heritage and Conservation Society

VASSA - Vernacular Architecture Society of South Africa

WUECAG - Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group

WCAC - West Coast Aboriginal Council

WAAC - Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee

WHCS - Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society

WRRRA - Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association

SHC - Stanford Conservation Trust & Stanford Heritage Committee

SIG - Stellenbosch Interest Group

SHA - Swellendam Heritage Association

OWVS - Old Wynberg Village Society

TVHF - Tulbagh Valley Heritage Foundation

UCRRA - Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association

WERRA - Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association

Ward 2 Forum

WCC - Whale Coast Conservation

WRA - Woodstock Residents Association

WECA - Wynberg East Civic Association

APPROVED