

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Monday, 9 September 2024 at 08:30,
via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Ms. Chane Herman officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms. Chane Herman (CH)	(Chairperson)
Ms. Corne Nortje (CN)	(Heritage Officer)
Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport (SB)	(Specialist Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chiara Singh (CSI)	(Heritage Officer)
Emily Jane Vowles (EJV)	(Heritage Officer)
Mr Ruan Brand (RB)	(Specialist Heritage Officer)
Ms. Xola Mlwandle (XM)	(Heritage Officer)

Staff

Ms. Aneeqah Brown (AB)	(Secretariat)
Ms. Waseefa Dhansay (WD)	(Assistant Director: Professional Services)
Mr. Olwethu Dlova (OD)	(Admin)

Legal Advisor

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)	(Deputy Director: Legal)
-------------------------	--------------------------

Observers

None

Visitors

Mr. Stuart Hermansen
Mr. Randall Meyer
Mr. Ron Martin
Ms. Phillipa Duncan
Mr. Ernest Robinson
Ms. Nicolene Visser
Mr. Jan Groenewald
Ms. Anja
Ms. Claire Abrahamse
Mr. Gideon Malherbe

3. Apologies

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Ms. Colette Scheermeyer (CS)

Absent

None

4. Acceptance of the Code of Conduct

Members and staff raised hands in the MS Teams platform to indicate acceptance of the Code of Conduct.

5. Approval of Agenda

9 September 2024. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits. CSI moves to adopt the agenda and CN seconds.

6. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

6.1. 2 September 2024. Held over

7. Disclosure of conflict of interest

None.

8. Confidential matters

None.

9. Standing Items

9.1. Site inspections undertaken.

9.1.1 Erf 1195, 275 Beach Road, Pleasant Way, Sea Point (SJ/SB)

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 3 September 2024.

9.1.2 Erf 2806, 16 Church Street, Tulbagh (CN)

- The Committee notes the site inspection was undertaken on 5 September 2024.
- Stop works order issued to owner.

9.1.3 Erf 789, 13 Klinker Street, Mamre (CH)

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 5 September 2024.

9.1.4 Erf 48, 43 Church Street Tulbagh (CH)

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 5 September 2024.
- Stop works order issued to an employee as the owner was not present on site.

9.1.5 Erf 1586, Corner of Main Road and van der Lingen Street, Paarl – Toringkerk (CN)

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 5 September 2024.
- Stop works order issued to contractor on site.

9.1.6 Erven 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9,10, 11, 12, 14, Matjiesfontein farm 13/148, Matjiesfontein, Laingsburg (SB)

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 4 and 5 September 2024.

9.1.7 Erf 88651, 2 Quarterdeck Road, Kalk Bay (CSI)

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 29 August 2024.
- The Committee is in agreement with the recommendations.
- Section 34 application with a heritage statement.

9.1.8 Erf 887, 3 Rawson Street, Montagu (CSI)

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 4 September 2024.
- Stop works was issued directly to the owner.

9.1.9 Erf 912-RE, 55 Long Street, Montagu (CSI)

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 4 September 2024.
- Section 27 application to be submitted to be HWC

9.2. Proposed Site Inspection

9.3. Site Inspection Reports

9.3.1 Erf 1195, 275 Beach Road, Pleasant Way, Sea Point (SJ/SB)

- The Committee notes the site inspection report.

9.3.2 Erven 737, 739, 9564, 9563, corner of Buitengracht Street, Riebeeck Street, Waterkant Street, Cape Town (SB)

- 9.3.3 Erf 88651, 2 Quarterdeck Road, Kalk Bay (CSI)
- 9.3.4 Erf 887, 3 Rawson Street, Montagu (CSI)
- 9.3.5 Erf 912-RE, 55 Long Street, Montagu (CSI)
- 9.3.6 Erf 789, 13 Klinker Street, Mamre (CH)
 - Held over to 19 September 2024

9.4. Preparation for upcoming Committee meetings

Appeals 11 September 2024

9.5. Tribunal updates (Legal)

PM gave a report back

9.6. Interim and Close out Reports

- 9.6.1 Erf RE/754, 8 Cheviot Place, Green Point, Cape Town (SB)
 - The Committee endorses the close out report.

9.7. Incomplete Applications

13.5, 13.7, 13.19, 14.1, 14.2, 14.3, 14.4, 14.5, 14.6, 14.7, 14.8, 14.10, 14.14, 14.16, 14.19, 14.22, 14.23, 14.25, 14.28, 14.30, 14.31, 14.33, 14.34, 14.38, 14.42, 14.44, 14.45, 14.46, 14.47, 14.48, 14.49, 14.50, 14.51, 14.55, 14.56

9.8. Archaeological Matters

None.

9.9. Illegal Works Database (Stop works orders)

- 9.9.1 Erf 2806, 16 Church Street, Tulbagh (CN)
- 9.9.2 Erf 48, 43 Church Street Tulbagh (CH)
- 9.9.3 Erf 1586, Corner of Main Road and van der Lingen Street, Paarl – Toringkerk (CN)
- 9.9.4 Erf 88651, 2 Quarterdeck Road, Kalk Bay (CSI)
- 9.9.5 Erf 887, 3 Rawson Street, Montagu (CSI)
- 9.9.6 Erf 912-RE, 55 Long Street, Montagu (CSI)

9.10. Permit deadline

10 September @ 11:00

10. Administrative Matters

- 10.1 Farm 744-Re, Rose Garden, Vergelegen Estate, Lourensford Road, Somerset West (HWC24041609SJ0423)
 - Referred to BELCom on 18 September 2024.

11. Monitoring by practitioner

None

12. Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

13. MATTERS ARISING

- 13.1 Erf 1041, 35 Camp Road, Pinelands, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24083001XM0819

Ms. Xola Mlwandle introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received 26 and 30 August 2024 and 3 September 2024.
- The proposal is for the regularisation of illegal work, labelled as two freestanding 'verandas' to the rear on western boundary; a pergola on eastern boundary; a double carport to the front, positioned 875mm from street boundary. It further includes an extension to the building (dining room), a veranda extension to the rear of the house as well as a double garage/carport structure along the western boundary.
- CoCT supports subject to conditions: planting of sizeable new trees as mitigation of impacts on streetscape.
- Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association objects

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to request further requirements:

1. Applicant to respond to the objection received from PRRA.
2. All parties to be invited to the meeting once the response is received.

XM

13.2 Erf 66102, 1 Waterloo Road, Wynberg, S34-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24081507XM0819

Ms. Xola Mlwandle introduced the item.

Ms. Stuart Hermansen and Ms. Phillipa Duncan were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received 2 September 2024
- The proposed work to the Victorian house is summarised as follows:
 - Refurbishing the existing kitchen, including enlarging an existing doorway to the rear extension.
 - Remodelling the existing guest wc [essentially changing the door position].
 - Remodelling the existing bathroom [including inserting a new door to the bedroom].
 - Altering the existing dressing room including enlarging an existing opening from the bedroom.
 - Converting an existing small bedroom to a bathroom.
- Work has started
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO (inside proposed HPO)
- CoCT has no objection to HWC issuing a section 51/section 34 Permit and support the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to request further requirements:

1. The Committee requires the resubmission of the plans clearly annotating what work has stated.

XM

13.3 Erf 29360, 16 Twickenham Road, Mowbray, S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC24081924XM0820

Ms. Xola Mlwandle introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information on 5 September 2024.
- The proposal is for minor alterations to the existing structure. The internal passage cupboard to be converted and used as a second WC room for the house without having to build on or change the footprint of the house. Replacing the external door to the bathroom with a window so that one does not have to walk outside the SQ room to get to the bathroom.
- Work has not started
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

XM

13.4 Erf 1820, 19 Bellevue Road, Sea Point, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24080106XM0823

Ms. Xola Mlwandle introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information on 4 September 2024.
- Work has not started
- Proposed bathroom addition to increase their dressing and en-suite area. Extension of the existing dressing/en-suite forward by approx. 3.4m and in line with the existing structure.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports
- SFA did not provide a comment within 30 days
- SFB has no objection

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

XM

13.5 Erf 71230, 16 Garden Street, Plumstead, S34- Minor Works Case No: HWC24080622XM0815

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Plan indicating work that has started and work still needs to be completed.

XM

13.6 Erf 94438, 24 Kloof Street, Gardens, S34-Minor Works Case No: HWC24081911XM0819

Ms. Xola Mlwandle introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information on 4 September 2024.
- The proposal is for A new timber deck in front of the building to match the entrance height of 600mm with steel balustrades and a disabled ramp or alternative method to accommodate wheelchair access. Internal minor alteration and addition will be done to rearrange the toilet layout to accommodate a disabled ablution. The building will be used as a cannabis shop, no work is proposed on the front façade of the building.
- Work has not started
- CIBRA supports the proposal

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to request further requirements:

1. Applicant to submit drawings indicating work has started and work that must still be completed.

XM

13.7 Erf 66582, 37 Corner Main Road & Church Street, Wynberg, S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC24081540XM0820

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Company resolution

XM

13.8 Multiple Erven, 'Block 30' (CCT Masterplan), 21-29 Mechau Street, Cape Town, S38(4)-HIA

Case No: HWC23060204SJ0822

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item on behalf of Ms. Sneha Jhupsee.

DISCUSSION

- 'Block 30' is a site within the City of Cape Town (CCT) Foreshore Gateway Urban Design Framework.
- Proposal is for a multi-level building that will accommodate retail and residential, and potentially vehicular parking (the inclusion of the parking depends on the preferred design option).
- Three design options have been developed that explore the full, partial or non-retention of the existing building.
- The existing building is utilized as a pub and restaurant and named Fireman's Arms.
- The three design options explored:
 - 1: Proposed multi-level building, retain the entire existing building, and do not provide parking.
 - 2: Proposed multi-level building, partially retain the existing historic building, and provide parking (PREFERRED OPTION - NID)
 - 3: Proposed multi-level building, demolish existing building and accommodate Fireman's Arms use within proposed building, and provide parking.
- Burial grounds are expected (Prestwich)
- Low paleo sensitivity.

REFERRAL

The Committee resolved to refer the application / matter to IACom on 16 September 2024 for further expertise.

SJ

13.9 Erf 25, 48 Boom Street, Elim, S27-Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24080125SJ0717

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item on behalf of Ms. Sneha Jhupsee.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 29 August 2024.
- The work has not started.
- Proposal is to extend the lounge area at the front of the house. The house falls within the transitional zone of Elim (Zone 2).
- Grade II
- The Elim regulations stipulate that house extensions must not alter the character of Elim and should maintain the types of windows, roofs, and doors originally used.
- Cape Agulhas Municipality support with comments:
 - The windows on the new addition remain the same as the existing (in size and material).
 - The Gable roof also retains that uniform look.
- Friends of Elim objected with comments stating that the house has limited historical value as there have been alterations undertaken. The Friends of Elim deem the proposed changes unsympathetic in terms of the Elim Guidelines, and this will negatively affect the front of the house and streetscape.

REFERRAL

The Committee resolved to refer the application / matter to BELCom on 18 September due to the objection received.

SJ

13.10 Erf 1166, 19 Panorama Drive, Somerset West, Somerset West, S34- Deviation Case No: HWC24072217SB0724

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 3 September 2024.
- Previous approval(S51) (HWC2212130MS0213).
- Proposing new timber pergola in place of a steel pergola, Pergola in a different position from previous approval. Garage will not be built, Wine cellar built in an existing space under the previously approved deck, the walls were approved but the doors and windows are new and new Carport.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

SB

13.11 Erf 5789, 34 Jan Van Riebeeck, Wellington, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24072501SB0726

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 3 September 2024.

- Work has not started, proposed extension including deck, carport.
- DHF objects to the scale of proposed addition.
- Drakenstein municipality no objections but not work completed.
- WHF/WES do not support but comment on illegal building work, parking and fire requirements-not heritage comments.
- Unauthorised work is marked on the plans.

REFERRAL

The committee referred the matter to BELCom on 18 September due to the objection received and the response failing to address the unauthorized works on heritage grounds.

SB

13.12 Portion 26 of the Farm Rietvalley Nr 76, Rietvalley, Middelpaas, De Rust, S34-Additions Case No: HWC24080114SB0815

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Work has not started,
- Heritage Oudsthoorn Erfenis Permit committee note as built plans and stamped the plans.
- Oudtshoorn municipality note as built plans,
- The additional info received 29 August 2024

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

SB

13.13 Portion 1 of the Farm Drieheuwels 106, Portion 5 of the Farm Drieheuwels 106, Portion 3 of the Farm Drieheuwels 106, Portion of the Farm Groeneveld 108, Portion 3 of the Farm Groeneveld 108, Portion 1 of Farm 107, Remaining Extent of Farm 107, Portion 11 of the Farm Wegloperheuwel 116, Remaining Extent of the Farm Wegloperheuwel116, Portion 1 of the Farm Grootvlei A 122, Farm Doornfontein A 118, Farm Kruispad 120, Remaining Extent of Farm 1052, Portion 1 of Farm 1052, Portion 1 of Farm 1051 (Velddrif switching), East of R28, Saldanha Bay & Berg River, S38(8)-NID Case No: HWC24071205SB0726

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 2 September 2024.
- Proposed Grid Connection Infrastructure for the Dwarskersbos PV Solar Energy Facility: Velddrif switching Substation to Eskom's Velddrif Substation, Western Cape
- Significant palaeontological resources near the development area include West Coast Fossil Park and others within 5km. Desktop assessments indicate the site is underlain by calcareous aeolianites and calcretes of the Langebaan Formation, with limited fossil presence but high scientific value.
- The proposed development is unlikely to negatively impact significant archaeological resources, including Stone Age artefact scatters and historical structures, during both the development and operational phases.
- Previous assessments in the area have identified only low-density archaeological observations of low significance, with no recommended mitigation measures.
- The broader area has been thoroughly studied, indicating low sensitivity for archaeological heritage impacts, although continued vigilance is advised.

COMMENT

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon. Chance Finds Procedure to be included into the approval

SB

13.14 Erf 1045, 34 Camp Road, Pinelands, S34 - Partial Demolition, Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24071116EJV0712

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 15 and 29 August 2024.
- Considerable renovation of the dwelling to accommodate a new bedroom, garage, ensuite bathroom, domestic quarters and extensions to existing rooms and roof.
- The previous architect had started works which RSA and the current Engineer condemned once brought into contract with the client. This has all been demolished and construction is to start afresh once approval is received.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside Proposed Pinelands HPO
- Work has started
- PRRA stamped the plans with no objection
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Further Requirements of the revised plans indicating the work that has started and the photographic report have been received

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

13.15 Erf 124501, 15 Tarentaal Road, Bridgetown, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24081511EJV0820

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 2 September 2024.
- Extension of the dwelling and addition of a first storey to accommodate new bedrooms, a bathroom, a TV room, and a balcony
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started
- CoCT support

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

13.16 Erf 81431, 91 Durban Road, Wynberg, S34 – Alterations

Case No: HWC24071908EJV0722

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

Ms. Phillippa Duncan was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 2 September.
- Proposal is to move the street facing wall back to accommodate secure parking, installation of a new sliding gate, internal alterations and fireplace re-instating and chimney installation
- Work has not started
- CoCT support with suggestions
- WRRRA did not respond in 30 days
- OWV did not respond in 30 days
- Ms. Duncan advised that the existing sewer line be taken into consideration by the applicants.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

13.17 Erf 1451, Unit 3 Anmar Mansions, Vredehoek, S34- Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24061806CSI0725

Ms. Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on the 22nd of August and 2nd of September 2024.
- Work applied for has not started
- Graded NCW
- Within HPO
- Proposed work is for internal additions and alterations
- CoCT provided comment and support the application

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.18 Erf 17676, 87 Carisle Street, Paarden Eiland, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24080135CSI0819

Ms. Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on the 29th of August 2024
- Work applied for has not started
- Not Graded
- Outside HPO
- Proposed work is for an extension and an additional storey to the second building on the property
- CoCT provided comment and support the application

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.19 Erf 54, 16 Malherbe Street, Klein Brak River, S34 A&A - Partial Demolition

Case No: HWC24062810CSI0702

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

All photographs required.

CSI

13.20 Erf 715, 70 Ladies Mile Service Road, Bergvliet, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24071813CSI0822

Ms. Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on the 30 August 2024.
- Work applied for has not started
- Not Graded
- Outside HPO
- Proposed work is for a first storey extension, new roof, new garage, covered patio and entrance, screen wall and internal alterations
- CoCT provided comment and support the application

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CSI

13.21 Erf 7430, 12 Maree Street, Bellville, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24072220CSI0726

Ms. Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on the 2 September 2024.
- Work applied for has not started
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Proposed work is for additions to the existing dwelling and for a second dwelling
- CoCT provided comment and support the application.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to request further requirements:

1. Applicant to submit drawings indicating work has started and work that must still be completed.

CSI

13.22 Farm 139-RE, Farm 176-RE, Farm 6139-RE, Klipfontein, Driehoeksfontein, Hopeville, Saldhana Bay, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC24072206CSI0821

Ms. Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on the 2 September 2024.
- Proposed development is for a new 90 MWp solar power station/solar farm and associated infrastructure with a proposed location immediately adjacent to the previously approved layout for the 150 MWp Solar PV Power Station on Klipfontein Farm. The aim would be to increase the output from 150 MWp to 240 MWp.
- There are no historical buildings located in the footprint of the proposed development.
- There are no anticipated negative impacts to the cultural landscape.
- In terms of archaeology, a fragment of undecorated pottery and a LSA silcrete flake was recorded during a study conducted by Kaplan in 2021 on Klipfontein. No archaeological resources were recorded in the route for the proposed access road and powerline corridor. There are no noted graves.
- According to a desktop study conducted by John Pether in 2021, the shallow depth of excavation for the development will mainly impact the Springfontyn formation, however, the sensitivity of the coversands deposits can be classified as low

COMMENT

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon. Chance Finds Procedure to be included into the approval

CSI

13.23 Erf 1270, 42 Rose Street, Porterville, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24082011CN0821

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on the 30 August 2024.
- The proposal is for a bedroom and kitchen extension to the rear, internal alterations, as well as a new carport.
- Outside HPO
- HOMs recommends a grading of IIIC
- Bergriver Municipality notes that approval from HWC is required.
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

13.24 Erf 13461-RE, 54 Van Der Riet Street, Oudtshoorn, S34- Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24082101CN0821

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

Mr Ernest Robinson was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on the 4 September 2024.
- The proposal is for the total demolition of the one building on the property.

- Oudtshoorn Municipality supports the recommendations of the Heritage Oudtshoorn Permit Committee
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Heritage Oudtshoorn Permit Committee supports
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

CN

13.25 Erf 1617, 206 Main Road, Somerset West, S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23111403KB1115

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 2 September 2024.
- The proposal is for internal alterations for the food chain Tiger's Milk.
- CoCT states that an application to HWC is required.
- Ungraded
- Outside
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CN

13.26 Erf 2024, 23 Myburgh Street, Somerset West, S34- Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24082113CN0821

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 4 & 5 September 2024.
- The proposal is for an extension to the rear, internal alterations to kitchen and bathroom, as well as changes to window openings.
- CoCT supports
- HRF supports
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

13.27 Erf 454, 106 Kerk Straat, Oudtshoorn, S34- Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24072218CN0814

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 26 August and 4 September 2024.
- The proposal was for a three covered stoeps, a storage, kitchen, study and covered braai area.
- Oudtshoorn Municipality supports the comments by Oudtshoorn Heritage
- Oudtshoorn Heritage notes that they do not condone illegal building work and cannot comment on work already completed.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CN

13.28 Erf 1071, 60 Luyt Street, Hermanus, S34- Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24061102CH0729

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 27 August 2024.
- Proposal is for the addition of a new dormer window (the existing dormer to the south will be replaced with bigger dormer window) and a concrete verandah to the rear of the house.
- Work is complete (as per the correspondence received from the applicant - all work indicated in yellow on the drawings have already been built).
- Not graded outside HPO
- OHAC supports

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CH

13.29 Erf 5349, 1 Viola Road, Parow, S34- Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24081520CH0821

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Outstanding information received on 30 August 2024.
- Proposal is for the addition of two freestanding cottages to the rear and to extend the existing dwelling.
- Work has not started.
- Graded NCW outside HPO
- CoCT supports

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

13.30 Erf 179757, 3 Royal Road, Muizenberg, S34-Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24080131SJ0729

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item on behalf of Ms. Sneha Jhupsee.

Mr. Jan Groenewald was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Further requirements received on 6 September 2024.
- Proposal is for a redesign of the previous unauthorised design that was constructed and has now been demolished due to a lengthy legal process.
- The work has started.
- CoCT EHM supports with conditions related to minor design deviations.
- MHCS has no objection with conditions:
 - Pillars on 2nd storey match pillars on 1st story in specification and profile, will be using existing pillars removed from the western façade to achieve this;
 - Staircase on the southern façade must be contemporary in design and constructed from thin profile, lightweight materials in order to be distinct from, and to not detract from the existing structure.
- Previous case went to Tribunal.
- Previous application background:
 - The application submitted to BELCom was refused in February 2023.
 - Appeals dismissed the appeal in March 2023.
 - MEC Tribunal dismissed the final appeal in October 2023.
 - The applicant's land use application to the City was refused on appeal in December 2023. Thus, the applicant has no approval for the unauthorised work in terms of the NHRA, MPBL or NBR.
 - The existing High Court order (Nov 2021) states that if statutory approvals are not obtained, that all illegal work be demolished in order to bring the building in line with the previously approved plans.
- Appeal Ruling:
 - 137.1 The Appeal is accordingly dismissed.
 - 137.2 The decision of the Heritage Western Cape Appeals Committee held on 8 March 2023 is accordingly upheld and confirmed.
- As per the High Court order, the unauthorised work on the 1st floor have been demolished & remaining precast slab has been waterproofed. An unauthorised parapet was constructed to neaten and protect the concrete which is now the roof of the ground floor.
- The applicant and owners have consulted with Mike Scurr, Philip Smith from the City of Cape Town and the Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society on the new design.
- When the current application was tabled at HOMs on 12 August 2024, the Committee was informed that Tracy Chalmers (neighbour) has not been consulted and was involved in previous application.
- This Committee had further requirements to allow the I&APs who commented on the previous HWC application with additional 15 days to comment on the new design application.
- The Committee noted that the 15 days commenced on 22 August 2024. There was no prescribed list of I&APs for consultation. The I&APs were those included in the previous appeal notice.

REFERRAL

The Committee resolved to refer the application / matter to BELCom on 18 September 2024 due to the complexity of the case.

14. NEW MATTERS

- 14.1 Erf 1038, 187 Beach Road, Bantry Bay, S34 - A&A, Minor Works**
Case No: HWC24082812CSI0830

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

internal photographs, colored and up to scale plan clearly indicating the balcony enclosure, locality map

CSI

- 14.2 Erf 110117,21 Duncan Road, Wynberg, S34 A&A – Minor Works**
Case No: CSI0829

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

PoP, internal and streetscape photographs, SG diagram

CSI

- 14.3 Erf 117945,23 Lower Main Road, Observatory, S34 – Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24082712CSI0829

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Work has already started – this needs to be indicated on the plans to determine how much of the work has been completed, OCA have raised concerns, PoA and company resolution

CSI

- 14.4 Erf 153,41 Camps Bay Drive, Camps Bay, S34 - Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24082209CSI0829

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association comment required, SG diagram

CSI

- 14.5 Erf 24008,284 Voortrekker Road, Maitland, S34 - Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24082713CSI0829

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Additional streetscape, external, and internal photographs of completed/ongoing work. Plans need to indicate how much work has been completed.

CSI

- 14.6 Erf 4762,117 Wiener Street, Goodwood, S34 - Additions & Alterations**
Case No: CSI0829

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

PoP, more internal, external, streetscape photographs, erf needs to be clearly outlined on the locality map, comment from CoCT, up to scale and coloured plans

CSI

- 14.7 Erf 52521,30 St Michaels Road, Claremont, S34 - Additions & Alterations**
Case No: HWC24082208CSI0829

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Additional photographs, SG diagram

CSI

14.8 Erf 325 & 332,39 Regent Road, Sea Point, S34 - Partial Demolition

Case No: HWC24082609CSI0829

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Comment from CoCT, SFA, SFB, external and streetscape photographs, company resolution, PoA stating that Andreas Miliotis has been given permission to apply for the application on the company's behalf.

CSI

14.9 Erf 66713, 66714, 66715, 66716, 66706, 66707, 66708, 66709, 70905, 70906, Vukani Street and Mlambo Street, Khayelitsha, S38(4) - NID

Case No: HWC24040817CSI0830

Ms. Chiara Singh introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposed development will comprise of several three-storey blocks, some of which will provide commercial opportunities at the ground level, with dwelling units above. In total 69 units dwelling units will be provided, a church facility, with a workshop/greenhouse above and communal public place.
- There are no anticipated impacts to historical buildings or the cultural landscape
- There are no known archaeological resources present.
- Palaeo sensitivity on the SAHRIS palaeo map is moderate

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon. Chance Finds Procedure to be included into the approval

CSI

14.10 Erf 122656, 8 Brushwood Road, Bridgetown, S34- Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24082307CN0828

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Streetscape photographs required.

CN

14.11 Erf 166779-RE, 45 (31) Klipfontein Road, Mowbray, S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC24082720CN0828

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal was for internal alterations, shopfitting and signage to the one building on site. Some internal walls have already been demolished. The rest of the work still needs to be completed. Work on site has stopped, as confirmed by the applicant.
- CoCT states that very little historic fabric remains after alterations have been made. Although the proposed work has limited intervention in terms of the associated levels of significance of the resource, HRS suggest that, should HWC authorise the work by means of the required Permit, that a suitably qualified Heritage Architect be appointed, to oversee work with a close out report to the satisfaction of HWC.
- The applicant states in the motivation that a heritage professional will be consulted but there is no proof thereof.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO

- Work has started.

COMMENT

The committee is supportive of the proposed interventions. In order for Heritage Western Cape (HWC) to issue a permit, the following is required:

1. The applicant is to appoint a suitably qualified consultant with the appropriate heritage experience to oversee the proposed work
 2. The appointed consultant must submit a close out report within 30 days of practical completion.
 3. HWC is to be provided with the details of the consultant and their CV confirming suitability to oversee the work
 4. A letter of appointment to be signed by the applicant and consultant
- Once the above has been fulfilled, HWC will provide the required permit.

CN

14.12 Erf 1873, 22 Ringwood Drive, Pinelands, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24082710CN0827

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for a tv room and bedroom extension as well as timber stoep.
- CoCT supports
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.13 Erf 213, 3 Rall Street, Heidelberg, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24081516CN0829

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for extensive alterations and additions to the building.
- Hessequa Municipality supports
- SVDSF supports
- HOMs graded IIIC
- Outside
- Work has not started

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

14.14 Erf 30000, 80 Herbrand Street, Hazendal, S34- Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24070811CN0828

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Streetscape photographs required.

14.15 Erf 4647, 24 Charnwood Avenue, Tokai, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24082718CN0828

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for total demolition of the house.
- CoCT supports
- CRRRA supports
- Graded IIIC
- Outside
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

CN

14.16 Erf 9944,12 6th Avenue Boston, Bellville, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24072523CN0827

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Both owners to sign application form, Locality Plan, all photographs, CoCT comments and SG diagram required.

CN

14.17 Farm 1770-RE, Boekenhoutskloof Winery, Excelsior Road, Franschhoek, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24081506CH0829

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

Ms. Nicolene Visser was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is to reconstruct the roof and structure (the roof will be thatched, hipped with end gables), remark all doors and windows and repairs to the damaged walls (structural cracks and damaged areas to be repaired to match existing).
- Work has not started.
- The homestead was constructed between 1750 and 1780 and was restored/reconstructed in 1994.
- The building was damaged by a fire in June 2024.
- Immediate remedial action was taken to cover the walls and building and collect all ironmongery that could be found. Debris was also cleared on the outside of the building. The interior was cleared, and ironmongery was salvage as far as possible. All openings were propped to ensure the walls do not collapse because of burn-out wooden lintels.
- Detailed drawings have been provided and work will be like-for-like.
- Graded IIIA
- Inside a grade 2 landscape unit.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources on condition that:

1. The work be monitored by a suitably qualified architect with heritage experience.

2. A close-out report must be submitted to HWC within 30 days of practical completion of the work.

In order for Heritage Western Cape (HWC) to issue a permit, the following is required:

1. The applicant is to appoint a suitably qualified consultant with the appropriate heritage experience to oversee the proposed work
2. HWC is to be provided with the details of the consultant and their CV confirming suitability to oversee the work
3. A letter of appointment to be signed by the applicant and consultant

Once the above has been fulfilled, HWC will provide the required permit.

CH

14.18 Erf 14657, 31 Kylemore Road, University Estate, Woodstock, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24082702CH0827

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for internal alterations, alterations to the boundary wall and replacing the staircase in the yard.
- Work has not started.
- CoCT supports.
- WUECAG and WERRA did not comment within 30 days.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

14.19 Erf 157, 7 Carosini Street, Laaiplek, Velddrif, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC24082721CH0828

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Bergrivier Municipality and Velddrif Heritage Foundation comments required.

CH

14.20 Erf 2137, 61 Shortmarket Street, Cape Town, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24081907CH0830

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for internal alterations (bar station, dry walling) and alterations to the facade (windows and door, architectural plaster moulding above ground floor windows and doors to match that of the plaster moulding below the parapet wall).
- The building will operate as a new restaurant/cocktail bar.
- Work has started. This work is indicated in red on the drawings in the 'additional folder' and is limited to internal work.
- This work includes:
 - The installation of 2x drywall partitions.
 - Painting of internal walls.
 - Mechanical ventilation/extraction has started being installed.
 - The bar station & countertop have been set out on site, and its various components are

- currently being manufactured off site.
- New plumbing lines have been installed.
- New scullery sink has been installed & connected.
- The work to the facade must still be completed.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports with recommendations:
 - Appropriate paint colours be considered to visually unify the upper and lower portions of the building while satisfying the practical requirements as noted in the motivation. As the street is quite narrow and often shaded it is also recommended that paint shades are not too dark.
 - It is not annotated on the plan but is assumed that the new sash window will be timber. This should be conditioned by HWC if the intention to replicate the existing format only and not timber material.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources on condition that:

1. The proposed sash window (W01) on the street façade be timber to match existing.

CH

**14.21 Erf 2576-RE, 1 9th Avenue, Voelklip, Hermanus, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24082704CH0828**

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Application is for deviations from previous approval dated 26 April 2023.
- The deviations include design alterations to the double storey addition, the addition of a swimming pool, raising the boundary wall, internal alterations to the heritage building with the addition of chimneys, alterations to fenestration, alterations to the verandah area.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Work is complete.
- OHAC supports.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

CH

**14.22 Erf 3061, 71 Jordaan Street, Bo-Kaap, S34-Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24082714CH0818**

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Streetscape photographs, photographs of the areas where work is proposed, locality plan and SG diagram.

CH

**14.23 Erf 4319, 7 Nantes Street, Paarl, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24082717CH0828**

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

SG diagram, title deed and applicant to respond to the objections received.

CH

14.24 Erf 5106, 112 St Georges Street, Simons Town, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24071912CH0829

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for internal alterations to create multiple dwelling units, raising the walls to the rear to accommodate windows and enclosing the front balcony with frameless glass stacking doors.
- Work has not started.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports with conditions:
 - The balcony facing St George's Street to be enclosed on all three sides consistently with frameless glass.
 - Due to the significance of the site and sensitivity of existing historical fabric, the work must be monitored by an architect with heritage experience.
- STHS objects to the nutect boarding on the one end of the balcony, however, would support of matching Sash windows on both ends or frameless glass all round.
- The drawings currently show one side of the balcony enclosed with a sash window and another side with a nutec board. The street facing enclosure will be frameless glass.

FURTHER REQUIRMENTS

1. Drawings to be revised omitting the nutec board on the south elevation. Both sides of the balcony are to either be frameless glass or sash windows.

CH

14.25 Erf 562, 12 Orchard Way, Pinelands, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24082904CH0830

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

PRRA comments

CH

14.26 Erf 988, 36 Geneva Drive, Camps Bay, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC24082607CH0827

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is for internal alterations and the addition of timber decks. Alterations are also proposed to windows and doors on the elevations.
- Work has not started.
- Not graded
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

14.27 Erf 11631 and 11632, 292 Albert Road, Woodstock, S34- Additions & Alterations
Case No: HWC24082606CH0827

Ms. Chane Herman introduced the item.

Ms. Claire Abrahamse was present for this item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposal is to demolish the house and garage on site whilst partially retaining the shop and the construction ceramics studio and gallery space. The shopfront and parapet frontage of the existing shop will be retained with the newer additions behind it.
- Work has not started.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Salt River Heritage Society supports and states that the proposal will positively contribute to the existing fabric and offer a contextual precedent for future developments along this road. The new building is set back quite significantly which allows the existing façade to be celebrated.
- WRA supports and agrees with the recommended mitigation that the flat pergola over the shop be set back by 1m. WRA stated that these kinds of creative spaces in a heritage sensitive manner is exactly what is needed in the area.
- WAAC did not comment within 30 days commenting period.
- CoCT does not support the proposal noting that the city does not object to the demolition of the garage. The City states that they can support the redevelopment if it is sympathetic in its architectural design to the fine-grained architectural streetscape and cluster in which the site is situated. The proposal in its current form is over-scaled in comparison to the graded buildings in the immediate context i.e. the neighbouring shop buildings abutting the site and the row of single-storey parapet shop buildings opposite. The proposal introduces a typology that is not in keeping. While a contemporary insertion can be considered it ought to be of lesser height and be less impactful on the shop building so that more of the building footprint gets retained and is legible. Demolishing the house will allow for substantial additional bulk on the site and allow for more of the shop building to be kept so that it is not 'over sailed' by the new building to the extent that is proposed. Should design development be considered, HRS will welcome the opportunity to provide further comment.
- CoCT was invited to attend HOMs on 09.09.24. CoCT official, Ms. Tamar Shemtov, tendered apologies.
- The applicant provided a response to the objection received from the City stating that mitigation measures were considered (as per figure 12A in the heritage report which is to push the front panel down to scale towards the street edge) however the owner would like HWC to consider the design in its current state as it meets the client's specific requirements.
- The character of the HPOZ and typology of the interventions was assessed by the applicant to motivate for the proposed interventions.

With regards to the HPOZ:

The character of Albert Road is intended for protection is a commercial one, rather than residential. The house at 292 Albert Road is therefore, in this context, out of character. The context does include taller structures – indeed, aside from the Shul, the building on the corner of the block to the east is double storey, and there are many other 2 and 3 storey buildings on the opposite side of the road, within the immediate vicinity. Therefore, in terms of height, the building is in fact not taller than the surrounding fabric, if that fabric context is extended to the blocks on each side.

With regards to typology:

Single storey residential buildings are now uncommon along Albert Road, and as a traditional "high street" there are several other typologies that are characteristic of this key urban element. Dewar and Uytendogaardt undertook a thorough analysis of Albert Road in 1997, and the types of buildings they identified as being characteristic of the street are single and double storey, with pedestrian colonnades (ideally) and with deep alcoves off the pavement that create a transition

between passers-by in the size walk zone, and the space of the shop behind. Both the immediate context of the site, and further along Albert Road, double storey, and triple storey, structures are clearly apparent.

- The Committee considered the following:
 - There is a diverse streetscape along Albert Road in terms of building typology.
 - The existing shop front, which contributes to the streetscape significance, will be retained and incorporated into the broader redevelopment.
 - The existing house is not visible from the street and has low heritage significance. The garage has no significance. The Committee is of the opinion that there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention of the house and garage.
 - The redevelopment is set back from the street and does not exceed the height of the Shul (synagogue).
 - The redevelopment is appropriate in its placement and design which would set a positive precedent for adaptive reuse of structures.
 - The redevelopment is supported by the local conservation bodies who have a vested interest in preserving the heritage significance of the area.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

14.28 Erf 117954, 23 Lower Main Road, Observatory, S34 - Additions & Alterations Case No: HWC24082712EJV0828

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Company Resolution allowing A.M. Mohamed to sign obo Mulitan Property Investments; plans to indicate where work has started as internal photographs indicate work as having started; updated OCA comment on the provided plans rather than the Revision 1 plans dated to February 2024

EJV

14.29 Erf 345, 17 Aandbloem Road, Gardens, S34 - Alterations Case No: HWC24071802EJV0830

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Demolition of some internal walls to allow for converted use
- IIIC
- Inside Upper Table Valley HPO
- Work has been completed
- Greater Vredehoek Action Group did not respond in 30 days
- CoCT support

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

EJV

14.30 Erf 450, 74A Waterkant Street, de Waterkant, S34 – Minor Works Case No: HWC24080806EJV0827

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Streetscape photographs

EJV

14.31 Erf 45221, 10 Links Road, Rondebosch, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24082602EJV0827

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Photographs: clarity as to whether the boundary fence is older than 60 years; CoCT comments

EJV

14.32 Erf 47548 ,16 Garton Road, Rondebosch, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24071803EJV0827

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Internal reconfigurations, additions of a patio and a double-storey bedroom wing.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started
- CoCT support

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

14.33 Erf 496, 44 Gilmour Hill Road, Tamboerskloof, S34 – Minor Works

Case No: HWC24090412EJV0828

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

PoP with correct reference number; externals and streetscapes

EJV

14.34 Erf 52959, 23 Sussex Street, Claremont, S34 – Minor Works

Case No: HWC24081905EJV0828

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Both Martin and Kirsten Van De Zee must sign the application form as they are married outside of community of property, streetscapes

EJV

14.35 Erf 614, 1 Forest Road Oranjezicht, S34 - Additions & Alterations

Case No: HWC24082804EJV0830

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

Ms. Anja and Mr. Gideon Malherbe were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Inside Upper Table Valley HPO
- Work has not started
- Extension of the dwelling and coach house, with new first storey, garage and pool.
- CIBRA Support
- CoCT do not support due to: The extension of the garage (coach house) towards the street is not supported. The retaining of the current two single garage doors is encouraged and a pergola suggested in front of the garage doors. In order to accommodate the cars in their current

position in the coach house are the new proposed internal staircase not supported and encouraged to be relocated. The extensive scale of the flat roof addition to the rear of the garage is not supported and it is recommended to be minimised and broken up in scale. This new first floor addition should not be higher than the main house and its roof encouraged to be in keeping with the pitch roof typology of the main house and the coach house. Incorporating dormers, as is associated with historical roofs, could be a way forward. A glass link between the coach house and the new work could be considered but will have to be assessed properly on receiving an amended proposal

- In response to the City's comments: An existing LUMS approval for the extension of the garage is in place. This was taken into consideration with the proposal. There is 3.58m between the current garage and street. Adding a pergola is not possible and out of character for the area. The current garage is 4.96m deep. standard parking depth is 5.5m. Extending the garage is necessary to accommodate parking, whether the internal staircase is relocated or not. A previous HWC permit (15111003KR1111E / 14081803KR0822E) was issued for a 8m high addition on the same footprint. the current proposal is for a 6.6m high addition which does not exceed the height of the single storey house. The first-floor addition is not higher than the main house. Refer to elevations and architects reasoning. notwithstanding personal preference, the proposal does not negatively impact the significance of the heritage resource. A glass/light structure link is proposed. Please refer to the elevations and 3D renders which show the link in great detail.
- All parties were invited to attend HOMs as per correspondence dated to the 3rd of September in the case folder
- Objections are not directly heritage-related but relate more to design preference or a misreading of the provided plans, and have been comprehensively responded to by the applicant

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

14.36 Erf 78758, 130b Main Road, Diep River, S34 – Minor Works Case No: HWC24081534EJV0828

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Existing shop to be divided into two separate units with new unit additions of a storeroom, toilets, passage and kitchenette. Internal brickwork to be built up to the underside of the roof covering for fire protection between the units.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

EJV

14.37 Erf 113213; 17470, Stellenbosch Arterial and Erica Drive, Belhar, S38(8) - NID Case No: HWC24060701EJV0829

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Triggers S38(1)(c)(i). Development of a law enforcement precinct on vacant land including a law enforcement building, traffic impound, disaster risk management mobility centre, K9 unit and SWAT unit with ancillary infrastructure and access roads. The site is surrounded by vacant land,

Belhar residential, and in the vicinity of Cape Town International Airport. In terms of heritage, the SAHRIS palaeo-sensitivity map indicates moderate sensitivity as the site falls within the very northern edge of the Cape Flats Dune Plume which may include Holocene-age fossils of tortoises, mole rats and other fauna that died in the dune body. These are not rare and relate to extant species, and the depth of the building foundations means that the likelihood of intersecting of significant fossils is small. There are no known burials on site but unmarked graves cannot be entirely discounted but also cannot be predicted

- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Dr. Orton recommends no further studies

COMMENT

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon.

EJV

**14.38 Portion 1 of Farm 19, Krugerskop, Merweville, Laingsburg S38(8) - NID
Case No: HWC24082801EJV0828**

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

Paleontological consultation

EJV

**14.39 Portions 19 and 20 of Farm 57, Matroosberg, De Doorns, Worcester, S38(8) – NID
Case No: HWC24061310EJV0828**

Emily Jane Vowles introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Triggers S38(1)(c)(i) and NEMA. The proposal is to clear 9ha of vegetation for the expansion of the vineyard cultivation activities already occurring on site. In terms of heritage, the relative archaeological and cultural heritage sensitivity is low, and palaeontological sensitivity is low.
- Unknown grading and HPO status
- Work has not started
- Marizanne McGregor recommends no further studies

COMMENT

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, as heritage resources will not be impacted upon.

EJV

**14.40 Erf 17201, 13 High Street, Paarl, S34 - Partial Demolition
Case No: HWC24082015**

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The proposal is for the demolition of the annex to the original house as well as the timber deck, which are both in a bad state of repair.
- Graded IIIA
- Drakenstein Municipality has no objections
- Paarl300 has no objections
- DHF has no objections
- Inside Special character area overlay Zone of Paarl

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RB

- 14.41 Erf 2060, Devine Street, Paarl, S34 - Additions & Alteration**
Case No: HWC24082010

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Company's resolution required.

RB

- 14.42 Erf 25595, 6 Polo Road, Observatory, S34 - Additions & Alteration**
Case No: HWC24082610

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Correct SG Diagram, locality plan, building plans showing the changes from the previous plans to the current plans (not in-between), Salt River Heritage Society comment; formal E-mail to confirm whether work has been completed or is in progress still and motivation.

RB

- 14.43 Erf 98358, 1 The Lane, Rondebosch, S34 - Additions & Alteration**
Case No: HWC24082611

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Work was completed in 2007.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO.
- Proposal is for the addition of an entertainment area and bedroom. The owners are seeking to rectify building plans as a result of a previous owner making unapproved additions and alterations (in 2007).
- CoCT supports S51

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. The committee resolved to issue a Section 51 letter, as the proposed work did not negatively impact the heritage resource.

RB

- 14.44 Erf 174, Touwsrivier, S38(8) - 24G**
Case No: HWC24082013

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

SG Diagram, Title deed or deed search, Power of Attorney/Trust Resolution/Company Resolution (pending title deed), signed application form (as per 2/3 above) and clarity on the submitted NID's applicability to the underground tank installation.

RB

- 14.45 Erf 2183, Watergang Farmhouse, Luyolo Road, Kayamandi, Stellenbosch, S34 –
Alteration & Restoration (Emergency Indication)**
Case No: (TBC)RB026

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION

Emergency application is not motivated by an emergency heritage concern, POP, Consultation with Stellenbosch Interest Group & Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation.

- RB**
- 14.46 Erf 13601, 21 La Belle Road, Stikland, Bellville, S38(8)**
Case No: RB026
- OUTSTANDING INFORMATION**
 POP
- RB**
- 14.47 Erf 159 10 Voortrekker Street, Laaipek, Velddrift, S34-Total Demolition**
Case No: HWC24082722SB0828
- OUTSTANDING INFORMATION**
 Conservation body and municipal comments outstanding
- SB**
- 14.48 Erf 180 21 Clinic Street, Pacaltsdorp, George, S38(4)-NID**
Case No: HWC24061807SB0828
- OUTSTANDING INFORMATION**
 No indication who made the recommendation (revised application form), Title Deed and SG diagram
- SB**
- 14.49 Erf 580 29 Hod Street, Piketberg, S34-Restoration, Additions & Alteration**
Case No: HWC24081934SB0830
- OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:**
 Internal photographs, streetscape, comments from conservation bodies and municipality (current comment is further reequipment email). Confirmation if the work has start and the percentage completed, this must reflect on the plans.
- SB**
- 14.50 Erf 722 33 Oxford Street, Durbanville, S34-Minor Work**
Case No: HWC24080605SB0827
- OUTSTANDING INFORMATION**
 City of Cape Heritage Comment, internal photographs, SG Diagrams.
- SB**
- 14.51 Erf 1012, Apartment 7, Arthur's Seat Mansions Sea Point, S34-Minor Work**
Case No: HWC24080607SB0828
- OUTSTANDING INFORMATION**
 Streetscape photographs and SG Diagram
- SB**
- 14.52 Erf 3546, 12 Almond Close, Tokai, S34-Additions & Alteration**
Case No: HWC24082807SB0830

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Work has started but not complete
- Proposed timber deck, new built in braai and new boundary wall.
- CoCT supports and stamped the plans.
- Graded NCW.

- Outside HPO
- CRRRA stated that property is outside their boundaries.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to request further requirements:

1. Applicant to submit drawings indicating work has started and work that must still be completed.

SB

14.53 Erf 39979, Lancerac Crescent, Belhar ext 16, Belville, S27-Subdivision Case No: SB0828

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION:

NID application form.

SB

14.54 Erf 2248-RE, 42A Long Street, Cape Town, CBD, S34-Minor Works Case No: HWC24090406SB0904

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

Mr. Ron Martin was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works, some work started but been stopped.
- Completed work included:
 - Plumbing and sanitaryware repairs at first floor level
 - Removal of drywall store and rehabilitation of space (First floor).
 - Restoration of timber floor ceiling
 - Painting
 - Replacement of windowpanes
 - Repairs to plaster, painting finishing
 - Electrical installations, including lighting, plugs and isolators (compliance to CoCT)
 - Repairs to existing tiled and grano floors at ground floor level
 - Repairs to pressed ceilings
 - Stabilising of timber ceiling portion
 - Repairs to windows, doors and shopfronts
 - Repairs to shopfront floors
 - General plaster and paintwork
 - POP has been waived.
 - Gordons Hardware rented the Pakhuis Building annex for 92 years but left in November 2022 due to disputes with the current owner, SASG Trust, regarding the building's condition. Extensive remedial work was needed to make the building habitable and compliant with municipal codes, including plumbing repairs, removal of drywall, restoration of ceilings, painting, window replacement, and electrical installations. In November 2023, an agreement was made to establish the Tevolution Museum in the annex, focusing on visual media technology. The museum's installation will be done sensitively to preserve the heritage structure. An archaeological permit will be sought for any necessary excavations.
 - Graded IIIA

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to request further requirements:

1. Applicant to submit drawings indicating work has started and work that must still be completed.
2. Method statement to be submitted.

SB

14.55 Farm 34, Elsenburg Agricultural College Stellenbosch, S27-Restoration, Additions & Alteration
Case No: HWC24082803SB0828

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION
SG Diagram, streetscape

SB

14.56 Farm 8/40 ,21 Klaasvoogds Farm, Robertson, S34-Restoration & Maintenance
Case No: HWC24071910SB0903

OUTSTANDING INFORMATION
Title deed and streetscape photographs.

SB

15. OTHER MATTERS

16. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

CN moves to adopt and RB seconds the adoption of resolutions and decisions.

17. CLOSURE

18. DATE OF NEXT MEETING – 19 September 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR: _____

SECRETARY: _____

APHP - Association of Professional Heritage Practitioners
AHP - Agulhas Heritage Society
BKCA - Bo-Kaap Civic Association
BKYM - Bo-Kaap Youth Movement
CIBRA - City Bowl Ratepayers' & Residents Association
CoCT – City of Cape Town
CTHT – Cape Town Heritage Trust
CRM - Cultural Resources Management
DRHCA - De Rust Heritage Conservation Association
Docomomo South Africa
DHS -Durbanville Heritage Society
EHM – Environmental Heritage Management department
FoBCA- Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area
FE - Friends of Elim
GLCA- Greater Lynfræ Civic Association
GPRRA - Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association
HVA- Harfield Village Association
HMB - Heritage Mossel Bay
HVTA - Hex Valley Tourism Association
HBRRA - Hout Bay & Ratepayers and Residents Association
HIA - Heritage Impact Assessment
ILASA - Institute for Landscape Architecture in South Africa
KBHA - Kalk Bay Historical Association
KBSJRR - Kalk bay-St James Ratepayers & Residents Association
LKID - Lower Kenilworth Improvement District
MHCS - Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society
NCW – Not Conservation Worthy
NEMA - National Environmental Management Act (No. 107 of 1998)
NID - Notification of Intent to Develop
NCOA - Noetzie Conservancy Owners Association
OH - Oudtshoorn Heritage
Paar1300 Foundation
PRRA - Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association
PACF - Prince Albert Cultural Foundation
SAHRA - South African Heritage Resources Agency
SRHS - Salt River Heritage Society
SFB - Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association
SvDSF - Simon van der Stel Foundation Cape Town
STHS - Simon's Town Historical Society
SHF - Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation
SHCT - Stillbaai Heritage Conservation Trust
GHT - George Heritage Trust
RVRA - Rustenburg Valley Residents Association
TRHCS - Touws River Heritage and Conservation Society
VASSA - Vernacular Architecture Society of South Africa
WUECAG - Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group
WCAC - West Coast Aboriginal Council
WAAC - Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee
WHCS - Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society
WRRRA - Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association

ASAPA - Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists
ABHC - Associated Bibbeys Hoek Conservancy (Knysna)
BELCOM - Built Environment and Landscapes Committee
CBCRA -Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association
CSDBOA - Clifton-On-Sea & District Bungalow Owners Association
CTHF - Cape Town Heritage Foundation
CRRA - Constantia Ratepayers & Residents Associations
CMP – Conservation Management Plan
DWCA - De Waterkant Civic Association
DHF - Drakenstein of Heritage Foundation
EMPr - Environmental Management Program
FHRA -Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayer Association
FoCVGB - Friends of Constantia Valley Green Belts
GBRM - Great Brak River Museum
GVHAG- Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group
GCS - Greyton Conservation Society
HRF - Helderberg Renaissance Foundation
HOMs - Heritage Officers Meeting
HPO – Heritage protects overlay.

HWC – Heritage Western Cape
IACom - Impact Assessment Committee
IGIC - Inventories, Gradings and Interpretations Committee
KHS - Kommetjie Heritage Society
MGHS - McGregor Heritage Society
NHC - Napier Heritage & Conservation
NASDB - Nelspoort Agency of Sustainable Development body
NHRA - National Heritage Resources Act (No. 25) of 1999
NRA - Newlands Residents Association
OCA - Observatory Civic Association
OHAC - Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee
PPP - Public Participation Process
PHCT - Pniel Heritage and Cultural Trust
RMCA - Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee
SAHRIS - South African Heritage Resources Information System
SPFA - Sea Point for All Group

SHC - Stanford Conservation Trust & Stanford Heritage Committee
SIG - Stellenbosch Interest Group
SHA - Swellendam Heritage Association
OWVS - Old Wynberg Village Society
TVHF - Tulbagh Valley Heritage Foundation
UCRRA- Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association
WERRA - Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association
Ward 2 Forum
WCC- Whale Coast Conservation
WRA - Woodstock Residents Association
WECA - Wynberg East Civic Association