

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Monday, 21st August at 08:30,
Via MS Teams**



1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Ms Sneha Jhupsee officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Members of Committee

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt-Delport (SB) (Heritage Officer)
Ms. Corne Nortje (CN) (Heritage Officer)
Ms. Ayanda Mdludlu (AM) (Heritage Officer)
Ms. Muneerah Solomon (MS) (Heritage Officer)
Ms. Sneha Jhupsee (SJ) (Heritage Officer)
Mr. Robin George (RG) (Heritage Officer)
Ms. Khanyisile Bonile (KB) (Heritage Officer)
Ms. Chane Herman (CH) (Heritage Officer)

Members of Staff

Ms. Xola Mwandle (XM) (Secretary)
Ms. Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT) (Secretary)
Mr. Reagon Fortune (RF) (Admin)

Legal Advisor

Ms. Naushina Rahim

Visitors

Mr. Rick Molton
Prof. Walter Peters
Ms. Jone Kros

Observers

3. Apologies

Ms. Penny Meyer

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 21st August 2023. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits and Additions MS moves to adopt the agenda and AM seconds.

5. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

5.1 11th and the 14th of August 2023. Held over to next HOMs meeting

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest

None

7. Confidential matters

None

8. Standing Items

None

8.1 Site Inspections undertaken

8.1.1 Erven 96233 & 96234, 7 Glynnville Terrace, Gardens: Section 27 (HWC23080112SJ0808)

- Inspection undertaken on 15 August 2023
- Mr Dennis Belter requested to undertake a site inspection due to structural concerns.

8.2 Proposed Site Inspection

8.3 Site Inspection Reports

8.4 Preparation for upcoming Committee meetings

IACOM - 23 August

Council - 25 August

8.5 Interim and Close out Reports

8.6 Incomplete Applications

8.7 Archaeological Matters

8.7.1 Erf 5571, 8 23rd Street, Shelly Point Estate, St Helena Bay

- No date has been set for the cleansing ceremony; the committee resolved that a site inspection is required to determine the state of the human remains.

8.7.2 Erf 8209 (Ptn of Erf 3460), Small Craft Harbour, Port Captains Office, Saldanha Bay

- Date for the cleansing ceremony has been confirmed for the 30 August 2023.

8.7.3 Britannia Reef, St Helena Bay

- Human remains were uncovered during trenching and work has been stopped on site. An archaeologist has been appointed to submit the application to HWC.
- It was noted that the human remains are heavily disturbed and out of context.

8.8 Illegal Works Database (Stop works order)

8.8.1 Erf 1928, 11 Manor Avenue, Bergvliet (PHS) (CN)

To be investigated.

9. Administrative Matters

9.1 Erf 196-Re, 40 Church Street, Tulbagh: Monitoring practitioner appointment (HWC23071104SJ0718)

- The committee endorsed the appointment of Henry Aikman to monitor the proposed work.

9.2 Erf 63653, 26 Valley Road, Kenilworth: Monitoring practitioner appointment (HWC23072008SJ0726)

- The committee endorsed the appointment of Bridget O'Donoghue to monitor the proposed work.

10 Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

11. MATTERS ARISING

11.1 Proposed additions and alterations on Erven 567 & 568, 31 Belvedere Avenue, Oranjezicht: S34-A&A Case No: HWC23072707MS0806

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 August 2023.
- Graded IIIA
- Falls inside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal with recommendations.
- CIBRA does not support the proposal.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 30 August 2023

MS

11.2 Proposed residential development on Erf 121842, 5 Dapper Road, Kensington, S38(4)-NID Case No: HWC23062606MS0629

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 August 2023.
- Not Graded
- Falls outside HPOZ

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

MS

11.3 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 86923, Main Road, Muizenberg: S34-A&A-Minor Works Case No: HWC23050811MS0621

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received 21 August 2023.
- Graded IIIA
- Falls inside HPOZ

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

**11.4 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 727, 734, 736 and 1031, Sea Point High School, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23062113MS0623**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 14 August 2023
- Graded IIIB
- Falls outside HPOZ
- SFB stated that they cannot comment due to work already completed
- SFA did not provide a comment within the 30-day commenting period

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

CoCT Comments required.

MS

**11.5 Proposed additions, alterations and partial demolition on Erf 270, 28 Jarvis Street, De Waterkant, Green Point, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23060209CN0608**

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 14 August 2023
- Graded IIIB
- Falls inside HPOZ
- BELCOM approved the application on 26 July 2023.
- BELCOM suggested that a pergola be put over the veranda at the top floor as it will be appropriate in this instance and should the owners agree to this suggestion, an amended drawing could be submitted to HOMS for approval. The pergola suggestion was discussed with the owners who were delighted to accept the suggestion.
- Before HOMS are the amended plans indicating the pergola on the 5th floor.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

**11.6 Proposed additions and alterations on RE of Erf 176, 30 Church Street, Tulbagh, S27-A&A
Case No: HWC23060612CN0607**

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3 and 14 August 2023
- Graded PHS
- Falls inside HPOZ

- TVHF supports the proposal
- Witzenberg Municipality noted building plans for the property have been submitted.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

Conditions:

- A heritage practitioner to be appointed to monitor the work.
- A close out report to be submitted after 30 days of the work being completed.

CN

11.7 Proposed additions, alterations and partial demolition on Erf 4596, 104 Zwaanswyk Road, Tokai, S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23071908CN0724

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 28 July, 15 and 17 August 2023
- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- CRRRA and FoCVGB support the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

11.8 Proposed total demolition on Erf 69, 3 Upper Beta Close, Bakoven, S34-TD

Case No: HWC23062102CN0724

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 17 August 2023
- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- CSDBOA did not provide comment within 30 days

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

CN

11.9 Proposed additions and alterations on Farm 303, Langekloof Farm, Cederberg.S34-Addition

Case No: HWC23062806SB0726

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- HOMs previously requested new application form

- Information received on 7 August 2023
- The proposal is for a new dwelling, and it is unlikely to impact palaeontological, archaeological resource.
- The proposed dwelling is on a working farm, it is unlikely to have visual impacted on the landscape.
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

11.10 Proposed for rehabilitation of the road TR75/1 & N12 Highway near Oudtshoorn: S38(8)-HIA Case No: HWC23050807SB0509

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed widening of the existing road prism and rehabilitation of the existing road cross-section to include surfaced shoulders. This would include maintenance, repairs, concrete lined drains, installation of road signs, markings, guardrails and fencing.
- The palaeontological study identified significant fossil resources in the existing road cuttings which included well-preserved bivalves, trace fossils and possible trilobites.
- It was noted although the road itself and associated culverts may be older than 60 years but are not significant. The railway line and the railway bridges hold a greater significance.
- It was further moted that landscape is a heritage resource but low significance.
- The committee noted that fossil resources could be impacted by the set development however mitigation methods and the recommendations of the HIA were supported.
- No objections were received for the proposed development.

FINAL COMMENT

The committee resolved to endorse the HIA prepared by ASHA Consulting, date 3 August 2023, with the following recommendations:

1. A palaeontologist must be appointed to rescue fossils in the existing road cuttings prior to the commencement of construction. The work must be carried out under a Workplan approved by HWC;
2. Palaeontological monitoring must also take place during expansion of the road cuttings. A suitable schedule for inspections must be agreed upon between the palaeontologist and contractor;
3. A palaeontological chance finds procedure must be in place and should be implemented if fossils are found in the absence of the palaeontologist;
4. The total area disturbed must be minimised as far as possible and all areas not required during operation of the road must be rehabilitated; and
5. If any archaeological material, fossils or human burials are uncovered during the course of development then work in the immediate area should be halted. The find would need to be reported to the heritage authorities and may require inspection by an archaeologist or palaeontologist. Such heritage is the property of the state and may require excavation and curation in an approved institution.

SB

11.11 Proposed upgrade to existing Pinnacle Point Wastewater Treatment on Farm 15390 Works, Mossel Bay: S38(8)-NID Case No: HWC23073111SB0809

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 August 2023; however, it was noted that the information requested was in the initial application.
- It is unlikely that archaeological resource would be uncovered on site.
- The committee noted that Prof Pether recommends the inclusion of the Fossil Finds Procedure although site is severely disturbed and the palaeontological sensitivity of the site as low.
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required, with chance finds procedure.

SB

11.12 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 4789, 7 Dassenheuvel Lane, Noordhoek: S34-A&A Case No: HWC23073102CH0809

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 17 August 2023
- Graded IIIC
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- NRA supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

11.13 Proposed minor works on Erf 116944, 20 Christiaan Street, District Six, Cape Town, S34-Minor Works Case No: HWC23071007SJ0718

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 11 August 2023
- Not Graded
- Falls outside HPOZ

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

11.14 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 72021, 39 Chudleigh Road, Plumstead: S34-A&A Case No: HWC23080701SJ0809

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 14 August 2023
- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

11.15 Proposed maintenance and repairs on Erf 115963, Bo-Kaap Museum, 71 Wale Street, Cape Town, S27-Comment to SAHRA

Case No: HWC230627410SJ0703

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 2023
- Graded I
- Falls inside HPOZ
- HOMs is providing a comment to SAHRA

COMMENT

The Committee resolved to support the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources. HWC recommends the appointment of Avril Paterson to monitor the proposed work as well as provide a close-out report within 30-days of practical completion of the work.

SJ

11.16 Proposed minor works on Erf 115295, 49 Lower Main Road, Observatory, S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23070508RG0718

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 August 2023
- Graded IIIC
- Falls inside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

11.17 Proposed minor works on Erf 2443, 40 Bellair Road, Vredehoek, S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23070608RG0718

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 August 2023
- Graded IIIC

- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- GVHAG has no objections
- All work has been completed

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

RG

**11. 18 Proposed minor works on Erf 428, 54 Hoog Street, Napier, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23080210RG0806**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 August 2023
- Not Graded
- Falls outside HPOZ

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

- Updated Photos and plans
- Conservation body comments required

RG

**11. 19 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 56752, 1 Paradise Road, Claremont, S34-A&A,
Case No: HWC23072604RG0731**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 August 2023
- Graded IIIC
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- UCRRA does not support the proposal or have any objections

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

**11. 20 Proposed minor works on Erf 988, Costa Brava, Units 401 & 502, 299 Beach Road, Sea Point,
S34-Minor Works,
Case No: HWC23080206RG0806**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 August 2023
- Graded IIIB
- Falls outside HPOZ
- SFA has no objections

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

11.21 Proposed development Trekkloof (Farm RE/54, Clanwilliam), Clanwilliam, S38(4)-NID

Case No: HWC23061501AM0724

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 11 August 2023

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

AM

11.22 Proposed pipeline and pump station for the Wildevoëlvelei Wastewater Treatment Works, on Portion 28 & 0 of Farm 948, Cape Town: S38(8)-NID

Case No: HWC23080710AM0809

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

- Tittle deed required

AM

11.23 Proposed development on Ptn 45 of Farm Eastbrook No. 183, Knysna: S38(4)-NID

Case No: HWC23080103AM0802

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 14 August 2023
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

AM

11.24 Proposed new horse stables on Portion 6 of Farm 554, Dal Josafat, Paarl, S38(4)-NID,

Case No: HWC23061912AM0627

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 8 August 2023
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

11.25 Portion development on Triggerfish Way, W.R. Quinan Blvd, Paardevlei, Somerset West. S38(4)-NID

Case No: HWC23072403AM0731

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 16 August 2023
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

AM

11.26 Proposed alterations and additions on Erf 25486, 2 Baker Street, Observatory: S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23062213KB0806

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item. Jone Kros was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 18 August 2023
- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

11.27 Proposed total demolition on Erf 48331, 6 Apple Lane, Newlands, S34-TD

Case No: HWC23063005KB0704

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 15 August 2023
- Graded IIIC
- Falls inside a proposed HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- NRA supports the proposal

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

- Heritage report with design indicators, streetscape analysis and replacement structure.

KB

12. NEW MATTERS

12.1 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 3732, 17 Private Road, Somerset West: S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23080808AM0815

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ
- HRF supports the proposal

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

AM

**12.2 Proposed mixed-use residential development to provide low cost housing in Laingville, on Ptn 80, St Helena Bay Road, St Helena Bay: S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23080708AM0815**

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Palaeontology- mostly low palaeosensitivity
- Archaeology- the NID report notes no archaeological resources within the subject site.
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required in terms of S38(8)-NID, S35 application required for testing on site.

AM

**12.3 Proposed minor works on Erf 97129 & 97098, 11 Mariendahl Avenue, Newlands: S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23072605AM0815**

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Falls outside HPOZ
- GLCA supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

AM

**12.4 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 976, 401 St. Johns Road, Sea Point: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23080203AM0815**

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- SFA and SFB support the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

AM

- 12.5 Amendment of previously approved SDP on various farm portions in Southern Paarl City Corridor, between the R45 and the R301 Farms 8434, 8442, 8892, 8893, 9271, 19436, 1566, 1591, 1486, Farm 845/2, Farm 811/29/2/36 & 31, Farm 1312/0 & Farm 844/11; etc. Paarl: S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23081404AM0815**

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Palaeontology- low and moderate palaeosensitivity
- Archaeology- the banks of the Berg River are thought to have archaeological materials in the more rural areas where the river courses. This area in particular is heavily exploited by agricultural activities and urbanization minimizing significant archaeological finds.
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

AM

- 12.6 Proposed new dwelling on Valliere Farm, Windmeul Plot 7 of Farm 6/399, Paarl: S38(4)-NID
Case No: HWC23081106AM0816**

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Palaeontology- zero and moderate palaeosensitivity
- The proposed single dwelling itself is not 5000sqm, this renders the proposed work as a non-trigger to the NHRA.
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

No trigger letter to be issued.

AM

- 12.7 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 9666 Absa Bank, 80 Beach Road, Strand: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23073104AM0816**

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT declined to comment on the proposal

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

AM

- 12.8 Proposed minor works on Erf 139, 8 Oos Streett, Stilbaai: S34-Minor Works**

Case No: HWC23080215CH0815

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape photographs and confirmation if the proposed work is completed

CH

12.9 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1490, 10 Bradwell Road, Vredehoek: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23081101CH0815

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal in principle but does not support the proposal in its current form.
- CIBRA does not support the proposal.
- GVHAG supports the proposal

DECISION

Referred to BELCom on 30 August 2023

CH

12.10 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 183, 5 Sir George Grey Street, Oranjezicht: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23070706CH0815

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Motivation report and all photographs required

CH

12.11 Permit Extension on Erf 232-RE, 55 High Level Road, Green Point: S34-Permit Extension
Case No: HWC23080806CH0815

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Application is for the extension of a total demolition permit.
- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the permit extension.

CH

12.12 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 43599, 117 Fifth Avenue, Rondebosch: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23080805CH0815

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW

- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

12.13 Proposed minor works on Erf 4699, 8 Corner Darling Street and Parliament Street, Cape Town: S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23081002CH0815

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item. Mr Rick Molton and Prof. Walter Peters were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application for maintenance and repairs.
- Graded IIIA
- Falls inside HPOZ

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that a closeout report be submitted to HWC within 30 days of practical completion.

CH

12.14 Proposed minor works on Erf. 969, 22 Church Street, Pacaltsdorp: S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23081102CH0815

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

All photographs and locality plan required

CH

12.15 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 94460, 2 Park Road (Corners Kloof & Darters Road), Gardens : S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23080802CH0815

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIA
- Falls inside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- CIBRA supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

12.16 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf Portions 4 & 6 or Farm 100, Morgenhof, Stellenbosch : S34-A&A

Case No: HWC22053008CH0815

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Application is submitted for the unauthorised work that commenced in 2022.
- Werf is graded IIIA
- Werf falls within a IIIB landscape with high historical and architectural significance.
- Falls outside HPOZ
- Stellenbosch Municipality did not comment within 30 days.
- The Ward Councillor did not comment within 30 days.
- Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation did not comment within 30 days.
- Simon van der Stel Foundation did not comment within 30 days.
- Vernacular Architectural Society of SA did not comment within 30 days.
- Stellenbosch Interest Group (SIG) does not support the proposal. SIG states that the additions are insensitive, overbearing and inappropriate. The additions contribute to a further loss of authenticity on the farm. SIG states that the unauthorised work must be removed.
- The Cape Institute for Architecture (CIFA) does not support the proposal with reason that the additions are insensitive, unrefined and inappropriate; the columns use for the verandahs are poorly scaled; the architectural language and materiality is inappropriate; and the additions further contributes to the erosion of the werf.
- CIFA recommends that a heritage report be prepared with heritage indicators and recommendations on the way forward. CIFA recommends that the thatched roofs be reinstated and that some or all of the unauthorised structures should be demolished.
- The owner has responded to the concerns raised by the I&APs and is asking to keep the work as is for the next 5 years and then rectify the unauthorised work in a phased approach. The owner suggests that there be a heritage agreement between HWC and the owner.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 30 August 2023

CH

12.17 Proposed extensions and new construction at 4 Clovelly Road on Erven 90155, 90156 & 90157 Clovelly: S38(4)-NID

Case No: HWC23073105CH0815

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The NID is submitted for the enlargement of the existing garage, the construction of new dwellings and the consolidation of three erven.
- Graded IIIC
- Falls inside HPOZ
- The site falls within the low paleontologically sensitive area according to SAHRIS.
- Anticipated impacts to archaeology are low.
- CoCT supports the alterations to the garage and the new additions.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. A Section 34 application to be submitted for the extension and alterations to the garage.

CH

12.18 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 52827, Claremont High School, Barkley House, 7 Molteno

Road, Claremont: S34-Total Demolition

Case No: HWC23081001KB0815

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

FURTHER REQUIREMENT

S38-NID Application required

KB

12.19 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 10289, 14 Kommetjie Main Road, Fish Hoek: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23073115KB0815

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

12.20 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 10557, 72 8th Avenue, Vredelust, Bellville: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23073103KB0815

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

CoCT comment, motivation, street scape photographs and locality plan required.

KB

12.21 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 185, 13 Rutherford Road, Meadowridge, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23081004KB0815

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

12.22 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2320 11 Rustenburg Road, Pinelands: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23081401KB0815

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

**12.23 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 3753 , 21 Kensington Crescent, Oranjezicht, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23080811KB0815**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Falls inside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- CIBRA supports the proposal

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

**12.24 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 71235, 23 Cannon Street, Plumstead: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23072701KB0815**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

SG Diagram required

KB

**12.25 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 10184, 33 Bowler Street, Avon: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23080305KB0815**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape photographs and CoCT comment required

KB

**12.26 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 28063, 7 Winchester Road, Observatory: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23073106KB0815**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

HELD OVER:

Held over to next Homs

KB

**12.27 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 78427, 121 Boundary Road, Diep River: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23081405KB0816**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape photographs, SG diagram and CoCT comment required

KB

**12.28 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 14023, 57 Mountain Road, Woodstock: S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23080715MS0815**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Falls inside HPOZ

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

**12.29 Proposed total demolition on Erf 3566, 5 Dennendal East Avenue, Tokai: S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC23080807MS0815.**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Conservation body comments, new application form and SG diagram required.

MS

**12.30 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 51664, 136 Milner Road, Claremont: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23081009MS0815**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

New application form, title deed and POP required.

MS

**12.31 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 79353, 5 Ronell Crescent, Diep River: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23080302MS0815**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- Treat 5 and 3 Ronell Crescent as one case.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

**12.32 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 79354, 3 Ronell Crescent, Diep River: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23080301MS0815**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

**12.33 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 85, 7 Leeb Street, Prince Albert: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23073116MS0815**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Not Graded
- Prince Albert municipality supports the proposal
- SvdSF (Southern Cape) referred the application to HWC
- Prince Albert Cultural Foundation supports the proposal with recommendations.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

**12.34 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 88739, 74 Boyes Drive / 24 Capri Road, St. James: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23080801MS0815**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Internal images and conservation body comments.

MS

**12.35 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1361, 22 Ludlow Road, Vredehoek: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23071803MS0815**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Annotated photos, locality map, title deed, SG Diagram, conservation body comments and municipal comments required.

MS

**12.36 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf11180, 5 Riebeeck Street, Malmesbury: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23081412MS0816**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Municipal and conservation body comments and locality map required.

MS

**12.37 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 180, 25 Central Avenue, Pinelands: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23080214SB0815**

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Streetscape, internals, Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association comment required.

SB

**12.38 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2378, 27 St James Street, Vredehoek: S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23080704SB0815**

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIA
- Outside HPO
- Work has not started and the application is for repairs and maintenance

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SB

**12.39 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2772 & 2773, 6 Gladiola Way / Cnr 6 Arum Avenue,
Kommetjie: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23080406SB0815**

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Falls outside HPOZ
- CoCT supports the proposal
- KHS did not comment within 30 days

FURTHER REQUIREMENT

Under investigation as the commenting period closed last week, the case officer confirm that no comment was received by KHS.

SB

**12.40 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 7485, 17 Andriese Pretorius Street, Glenlily, Parow: S34-
A&A
Case No: HWC23081007SB0815**

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Annotated photographs including streetscapes.

SB

**12.41 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 9245, Allure Restaurant, 71 Waterkant Street, Cape Town: S27-A&A
Case No: HWC23080212SB0815**

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Site is a grade 1, HWC can only provide a comment
- Application must be made to SAHRA

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Contextual streetscape and internal photographs required.

SB

**12.42 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 96141, 10 Scott Street, Gardens: S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23062808SB0815**

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- CIBRA supports the proposal
- Faced damaged by the tree which was removed with a permit
- The building is in dire state and requires urgent repairs
- The committee is satisfied with proposed work however requires and independent party to monitor.

DECISION

The committee is supportive of the proposed interventions. In order for Heritage Western Cape (HWC) to issue a permit, the following is required:

1. The applicant is to appoint a suitably qualified consultant with the appropriate heritage experience to oversee the proposed work
 2. HWC is to be provided with the details of the consultant and their CV confirming suitability to oversee the work
 3. A letter of appointment to be signed by the applicant and consultant
- Once the above has been fulfilled, HWC will provide the required permit.

SB

**12.43 Proposed total demolition on Erf681, 27 Amy Searle Street, Great Brak River: S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC23071702SB0816**

Ms Stephanie-Anne Barnardt introduced the item.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Simon Van Der Stel Foundation Southern Cape comments and streetscape photographs required.

SB

13. OTHER MATTERS

14. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

CN moves and KB seconds.

15. CLOSURE 13:30

16. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

28 August 2023

Chairperson.....

Secretariat:

Annexure A – HWC Heritage Officer Meetings

Abbreviations

APHP - Association of Professional Heritage Practitioners

AHP - Agulhas Heritage Society

BKCA -Bo-Kaap Civic Association

BKYM - Bo-Kaap Youth Movement

CIBRA - City Bowl Ratepayers ' & Residents Association

CoCT – City of Cape Town

CTHT – Cape Town Heritage Trust

CRM - Cultural Resources Management

DRHCA - De Rust Heritage Conservation Association

Docomomo South Africa

DHS -Durbanville Heritage Society

EHM – Environmental Heritage Management department

FoBCA- Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area

FE - Friends Of Elim

GLCA- Greater Lynfrae Civic Association

GPRRA - Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association

HVA- Harfield Village Association

HMB - Heritage Mossel Bay

HVTA - Hex Valley Tourism Association

HBRRA - Hout Bay & Ratepayers And Residents Association

HIA - Heritage Impact Assessment

ILASA - Institute for Landscape Architecture in South Africa

KBHA - Kalk Bay Historical Association

KBSJRR - Kalk bay-St James Ratepayers & Residents Association

LKID - Lower Kenilworth Improvement District

MHCS - Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society

NCW – Not Conservation Worthy

NEMA - National Environmental Management Act (No. 107 of 1998)

NID - Notification of Intent to Develop

NCOA - Noetzie Conservancy Owners Association

OH - Oudshoorn Heritage

Paarl300 Foundation

PRRA - Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association

PACF - Prince Albert Cultural Foundation

SAHRA - South African Heritage Resources Agency

SRHS - Salt River Heritage Society

ASAPA - Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists

ABHC - Associated Bibbeys Hoek Conservancy (Knysna)

BELCOM - Built Environment and Landscapes Committee

CBCRA -Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association

CSDBOA - Clifton-On-Sea & District Bungalow Owners Association

CTHF - Cape Town Heritage Foundation

CRRA - Constantia Ratepayers & Residents Associations

CMP – Conservation Management Plan

DWCA - De Waterkant Civic Association

DHF - Drakenstein of Heritage Foundation

EMPr - Environmental Management Program

FHRA -Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayer Association

FoCVGB - Friends Of Constantia Valley Green Belts

GBRM - Great Brak River Museum

GVHAG- Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group

GCS - Greyton Conservation Society

HRF - Heldeberg Renaissance Foundation

HOMs - Heritage Officers Meeting

HPO – Heritage protect overlay

HWC – Heritage Western Cape

IACom - Impact Assessment Committee

IGIC - Inventories, Gradings and Interpretations Committee

KHS - Kommetjie Heritage Society

MGHS - McGregor Heritage Society

NHC - Napier Heritage & Conservation

NASDB - Nelspoort Agency of Sustainable Development body

NHRA - National Heritage Resources Act (No. 25) of 1999

NRA - Newlands Residents Association

OCA - Observatory Civic Association

OHAC - Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee

PPP - Public Participation Process

PHCT - Pniel Heritage And Cultural Trust

RMCA - Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee

SAHRIS - South African Heritage Resources Information System

SPFA - Sea Point For All Group

SFB - Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association

SvdSF - Simon van der Stel Foundation Cape Town

STHS - Simon's Town Historical Society

SHF - Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation

SHCT - Stillbaai Heritage Conservation Trust

GHT - George Heritage Trust

RVRA - Rustenburg Valley Residents Association

TRHCS - Touws River Heritage and Conservation Society

VASSA - Vernaclar Architecture Society of South Africa

WUECAG - Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group

WCAC - West Coast Aboriginal Council

WAAC - Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee

WHCS - Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society

WRRRA - Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association

SHC - Stanford Conservation Trust & Stanford Heritage Committee

SIG - Stellenbosch Interest Group

SHA - Swellendam Heritage Association

OWVS - Old Wynberg Village Society

TVHF - Tulbagh Valley Heritage Foundation

UCRRA - Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association

WERRA - Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association

Ward 2 Forum

WCC - Whale Coast Conservation

WRA - Woodstock Residents Association

WECA - Wynberg East Civic Association

Approved