

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape  
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)  
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 31 January 2024 via MS Teams**



**1. Opening and Welcome**

The Chair, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08: 30 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Committee Members:**

Mr. Dennis Belter (DB)(Chair)  
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)  
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)  
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)  
Mr Siphiwo Mavumengwana (SM)  
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ)

**Members of Staff:**

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)  
Ms Naushina Rahim (NR)  
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)  
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)  
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)  
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)  
Ms Chane Herman (CH)  
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)  
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)

**Visitors:**

Mr Clive Theunissen  
Mr Siraaj Slamang  
Mr Phillip Smith  
Ms Katie Smuts  
Ms Bridget O' Donoghue  
Mr Stuart Hermansen  
Mr Lewis Wolf

Ms Annamie Vermeulen  
Mr David Pike  
Mr Sean Hayden  
Mr Tali Bruk  
Ms Helene Turvey  
Mr John Kelley

**Apologies**

None

**Absent**

None

**4. Approval of Agenda**

**4.1 Dated 31 January 2024.**

The Committee approved the agenda dated 31 January 2024.

**5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings**

**5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 11 December 2023**

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 11 December 2023 and resolved to approve them with minor amendments.

**6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:**

- None

**7. Confidential Matters**

None

**8. Administrative Matters**

**8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

NR reported back on the following appeals matters:

- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 567 and 568, 31 Belvedere Avenue, Oranjezicht: MA
- Proposed Emergency Roof Replacement on Erf 1427, Voortrekker Street, Swellendam: NM
- Proposed Total Demolition and Replacement Structure on Erven 977 & 978, 11 & 13 Virginia Avenue, Vredehoek

**8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:**

Nothing to report.

**8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition.**

Nothing to report.

**8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders follow up.**

For noting.

**8.5 Erf 510, 7 Cavalcade Road, Green Point Enquiry**

The heritage consultant requested clarification of the BELCom Further Requirements given at the meeting of 11 December 2023.

**8.6 16 Alexandra Avenue, Wynberg (Rev L)**

The Committee supported the proposal as per Rev L, the correct drawing set to be stamped.

**8.7 Recusal of members as heritage practitioners.**

Members of the Committee, when acting as the heritage consultant for a case, may attend and participate in the discussion of the case, but must be recused and logged off from the meeting when the decision is being made.

**9. Standing Items**

**9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports**

Nothing to report.

**9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings**

Nothing to report.

### 9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

### 9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

- Muizenberg Train Station - RE of Erf 87114, 181 Main Road, Muizenberg (The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Friday, 8 March 2024 at 10:00, HvdM and DB).
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Remainder Farm 1377, Grand Provence, Franschhoek
- Proposed Total Demolition, 65 Main Road, Paarl MRA (The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Wednesday, 21 February 2024 at 10:00)
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 173935, 4 Abingdon Road, Kenilworth (The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Wednesday, 7 February 2024 at 10:00)

### 9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 102, 3 Princess Road, Fresnaye
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 172010, Beach Road, Empire West Building, Muizenberg
- Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 54815, 44 Herschel Road, Claremont
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Remainder of Erf 27135, 20 Trill Road, Observatory

### 10. Appointments

None

## MATTERS DISCUSSED

### 11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

#### 11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2231, 165 Main Road, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 2231

**Case No:** HWC23062306RG0626

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) was present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Victorian house on Erf 2231 is located in a prominent position next to the Strooidakkerk. The application involved mitigation of unauthorised work and included a landscaping proposal to provide a link to the garden setting of the church while screening the recent sheet metal clad structures set behind the Victorian house.

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the consolidated drawings numbered 23003-C-001 Rev B; 23003-C-002 Rev B; 23003-C-003 Rev B; 23003-C-004 Rev B; 23003-C-005 Rev B; 23003-C-004 Rev B, prepared by Stone Projects, dated 25/01/2024 for inclusion into the mitigation agreement.

**SJ**

**11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Remainder Farm 1377, Grand Provence, Franschhoek: NM**  
**HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ FRANSCHHOEK/ REMAINDER FARM 1377**

**Case No:** HWC23102702CH1031

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Wednesday, 21 February 2024 at 12:00.

CH

**12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 7799, 24 New Street, Martinville, Somerset West: NM**  
**HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SOMERSET WEST/ ERF 7799**

**Case No:** HWC23052314CH1017

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Ms Annamie Vermeulen (Helderberg Renaissance Foundation) and Mr Siraaj Slamang (City of Cape Town Recreation and Parks Department) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The now derelict building on the site is graded IIIB and dates from the early 1920s.
- The building does not appear to have the architectural qualities that would warrant a grade IIIB grading. There could of course be other reasons justifying that grading. As such it was agreed that its heritage significance should be better understood before agreeing to any demolition.
- Helderberg Renaissance Foundation opposed the proposed demolition applied for by CoCT.
- CoCT indicated that the site had been offered for lease or sale in the past but that there had been no interest.
- HRF indicated that various NGOs had expressed interest in the site in the past and that there may be parties willing to lease the building.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee recommends that the City of Cape Town engage with Helderberg Renaissance Foundation to explore the leasing and repairing of the buildings. Alternatively, should the city select to pursue demolition, the Committee requires a heritage statement of the buildings and context in order to make an informed decision.

CH

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 173935, 4 Abingdon Road, Kenilworth: NM  
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ KENILWORTH/ ERF 17935**

**Case No:** HWC23111408

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Wednesday, 7 February 2024 at 10:00.

**KB**

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL  
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on RE of Erf 54809, 6 Phyllis Road, Claremont: NM  
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT / RE OF ERF 54809**

**Case No:** HWC23102506CN1025

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Mr David Pike (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The early/mid-20<sup>th</sup> C building is graded IIIC and not in an HPOZ.
- The Upper Claremont Residents' and Ratepayers' Association objected to the proposal for a contemporary addition in its current form.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as detailed on drawing number 4.1-A1, 4.1-A2- Revision 0 dated 10 October 2023 prepared by D.P from APR Architects as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

**CN**

**13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 65048, 24 Gibson Road, Kenilworth: MA  
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ KENILWORTH/ ERF 65048**

**Case No:** HWC23010306CH0119

The applicant withdrew the application.

**CH**

**13.3 Proposed Deviations to Permitted Additions and Alterations on Erf 24306, Corner McFarlane & Main Street, Paarl: MA  
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 24306**

**Case No:** HWC23112005SJ1122

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HWC issued a permit for this application in 2022. During construction, a change was made to the material but not form or size of the upper story extension over that garage at the back of the site. The initial plans provided for a brick structure which was changed to a timber framed construction. Photos submitted confirm that the structure as built is in accordance with the earlier permitted proposal.
- The site is graded IIIC and falls in the Paarl Special Character Protected Area.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as being substantially in accordance with the previous approval.

SJ

**13.4 Detail design for Union Castle Building on Erf 149294-RE, Dock Road, Pierhead Precinct, V&A Waterfront: MA  
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / V&A WATERFRONT / ERF 149294-RE**

**Case No:** HWC23012709SJ0130

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Sean Hayden (architect) was present and took part in the discussions. Katie Smuts (heritage consultants Rennie Scurr Adendorff) attended as an observer.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the window and door details in the report titled "Opening Details", dated January 2024, prepared by KMH Architects.

SJ

**13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Remainder of Erf 27135, 20 Trill Road, Observatory:  
MA  
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / REMAINDER OF ERF 27135**

**Case No:** HWC23091907CN1123

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 22 January 2024.

Ms Bridget O' Donoghue (heritage consultant) and Mr Darian (owner) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC and in an HPOZ. The Victorian house is mirrored by its semi-detached counterpart, both facing onto Trill Road. The site in question is located on a corner and therefore visually prominent within both streetscapes.
- The CoCT supported the proposal.
- The Observatory Civic Association raised several concerns.
- The proposal for a double storey addition over the whole building is supported in principle and has precedents elsewhere in this densifying area with its high demand for accommodation.
- However, as a semi-detached building it must be demonstrated that a proposal of this scale could successfully be mirrored onto the 'twin' of the subject building.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee supports the proposal in principle however requires a full set of drawings in order to further assess the application.

CN

**13.6 Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 54815, 44 Herschel Road, Claremont: MA  
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT / ERF 54815**

**Case No:** HWC23103012CN1031

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case. No parties were present.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 22 January 2024.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Architecturally the Herschel Road elevation could benefit from a reduction in scale and glazing area to the entrance portico.
- The site is graded IIIC and not in a HPOZ, however it is immediately adjacent to the Lower Kenilworth proposed HPOZ.
- A double storey alteration is supported in principle, however the large-scale entrance portico raised concerns.
- The CoCT and Upper Claremont Residents' and Ratepayers' Association submitted objections.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on Drawing No: A\_0300 – Revision 0, A\_1000 – Revision 2, A1100, A\_2000, A\_3000 – Revision 3 dated 23 July 2023 prepared by TJ from Jauch Architects as not negatively impacting on heritage resources.

CN

**13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 172010, Beach Road, Empire West Building, Muizenberg: MA  
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / MUIZENBERG / ERF 172010**

**Case No:** HWC23083008CN0901

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 22 January 2024.

Ms Helene Turvey (Empire Building body corporate) and Mr Stuart Hermansen (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Empire Building is graded IIIB and in an HPOZ.
- The façade of the original Empire Theatre building represents a small fragment of the large building which forms part of the successful revitalizing of the Muizenberg beachfront (and which is not older than 60 years and not subject to the NHRA S.34).
- However, provisions for heritage protection of the HPOZ prevails.



- The Empire Body Corporate submitted objections to the proposal for the extension of an existing rooftop apartment.
- The heritage consultant confirmed that development rights were in place and that the design proposal seeks to integrate seamlessly with the existing architecture of the building.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawing numbered 01-01 – Revision 5, 01-02, 01-03 – Revision 4 dated 14 September 2021 and prepared by SG/NG from Thomas Leach Architects as not negatively impacting on heritage resources.

CN

**13.8 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 47118, 79 Campground Road, Rondebosch: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / RONDEBOSCH / ERF 47118**

**Case No:** HWC23071003KB0926

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Mr Alberto (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and not in an HPOZ.
- The Committee questions the viability of the timber deck in terms of practicality and future use. The Committee feels the removal of this timber deck will greatly improve the aesthetic and amenity of the IIIB resource.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawing numbered A101, A102, A201, A202 – Revision 5, dated 23 January 2024 and prepared by AM from AM Architecture as having met previous requirements.

CN

**13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 102, 3 Princess Road, Fresnaye: MA  
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ FRESNAYE/ ERF 102**

**Case No:** HWC23091511CH1009

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 22 January 2024.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and not in an HPOZ.
- This early/ mid-20<sup>th</sup> C house is a good example of a building of its kind.
- The CoCT supported the proposal, the Sea Point Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers and Residents Association submitted an objection.
- The proposal is for an upper storey addition at the back of the property. Set on a steep slope, the view lines to the proposed addition will be obscured by the front façade of the house which is to remain unaltered.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 3.01 and 3.02, dated 23 August 2023 as prepared by Moolman & Associates as not negatively impacting on heritage resource.

CH

**13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1649, 3 Mutley Road, Sea Point: MA  
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SEA POINT / ERF 1649**

**Case No:** HWC23082417SJ1019

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This pre-1902 building known as 'Blackheath Lodge' is graded IIIC and is located in an HPOZ.
- The CoCT supported the proposal with conditions that original stairs and fireplaces be retained.
- The heritage consultant explained that –
  - all original fireplaces were being retained, only a modern fireplace was being removed.
  - The original stair did not comply with requirements of the National Building Regulations nor with escape route requirements.
- The Committee recommends that the original stair be carefully removed for salvage and potential repurposing elsewhere.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

Based on the revised submission, the Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered RY-CS-001 Rev 3; RY-CS-002 Rev 3, dated 14-07-2023, prepared by Young Architecture, as having met previous requirements.

SJ

**14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS****14.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2100, Banana Cottage, 20 De Bruyn Street, Stanford: NM  
HM / OVERBERG / OVERSTRAND / STANFORD / ERF 2100**

**Case No:** HWC23112101SJ1123

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr John Kelley (Stanford Heritage Committee) and Mr Lewis Wolf (architect) were present and took part in the discussions. Ms Katie Smuts (Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee) was present and observed the item.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and falls inside the Stanford Heritage Area.
- Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee supported the application.
- Stanford Heritage raised objections, however the proposal submitted to HWC had already been modified in response to the comments received.
- Stanford Heritage confirmed their support for the proposal as submitted.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered SKA\_LA\_01\_01; SKA\_LA\_03\_01, dated 19/10/2023, prepared by Akimbo Architecture & Design, as not negatively impacting on heritage resource.

SJ

**15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**15.1** None

**16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**16.1** None

**17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**17.1** None

**18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

**18.1** None

**19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

**19.1** None

**20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN**

**20.1** None

**21. NON-COMPLIANCE**

**21.1** None

**22. OTHER**

**22.1** None

**22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minutes.

**23. CLOSURE**

The meeting closed at 13:15

**24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**

28 February 2024

**MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

28 February 2024

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

28 February 2024