

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 28 August 2024 via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)(Chair)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ)
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)

Members of Staff:

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Mr Ruan Brand (RB)
Emily-Jane Vowles (VJW)
Ms Chiara Singh (CSI)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)

Visitors:

Mr Bruce Wilson
Ms Jessica Blumenthal
Ms Darsha Indrajith
Ms Karla Ray
Mr Chris Snelling
Mr Shiraaz Hassan
Mr Philip Smith
Mr Henry Aikman
Ms Louise Hyde
Mr Clive Theunissen
Mr John Carten
Mr Erwin Struwig
Ms Alison Boonzaier
Mr Chris Fick
Ms Nicolene Visser

Ms Jone Kros
Mr Vernon Richter
Ms Beata Blaszczyk
Mr Jon Minster
Ms Hannah Woolaver
Mr Kelvin Sampson
Mr Hassan Asmal
Mr Johan Cornelius
Ms Wendy Whittaker
Mr Clifford Hoffman
Mr Mike Scurr
Mr Shaun Williams
Mr Eitan Levy
Mr Jaco Coetzer

Apologies

Mr Siphiwo Mavumengwana (SM)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 28 August 2024.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 28 August 2024.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 31 July 2024

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 31 July 2024 and resolved to approve them with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

None

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the following Appeals matters:

- Old Mossel River Post Office, Erf 2225. 56 10th Street, Voelklip, Hermanus
- Farm 1796, C'est La Vie, Olyvenbosch Road, Wellington: For noting

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

Nothing to report.

8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders follow up

For noting.

8.5 Erf 6314 (Ptn Erf 2751), Ou Landbousaal, 1 Noordwal-Wes Road, Stellenbosch

The Committee requires the following from the applicant:

1. The engineer's close out report for the stabilization and underpinning of the building.
2. An engineer's certification of the roof structure and other elements to support the solar panels.
3. The reinstatement of the shutters and the timber fretwork of the building, the loss of which has reduced the significance of a historic landmark.
4. The Committee does not support the installation of the solar panels on the northern slope of the roof.

8.6 Committee Decisions and Minutes

The Committee resolved to use OneDrive for simultaneous editing of minutes after meetings, this can be an efficient solution. The minutes will be uploaded to OneDrive, Committee members can access and edit it in real-time, which streamlines the process compared to a round-robin method.

8.7 Tribunal Referral for Proposed Total Demolition & Replacement Structure on Erf 55183, 24 Bishopslea Road, Claremont

The BELCom endorses the plans (Rev 7: 001, 002, 003, 004, 005, 006 & 007, 008, 009 & 010, 011, 012, 013; dated 20.05.2024; prepared by Ampersand Architects) as complying with the requirements set by the Ministerial Tribunals in its ruling dated 8 March 2024.

8.8 CoCT Meeting Attendance

For noting.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

9.1.1 Monitoring Reports: Union Castle Building, VAW (6): MA CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / V&A WATERFRONT / ERF 149294-RE

Case No: HWC23012709SJ0130

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee request that the final closeout report be submitted for endorsement.

SJ

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

- Proposed Alterations, Additions & Partial Demolition on Erf 16489, 25 Shannon Street, Salt River
- Proposed Addition on Farm 950-Re, Vrede & Lust Farm, Simondium

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

- Proposed Total Demolition and Replacement Structure on Erf 56345, 17 Feldhausen Avenue, Claremont
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 52671, 20 Stanley Road, Claremont
- Proposed redevelopment of Erven 2177-Re & 157932, 60 & 58 Loop Street, Cape Town

10. Appointments
None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 None

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 52671, 20 Stanley Road, Claremont: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT / ERF 52671**

Case No: HWC24060513CN0614

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 13 August 2024. See attached annexure SI1.

Mr Shiraaz Hassan (owner), Mr Bruce Wilson (architect), Ms Jone Kros (architect), Ms Jessica Blumenthal (objector neighbour), Mr Virnon Richter (objector neighbour), Ms Darsha Indrajith (objector neighbour), Ms Beata Blaszczyk (objector neighbour), Ms Karla Ray (objector neighbour) and Mr Jon Minster (objector neighbour) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The subject site dates from the 1890s, is graded IIIC and not in a HPOZ.
- The original Victorian house has been extensively altered over time; however, its overall form remains legible and remains part of the pattern set by the grouping of four similar houses in Stanley Road.
- The area contains a few sites graded IIIA and many IIIB and IIICs and displays a certain consistency of scale, roofscape and built form.
- Historical layering is evident and adds to heritage value.
- Contemporary insertions can be seen which for the most part have responded positively to the context, thereby supporting heritage value of the area.
- The Committee has no objection to the demolition of the building however the significance of the area warrants restrictions on the replacement structure.
- The Committee is of the view that this area warrants consideration as a HPOZ.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Items of concern of the replacement structures are details on the site inspection report and include items such as:

1. Maintaining the street setback;
2. The characteristics of the envelope at the street interface to respect the scale of the context;
and
3. The Committee encourages the applicant to engage with I&APs.

CN

**12.2 Proposed Replacement Structure for the Total Demolition of Erf 56345, 17 Feldhausen Avenue, Claremont: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT / ERF 56345**

Case No: 17110810KR1108E

Emily-Jane Vowles introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 13 August 2024. See attached annexure SI2

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant), Ms Louise Hyde (Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association) and Ms Wendy Whittaker (Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB but was proposed as IIIC and is not in a declared HPOZ.
- The subject building, likely built c.1900, forms part of a grouping of three similar houses Victorian in character.
- The subject building has been altered extensively, losing original fenestration, roofing material, and most period features over time.
- The proposed demolition of the building was endorsed by HWC in 2018 with conditions imposed on a replacement proposal.
- The L-shaped property is filled with mature trees and shrubbery. The large oak tree is noteworthy.
- While high density significant heritage resources remain in the surrounding area, Feldhausen Avenue has seen the loss of many older houses in favour of small modern residential complexes consisting of double storey apartments and terraces.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition and the replacement structures on drawing numbered 01 Revision 04; 02 Revision 04; 03 Revision 04; 04 Revision 05 dated November 2023 and June 2024 prepared by A.W.S as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

EJV

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 16443, 55 Fenton Road, Salt River: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SALT RIVER / ERF 16443

Case No: HWC24071114CN0717

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

No parties were present for this case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC, forms part of a significant streetscape and is inside the Salt River HPOZ.
- The proposal is for a front room to be converted to a garage with garage door on the street boundary.
- CoCT did not support the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to refuse the application; the proposal is not sympathetic to the streetscape in its current form.

CN

13.2 Proposed Alterations, Additions & Partial Demolition on Erf 16489, 25 Shannon Street, Salt River: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SALT RIVER / ERF 16489

Case No: HWC24041607CN0408

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Mr Hassan Asmal (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC and not in the Salt River HPOZ.
- The subject house is part of a collection of similar Cape Revival styled houses along Shannon Street that forms an important grouping contributing to the heritage character of the area.
- The site borders on the grounds of the historic Wesleyan School, graded IIIB.

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Wednesday, 11 September 2024 at 10:00.

CN

**13.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Remainder of Erf 1412, 41 Wandel Street,
Malmesbury: MA
HM / WEST COAST / SWARTLAND MUNICIPALITY / MALMESBURY / REMAINDER OF ERF 1412**

Case No: HWC23100908CN1016

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Mr Kevin Sampson (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as shown on drawings numbered AP 2022 – 1110, Page 1 and 2 - Revision D-07/24, dated 22 July 2024, prepared by Kevin Sampson from Alter Plan as having met the previous requirements.

CN

**13.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 14179, 103 Chamberlain Street, Woodstock: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WOODSTOCK/ ERF 14179**

Case No: HWC24061324CSI0606

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the case.

Mr Erwin Struwig (owner and architect) was present and took part in this discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The IIIB Victorian house forms part of an important streetscape and is within a HPOZ.
- CoCT did not support the proposal for the addition of a new single garage.
- Woodstock Aesthetics and Advisory Body supported the proposal with conditions described with illustrations in their comment.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports the mitigation measures as proposed by Woodstock Aesthetics Advisory Body. The applicant is to consult WAAB and amend drawings accordingly. The revised drawings and details to 1:20 scale is to be submitted to HOMs for consideration.

CSI

**13.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erven 4774 and 4777, 96 Longmarket Street, Cape Town: MA
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD/ ERVEN 4774 & 4777**

Case No: 21012804ND0218E

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Eitan Levy (owner of five units), Mr Mike Scurr (heritage consultant), Mr Shaun Williams (owner one unit) and Ms Alison Boonzaier (managing agents) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Wellington was built in 1902, is graded IIIA and in a HPOZ.
- A Minor works permit was issued in 2021 for repair work, however it was discovered that work on site exceeded the permitted work.
- During a BELCom site inspection in 2023 , further unauthorised work was noted.
- Subsequent to this a heritage consultant was appointed to identify all problematic issues with a view to mitigation work being undertaken.
- The owners of a number of units and present in the meeting reported difficulties in dealing with the managing agents.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee supports the mitigation proposal as outlined in the heritage report for remedial work, prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff dated February 2024 and updated in July 2024. The Committee is in agreement that the phased approach is the best strategy to recover heritage significance. A mitigation agreement is to be entered into between HWC and the body corporate within the next 120 days.

CH

13.6 Proposed redevelopment of Erven 2177-Re & 157932, 60 & 58 Loop Street, Cape Town: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CAPE TOWN CBD / ERVEN 2177-RE & 157932

Case No: HWC24062809SJ0717

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 13 August 2024. See attached annexure SI3.

Mr Bruce Wilson (representing the applicant), Ms Jone Kros (representing the applicant) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The proposed project stretches over three erven located in the Central City HPOZ, being No 58 Loop Street (early 20th c) graded IIIA, No 60 Loop Street (mid 20th c) graded IIIB, and No? Bree Street graded IIIC.
- CoCT and CIBRA while in support of redevelopment, did not support the proposal in its current form, noting excessive heights, further setbacks required, and further modulation of facades related to the tower block.
- BELCom would be mostly concerned with impacts of proposed interventions on the IIIA and IIIB heritage resources, as well as with detailing of the interfaces between these building and the proposed new work including a tower block.

RECORD OF DECISION:

Heritage Western Cape endorses the redevelopment proposal of Erven 2177-Re & 157932, 60 & 58 Loop Street, Cape Town, being alterations and additions as reflected on drawings numbered 000-003 Rev E & 000-0003 A Rev C, dated 12/07/24, prepared by Paragon Architects, on condition that:

1. The final details for the interface between the new buildings and heritage structures, subject to Section 34 of the NHRA, are to be submitted for approval to HWC.
2. The final details of the interventions to the heritage structures to be detailed and submitted for approval to HWC.

SJ

**13.7 Proposed Addition on Farm 950-Re, Vrede & Lust Farm, Simondium: NM
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / SIMONDIUM / FARM 950-RE**

Case No: HWC24071907SJ0726

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality), Mr Jaco Coetzer (Malherbe Rust Architects) and Mr Chris Fick (Malherbe Rust Architects) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Vrede & Lust Farm dates from the 1680s, is graded IIIA and contains a number of highly significant historic buildings, as well as later new buildings, for example a modern wine cellar and guest accommodation.
- The proposal is for a modern permanent structure to replace a tented canopy being used for events. Its location is behind the historic Cellar building.
- While Paarl 300 and Drakenstein Heritage Foundation had no objections, Drakenstein Municipality listed several points of objection.

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection Wednesday, 11 September 2024 at 12:30.

SJ

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. OTHER

22.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 13:35

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

18 September 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:


CHAIRPERSON _____

18 September 2024
DATE _____


SECRETARY _____

18 September 2024
DATE _____