

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Thursday, 9 November 2023 via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)(Chair)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)
Mr David Gibbs (DG) (co-opted)

Members of Staff:

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CS)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)

Visitors:

Mr Salman Kajie
Mr Clive Theunissen
Ms Anja Lareman
Ms Adelaide Combrink
Mr Giancarlo Bruno
Ms Nicola Davies-Laubscher
Ms Claire Abrahamse
Ms Lyn Melfi
Mr William Wiley
Ms Melanie Attwell
Ms Patty Price
Mr Johan Malherbe
Ms Nicolene Visser

Ms Tanja Kruger
Ms Nelia Wolfaardt
Dr Stephen Townsend
Mr Nicholas Smith
Ms Kim Whitaker
Mr Chris Snelling
Ms Maureen Wolters
Mr Tim Ziehl
Mr Henry Aikman
Mr Daniel Hellenberg
Mr Francois du Plessis
Mr Marnus Erasmus
Mr Stephen Mayers

Apologies

Mr Sipiwo Mavumengwana (SM)
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Naushina Rahim (NR)

Absent

Ms Athi Njoba (AN)

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 9 November 2023.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 9 November 2023.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 12 October 2023

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 12 October 2023 and resolved to approve them without amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

- DB: item 13.9
- HvdM: item 13.6

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The matter was held over.

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition.

Nothing to report.

8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders follow up.

For noting.

8.5 Time Out Market, V&A Waterfront: Monthly Heritage Report 6

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

COMMENT:

The Committee supports the remedial measures proposed to brickwork and stone elements. Report No.5 (September 2023) has not been received, kindly submit. The next report due is the closeout report as practical completion is set for Friday, 17 November 2023.

SJ

8.6 Portion 4 and 6 of Farm 100, Morgenhof Wine Estate, Stellenbosch

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Mr Salman Kajie was present and took part in the discussion.

COMMENT:

HWC is to inform the Stellenbosch Municipality of their concerns regarding the suitability of all structures on the site for public occupation since no signoff by a registered structural engineer is in place. HWC awaits the formal rectification proposal in due course.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 88223, 3 Carisbrooke Steps, St James
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 66083, 16 Alexandra Avenue, Wynberg

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

None

10. Appointments

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Emergency Roof Replacement on Erf 1427, Voortrek Street, Swellendam: NM HM/ OVERBERG/ SWELLENDAM/ ERF 1427

Case No: HWC23090502CH0915

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Ms Tanja Kruger (applicant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee does not support the replacement of existing slate tiles with corrugated sheeting. Any repairs to the roof need to be undertaken on a like for like basis.
- The Committee expressed concerns around the earlier replacement (by a previous owner) of the internal facing roof slope with corrugated sheeting, no permit for this has been presented.

RECORD OF DECISION:

Given the negative effects of the proposal on the heritage structure the Committee does not support the application.

CH

11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2231, 165 Main Road, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 2231

Case No: HWC23062306RG0626

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality), Ms Nelia Wolfaardt (architect) and Ms Anja Lareman (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the discussions.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports the proposal as shown on drawing numbered 23003-D-001 Rev A; 23003-D-002 Rev A; 23003-D-003 Rev A; 23003-D-004 Rev A, dated 20 October 2023 and prepared by Stone Projects. The Committee requires that the kitchen block cladding be changed from IBR to S profile sheeting. This change can be submitted to the case officer and HOMs for endorsement and inclusion into the heritage agreement.

SJ

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erven 977 and 978, 11 and 13 Virginia Avenue, Vredehoek: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ VREDEHOEK/ ERVEN 977 AND 978

Case No: HWC23091515KB0905

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Dr Stephen Townsend (heritage consultant), Ms Adelaide Combrink (CoCT), Mr Nicholas Smith (attorney representing applicant), Mr Giancarlo Bruno (applicant representative), Ms Kim Whitaker (I&APs) and Ms Nicola Davies-Laubscher (I&APs) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The new application follows a long history of a previous (unsuccessful) application for a much larger replacement structure.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition on condition that the replacement development is substantially in accordance with the SDP drawings SK01, SK02, SK03, SK04, SK05, SK06, SK08, SK09, SK10, SK011, SK12, SK13, SK16, SK17, SK19 dated 17 March 2022 and prepared by MLB Architecture Urban Design.

Should the site not be developed in accordance with the approved plans within 3 years of the granting of the demolition permit, any proposed development thereafter must be resubmitted to HWC for approval.

KB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on RE of Erf 48164, 7 Hampton Avenue, Newlands: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / NEWLANDS / ERF 48164

Case No: HWC23070311CN0718

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Ms Clair Abrahamse (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Detail design for interventions affecting the front façade of this 1860s cottage were presented, including a pergola design and replacement of windows with doors to be set into the period architraves.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 101, 201, 301 - Revision 0 dated 21 October 2023 prepared by JA from Anderson Perry Partnership Architects as having met the previous requirements.

CN

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1283, 290 Main Street, Voelklip, Hermanus: MA HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 1283

Case No: HWC23032311CH0329

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Tim Ziehl (architect), Ms Maureen Wolters (heritage consultant) and Ms Lyn Melfi (owner) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The applicant has sourced small black slates to replace the thatch roof of the historic building, which was supported by the committee.
- A suggestion was made to consider synthetic thatch which is fireproof, however aesthetic shortcomings of this product was noted.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered TZ-1501, Revision 2, dated 19 October 2023 prepared by Tim Ziehl Architects as having met the previous requirements.

CH

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 66083, 16 Alexandra Avenue, Wynberg: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WYNBERG/ ERF 66083

Case No: HWC23092706CH1005

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (heritage consultant) and Mr Francois du Plessis (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection Thursday, 23 November 2023 at 10:00 (DB, SJ, HB and HvdM).

CH

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4989, 78 Darling Street, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ERF 4989

Case No: HWC23090213CM0209

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the case.

Ms Berendine Irrgang (CoCT) and Ms Melanie Attwell (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is in a heritage sensitive location in the CBD HPOZ, being opposite the Castle, near the Parade as well as a series of heritage buildings.
- Following input by the heritage consultant, the design has been amended to achieve an outcome with a better fit in the context.
- Active street edges are important.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings 22012 04.CD-1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10 & 11 dated 4 September 2023 and prepared by TwoFiveFive Architects as having met previous requirements.

CM

**13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 567 and 568, 31 Belvedere Avenue, Oranjezicht: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ORANJEZICHT/ ERVEN 567 AND 568**

Case No: HWC23072707MS0806

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Daniel Hellenberg (architect) and Ms Berendine Irrgang (CoCT) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This early 20th C building is graded IIIA and in an HPOZ.
- CoCT supported the application with recommendations for roof windows.
- CIBRA objected, noting that *"this is one of the finest early 20th century buildings in all Oranjezicht and requires to be treated with ultimate architectural finesse and expertise.* Several problematic issues regarding the application are listed.
- Detail of the rear pop-out 'dormer' is problematic in that it does no justice to the overall symmetries and quality of detailing of the villa.
- The proposed external stair and balustrades are not well integrated in terms of placement and detail.
- The top of the large decorative roof light in the centre of the villa is located right next to the proposed dormer, but not shown on the section drawings.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Further requirements have not been met. The item will be held over until all information required has been submitted.

CH

**13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 88223, 3 Carisbrooke Steps, St James: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / ST JAMES / ERF 88223**

Case No: HWC23091310SJ0914

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Thursday, 23 November 2023 at 11:00 (DB, SJ, and HB).

SJ

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 13943, 79 Fairview Avenue, Woodstock: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / WOODSTOCK / ERF 13943

Case No: HWC23022309SJ0224

HELD OVER:

This item will be held over to the next BELCom meeting on 11 December 2023. The applicant is to be present at the meeting failing which a decision will be taken in their absence.

SJ

13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 95039, Ashanti Lodge, 11 Hof Street, Gardens: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GARDENS / ERF 95039

Case No: HWC23070610SJ0720

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Ms Berendine Irrgang (CoCT), Mr Stephen Mayers (architect) and Ms Patty Price (applicant) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Victorian villa on the site dates from 1898, built on the footprint of an earlier house, is graded IIIB and in an HPOZ.
- The stable building likely contains fabric from the early 19th c but has been much altered. Demolition of this structure has been agreed to.
- The revised proposal for a new building behind the main house has developed significantly but various concerns were noted. As it is highly visible from all sides a high degree of resolution is required.
- The CoCT notes improvements but does not support the revised proposal citing scale, volume, and extent of glazing (verbal feedback, not official written comment).
- Features of the proposal seen to have positive impact include a more 'active' interface with the park and the 'memory' of the stables building contained in the expression of the street and park facing façades.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Revisions to the façade, fenestration and roofing elements as discussed are to be explored. Revised proposals are to be submitted to BELCom for further deliberation.

SJ

**13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1276, Corner of Berg, and Dirkie Uys Street, Franschhoek: MA
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH / ERF 1276**

Case No: HWC23060903RG0614

DB recused himself and logged off from MS Teams. The Committee nominated HvdM to chair for this item. DG was present and co-opted for this item as this item was not quorate.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The late Victorian house is graded IIC, is located in the historic core of Franschhoek.
- Though alterations including interior changes and an addition behind the house have taken place the appearance from the street remains intact.
- The proposed double storey built partly over an existing garage, should read as a side-by-side building with its own expression.
- Concern was expressed about the technicalities of the box gutter which results from the proximity of the two buildings.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawing titled "Scheme E" indicating two Plans and three Elevations and one drawing titled "Detail Box Gutter," dated 17 October 2023 and prepared by Graham Goosen Architects as having met previous requirements. The technical details of the box gutter are to be endorsed by the Stellenbosch Municipality.

SJ

**13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4907, Pearl Mountain, Uitkyk Farm, Bo Lang Street, Groenvlei, Paarl: MA
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 4907**

Case No: HWC23071907SJ0726

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Ms Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality), Mr Johan Malherbe (Malherbe Architect), Mr Marnus Erasmus (Malherbe Architect) and Ms Nicolene Visser (Malherbe Architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Uitkyk homestead is graded IIIA and not in an HPOZ.
- The inclusion of the new extension in the thatch roofed area along with the required retention of thatch on the homestead is welcomed.

- The committee had no objection to the proposed demolition of the small cottage immediately north of the homestead.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 1101 Rev C; 1102 Rev C; 1200 Rev C; 1201 Rev C; 1202 Rev C; 1301 Rev C; 1302 Rev C; 1501 Rev C; 1601 Rev C; 1602 Rev C; 1603 Rev C; 1604 Rev C, dated 1 November 2023, prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects as having met previous requirements. The Committee requires a closeout report to be submitted within 30 days.

SJ

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

**14.1 Proposed New Dwelling on 17 Middle Street, Wupperthal: MA
HM / WEST COAST / CEDERBERG / WUPPERTHAL / FARM 168**

Case No: 21062302MS0706

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that the new window proportions match existing windows proportions. Lime mortars and renders are to be used on all heritage fabric.

SJ

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. OTHER

22.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 13:10

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

11 December 2023

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:


CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

11 December 2023


SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

11 December 2013