

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape  
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)  
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Thursday, 27 June 2024 via MS Teams**



**1. Opening and Welcome**

**NOTE:** Due to the Chairperson, Mr. Dennis Belter being unable to attend the meeting, and tendering apologies. Ms Waseefa Dhansay presided over the election of an Acting Chairperson in terms of the rule 12(5) of the Rules of Order and Conduct at Meetings of HWC. The Committee nominated Ms Heidi Boise to chair the meeting.

The Acting Chair, Ms Heidi Boise, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Committee Members:**

Ms Heidi Boise (HB) (Acting Chair)  
Ms Hélène van der Merwe (HvdM)  
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)  
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ)  
Mr Siphiso Mavumengwana (SM)

**Members of Staff:**

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)  
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)  
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)  
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)  
Emily Vowles (EW)  
Ms Chiara Singh (CSi)  
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)  
Ms Chane Herman (CH)  
Ms Corné Nortje (CN)  
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)

**Visitors:**

Mr Henry Aikman  
Mr Clive Theunissen  
Mr Johan Cornelius  
Ms Nicolene Visser  
Mr Neil Moir  
Mr Cahlan Williams  
Ms Claire Abrahamse  
Mr Stuart Burnett  
Mr Eugene Haasbroek  
Mr Raymond van Niekerk  
Ms Alex Edmayr  
Mr Shilo Hope

Mr Rickus Bosch  
Mr Alexis van der Merwe  
Mr Piers Mansfield-Scaddan  
Mr Chris Snelling  
Mr Tiaan du Toit  
Mr Paul Sundelson  
Ms Elize Mendelsohn  
Ms Melissa van Niekerk  
Ms Ursula Rigby  
Ms Ridwana Cassim  
Mr Shamiel Cassim  
Ms Adelaide Combrink

**Apologies**

Mr Dennis Belter (Chair)

**Absent**

None

#### **4. Approval of Agenda**

##### **4.1 Dated 27 June 2024.**

The Committee approved the agenda dated 27 June 2024.

#### **5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings**

##### **5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 30 May 2024**

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 30 May 2024 and resolved to approve them without amendments.

#### **6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:**

None

#### **7. Confidential Matters**

None

#### **8. Administrative Matters**

##### **8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

PM reported back on the following Appeals matters:

- Erf 55585, 26 Draper Street, Claremont
- Erf 357, 6B Devonport Road / 8 Signal View Close, Tamboerskloof
- Erf 46748, 67 Albion Road, Rondebosch

##### **8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:**

Nothing to report.

##### **8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition**

Nothing to report.

##### **8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders follow up**

For noting.

##### **8.5 Interim Reports for Erf 177506, Stonehenge, 36 Main Road, St James: MA CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / ST JAMES / ERF 177506**

**Case No:** 18120514HB0306E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee endorses and notes the interim reports prepared by Arcon, dated 28 March 2024, 29 April 2024 and 31 May 2024.

**SJ**

## **8.6 Tribunal Matters**

For noting

## **9. Standing Items**

### **9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports**

### **9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings**

Nothing to report.

### **9.3 Discussion of agenda**

Noted

### **9.4 Proposed Site Inspections**

- Proposed Total Demolition of the Barn Building on Erf 4269, 13 Main Road, Aan die Weg, Somerset West

### **9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken**

- Proposed Additions and Alteration Erf 232, 134 Beach Road, Gordons Bay
- Proposed Restorations on Erf 5943, 8 Thomas Street, Simons Town
- Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 1628, 4 Yarrowdale Road, Pinelands

## **10. Appointments**

None

## **MATTERS DISCUSSED**

## **11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

### **11.1 Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 775-RE, 469 Main Road, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / REMAINDER OF ERF 775**

**Case No:** HWC24011803CN0125

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant) and Mr Rickus Bosch (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is a PHS inside the Paarl Special Character Protected Zone.
- Plaster stripping was carried out at the old Barn to locate any previous openings.
- Building work had started on site. From photographs supplied it unfortunately appears that Portland cement has been used.

- The importance of leading stormwater away from the buildings' foundations was discussed. A civil engineer is preparing a stormwater drainage plan.

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

Recognising the concerns of I&APs regarding parking in front of the building and considering the recent unauthorised work the following further information is required for HOMs approval:

1. A set of drawings distinguishing between the unauthorised work undertaken and the proposed work to be executed.
2. A revised landscape/site plan indicating the revised parking layout and location of French drains or other measures for diverting sub surface water away from foundations.
3. A clear specification for lime mortars, renders and paint finishes that exclude Portland cement and allow for breathable wall surfaces wherever applicable.
4. Where floor slabs are to be introduced, details are to be provided to demonstrate that subsurface water will not get diverted into historic wall fabric, i.e. to avoid rising damp.
5. Oversight by a suitably qualified heritage practitioner to be a condition of approval. Appointment letter and CV to be submitted.

CN

#### **11.2 Proposed Additions on Remainder of Erf 2246, 163 Main Road, Strooidak NG Kerk, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / REMAINDER OF ERF 2246**

**Case No:** HWC23092717KB0928

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) was present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- An Archaeological Assessment Report was received, according to which the area around the church has been used as a burial area since c.1720. Of approximately 7500 recorded burials, about 5000 are unmarked.
- The play area is almost certainly underlain by any number of unmarked burials in addition to the few marked graves. It is not clear from the submission whether the congregation is aware of this and if so, whether they have any strong feelings regarding this strong likelihood.
- The placement of jungle gym and the trampoline location either side of a burial vault is regarded as highly problematic.

#### **HELD OVER:**

The matter to be held over for next BELCom meeting to be held on 31 July 2024 for archaeology input. IACom members to be invited to attend the meeting.

A Church representative and Mr Gribble (Author of the Archaeological Assessment) to be requested to be present at this meeting.

CN

## **12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

### **12.1 Proposed Total Demolition of the Barn Building on Erf 4269, 13 Main Road, Aan die Weg, Somerset West: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SOMERSET WEST / ERF 4269**

**Case No:** HWC24041203CN0521

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Mr Eugene Haasbroek (Owner Agrisa Properties) was present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and dates from the early 19<sup>th</sup> c.
- The proposal for demolition was not supported.
- Reconstruction with traditional clay building techniques was suggested, keeping these skills alive forms part of a living heritage.

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

1. The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 2 July 2024 at 11:00. (HB, SW and GJ).
2. Given that this building will need to be retained, the walls need to be stabilised urgently. The Committee requires that this be done forthwith within 5 days of receipt of this letter. HWC is to receive confirmation of compliance by a report containing photographs within 48 hours of stabilisation.
3. Whole bricks from fallen walls to be stacked and protected from the weather. Exposed tops of walls to be covered with a damp proof membrane fastened in place.

**CN**

### **12.2 Tribunal Referral for Proposed Total Demolition & Replacement Structure on Erf 55183, 24 Bishopslea Road, Claremont: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT / ERF 55183**

**Case No:** 22070704KB0708E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Alexis van der Merwe (Upper Claremont Residence and Ratepayers Association), Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant) and Mr Piers Mansfield-Scaddan (I&AP) were present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded Not Conservation Worthy and not in a declared HPOZ. However, it falls within the Claremont Village proposed special area.

- The Upper Claremont Residents' and Ratepayers' Association have opposed and commented on the proposals at various stages of the process.

**COMMENT:**

As the Committee is unable to understand whether the Tribunal's requirements have been met, the matter is to be referred back to the Tribunal.

**SJ**

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Unauthorised Work and Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3236, 154 Bree Street, Cape Town: MA  
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CAPE TOWN CITY CENTRE / ERF 3236**

**Case No:** HWC23111611KB1127

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site dates from the early 19<sup>th</sup> c, is graded IIIA and in an HPOZ.
- Unauthorised work has taken place, the most concerning being removal of the original roof leaving the interior including historic ceiling beams exposed to the elements.

**COMMENT:**

The Committee endorses the appointment of Ms. Claire Abrahamse as the heritage practitioner to submit the heritage statement. The Committee endorses the Emergency application report titled, "application for an Emergency Permit in terms of S.34 of the NHRA, 1999, for temporary protection of the structure at 154 Bree Street, Cape Town, Erf 3236", dated 18 June 2024 and prepared by Claire Abrahamse, with specific reference to section 7 on pages 8 to 10.

**SJ**

**13.2 Proposed Additions and Alteration Erf 232, 134 Beach Road, Gordons Bay: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GORDONS BAY/ERF 232**

**Case No:** HWC24022305SB0319

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

The owner was not able to log in to the meeting but listened to discussion via a phone call facilitated by staff.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 6 June 2024. See site inspection report attached as annexure SI1.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and not in an HPOZ.
- The CoCT heritage notes describe this early 20<sup>th</sup> c Cape Revival/ Arts and Crafts inspired building as a 'very good architectural example' of early residential development in Gordon's Bay.
- Unauthorised building work is taking place. The Committee is of the view that if continued in accordance with the proposals tabled, that would involve fairly major alterations to the interior and the roof resulting in the erosion of significance of the building.
- Assistance from a heritage consultant is strongly advised.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

1. The Committee requires that a stop works order be issued for all work on site.
2. The current proposal negatively impacts heritage significance and therefore it is strongly advised that the applicant engage a suitably qualified and experienced heritage architect to assist with the revised proposal.
3. Comprehensive documentation to be provided that includes structural and architectural drawings that must clearly distinguish between unauthorised and proposed works.

**SB**

**13.3 Proposed Additions and Additions, Erf 754, 8 Cheviot Place, Green Point: MA  
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GREEN POINT / ERF 754**

**Case No:** HWC23061909SB0826

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Chris Snelling (heritage consultant), Mr Neil Moir (representing the owner), Ms Elize Mendelsohn (CoCT) and Mr Stuart Burnett (Green Point Residents' and Ratepayers' Association) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This early 20<sup>th</sup> c building is graded IIIA and falls within an HPOZ. It is one of a series of five similar immediately adjacent buildings.
- Extensive unauthorised work has taken place that has had a negative impact on the significance of the structure.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

1. HWC cannot condone illegal work.
2. The Committee endorses the recommendations of the Heritage Consultant.
3. The recommendations of the Heritage Consultant to be included in a heritage agreement to be entered into with the owner of the site.
4. The Heritage Agreement is to include the following:
  - a. The exercising of a minimum bi-weekly monitoring brief by the heritage consultant with monthly report backs to HWC and a final closeout report to HWC within 60 days of practical completion.
  - b. Specifications to ensure material compatibility between new and old fabric.
  - c. A full set of As Built drawings to be submitted.

**SB**

**13.4 Proposed Restorations on Erf 5943, 8 Thomas Street, Simons Town: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SIMONS TOWN/ERF 5943**

**Case No:** 19051708AS0517E

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (heritage consultant), Ms Ridwana Cassim (owner) and Mr Shamiel Cassim (owner) were present and took part in the discussions.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 6 June 2024. See site inspection report attached as annexure SI2.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building known as the 'Royal Alfred Hall, is nearly 200 years old, graded IIIA and in an HPOZ.
- The social and material significance of the building was acknowledged.
- It is in a dilapidated state at present. Concerns were expressed in terms of achieving habitability and compliance for the intended purpose of use as an educational centre.
- The importance of using appropriately compatible material on historic fabric was emphasised, especially given the unfortunate inclusion of Portland cement in various specifications for the proposed remedial works. Various other concerns were expressed regarding the shortage of information in certain of the specifications. These concerns are elaborated on in the site inspection report.
- The site inspection report addressed both observations made on site and made reference to the documents under consideration, being the 'Scope of Works and Methodologies' (2024) and with reference to the 'Conditional Assessment Report' which includes a Heritage Report (2011).

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee endorses the findings and recommendations of the site inspection report dated 6 June 2024.

The heritage consultant to assist and advise the applicant with the following:

1. Full scope of works to include a clear set of priorities that list non-negotiable repair work for protection of the building envelope and for minimum compliance with the statutory requirements.
2. A methodology and specification requirements for all remedial work.
3. A comprehensive set of accurate drawings to be used as a base reference for remedial work.

**CH**

**13.5 Proposed Deviations on Erf 452, 30 Main Road, Hermanus: NM  
HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 452**

**Case No:** HWC24051432CH0522

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Tiaan du Toit (representing the client) and Ms Alex Edmayr (representing the architects) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- An application for this site was approved in 2022 and was acted on in that demolition of the existing structure was completed.
- A new owner took transfer of the site after the demolition took place.
- A revised design by a new team of architects is now under consideration.
- The Committee was of the opinion that the new design forms a better response to the site and context, however the oversized chimneys require modification to make them less obtrusive.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee supports the current proposal with the exception of the chimneys as per OHAC comments. The revised proposal to be submitted to HOMs for consideration and approval.

CH

**13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1177, 49 Buxton Avenue, Oranjezicht: MA  
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ORANJEZICHT/ ERF 1177**

**Case No:** HWC23101603CSI0527

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the case.

Ms Ursula Rigby (heritage consultant) and Ms Adelaide Combrink (CoCT) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building dates from 1931, is graded IIIB and in an HPOZ.
- The CoCT and the City Bowl Ratepayers' and Residents' Association were supportive of proposed alterations to the back of the building, however, did not support the proposed balcony enclosure on the front façade. CoCT holds the view that the front façade should not be altered.
- The heritage practitioner pointed out that this house was not built according to its original 1931 design, and that evidence points to in-process changes that resulted in a less successful façade.

- The Committee discussed various ways in which a sensitive intervention may be possible to achieve the owners' stated intention of enclosing the front veranda.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

1. The Committee supports the rear additions and internal alterations for the current proposal.
2. However, the extension to the front in its current form is not supported.
3. There is no issue in principle with the extension having a contemporary architectural expression provided that it is of a nature that retains the building's grade IIIB status by effective integration of the proposed intervention.
4. The Committee has concerns regarding the removal of the front door without any clarity as to where it would be relocated in the building.

CSI

**13.7 Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 1628, 4 Yarrowdale Road, Pinelands: MA  
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / PINELANDS / ERF 1628**

**Case No:** HWC23111611KB1127

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Ms Elize Mendelsohn (CoCT) was present and took part in the discussions.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 6 June 2024. See site inspection report attached as annexure SI3.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This thatched house, typical of Pinelands Arts & Crafts buildings, is graded IIIB but not in the Pinelands HPOZ.
- It appears to be an outlier with no other similar houses in the immediate vicinity.
- The context consists of mostly mid 20<sup>th</sup> c single and double storey hipped roof houses, as well as recently built contemporary examples.
- The house has been altered by a poorly executed double storey addition to the back.
- The grading of IIIB is questioned.
- The proposed design for a contemporary hipped roof building constitutes a 'de facto' demolition of the existing house.
- The CoCT and the Pinelands Heritage Advisory Committee did not support the proposals.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 2023-AWD00193\_AM - Revision 0 prepared by AW from AW Design and dated 16 November 2023 as not impacting heritage significance.

CN

**14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**14.1** None

**15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**15.1** None

**16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**16.1** None

**17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**17.1** None

**18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

**18.1** None

**19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

**19.1** None

**20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN**

**20.1** None

**21. NON-COMPLIANCE**

**21.1** None

**22. OTHER**

**22.1** None

**22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

**23. CLOSURE**

The meeting closed at 16:50

**24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**

31 July 2024

**MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:**

  
**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**31 July 2024**  
**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

  
**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_

**31 July 2024**  
**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_