

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 26 July 2023 via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)(Chair)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Mr Siphiwo Mavumengwana (SM)
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ)
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Naushina Rahim (NR)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Mr Robin George (RG)
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM)

Visitors:

Ms Ursula Rigby
Mr Eitan Levy
Ms Lize Malan
Mr Clive Theunissen
Mr Edwin Dwyer
Ms Carlo Pomario
Mr Chris Snelling
Ms Tamar Shem-Tov
Mr Tim Ziehl
Ms Johan Cornelius
Ms Katherine Mouyis
Mr Justin Honeyman
Mr Craig Palm

Ms Michelle Chireshe
Ms Lyn Melfi
Mr Adrian Koch
Ms Nelia Wolfaardt
Mr Christopher Mulder
Ms Maureen Wolters
Mr Stuart Anderson
Ms Cindy Postlethwayt
Mr Gianpiero Melfi
Ms Ntombi Njobe
Mr Storme Kriel
Mr Ahmed Peer

Apologies

Ms Athi Njoba (AN)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 26 July 2023.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 26 July 2023.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 26 June 2023

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 26 June 2023 and resolved to approve them with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

- GJ: items 12.1 and 13.7

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

NR reported back on the following appeals matters:

- SDP amendment from previously approved HIA - Erf 2189, 8 Granger Bay Boulevard, Green Point
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 55183, 24 Bishopslea Road, Claremont
- Proposed Hotel, Quay 7, East Pier Precinct, V&A Waterfront
- Proposed construction of a temple, administrative unit and utility building on Erf 160695, 80 Liesbeeck Ave, Observatory
- Proposed redevelopment of Hospital and Park, Earl Street, Woodstock
- Permit issued in Respect of Erf 576, 21 Quick Street, Stanford
- Erf 82, 11 Blackheath Street, Three Anchor Bay, Sea Point

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition.

Nothing to report.

8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders follow up.

For noting.

8.5 Erf 149294-Re, Time Out Market, Dock Road, V&A Waterfront: Monthly Reports: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / V&A WATERFRONT / ERF 149294-Re

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Ms Ursula Rigby (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

The three-monthly monitoring reports dated 17 April 2023, 15 June 2023 and 18 July 2023 submitted by Ms. Ursula Rigby were tabled and noted by the committee.

SJ

**8.6 Erven 4774 & 4777 - 96 Longmarket Street, Cape Town CBD: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CAPE TOWN / ERVEN 4774 & 4777**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Michelle Chireshe (project manager) and Mr Eitan Levy (applicant) were present.

HELD OVER:

The matter is to be tabled at the next BELCom meeting to be held on 30 August 2023 as an application (not under administrative matters).

KB

**8.7 Erf 177506, 36 Main Road, St James: NM
HM/ST JAME/ERF 177506**

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Mr Adrian Koch (applicant) were present and took part in the discussions.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 15 August 2023 at 11:00.

SJ

8.8 Wupperthal

Brief feedback following the HWC visit to Wupperthal on 4 July 2023 - for noting.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

- Erf 177506, 36 Main Road, St James
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2231, 165 Main Road, Paarl
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 980, 979, 985, 986 & 987, 8-12 Kloof Road & 93-95 New Church Street, Tamboerskloof.
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 95039, Ashanti Lodge, 11 Hof Street, Gardens

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

- Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 270, 28 Jarvis Street, De Waterkant, Green Point
- Erven 4774 & 4777, 96 Longmarket Street, Cape Town CBD

10. Appointments

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2231, 165 Main Road, Paarl: NM HWC/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ ERF 2231

Case No: HWC23062306RG0626

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Thursday, 17 August 2023.

RG

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 16109, Corner of Camp and Manitoka Street, Saldanha Bay: NM HM/ WEST COAST/ SALDANHA BAY/ ERF 16109

Case No: HWC23070601CH0606

GJ recused himself and logged off from MS Teams.

Ms Corné Nortje introduced the case.

Ms Lize Malan (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Saldanha Municipality defers to HWC Comment.
- Residents submitted letters of objection; however, many gave no reasons or did not motivate or present evidence in terms of heritage significance.
- The surrounding context of the site cannot be said to have heritage significance.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the full demolition of the buildings as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CH

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 619, 8C Govan Mbeki Road, Hanover Park/Philippi: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ PHILIPPI / ERF 619

Case No: HWC23061505AM0621

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

Mr Christopher Mulder (Western Cape Government Health Infrastructure), Ms Tamar Shem-Tov (CoCT) and Mr Stuart Anderson (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The buildings on the site, vacant at present, were home to the Springfield College and more recently other educational institutions.
- A Notice of Intent to Develop application for a public health facility on the site was submitted to HWC in 2018; HWC Comment noted that heritage resources would not be impacted.
- The CoCT did not support demolition of the old school at first, citing aesthetic, historical and social significance. However, in revised comment demolition was supported on condition that the history of the site is acknowledged as part of the redevelopment.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the full demolition of the buildings; subject to the memorialisation being to the satisfaction of the CoCT (E&HM).

AM

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 53909, 4 Molteno Road, Claremont: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CLAREMONT/ ERF 53909

Case No: HWC23061416

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Justin Honeyman (representing the owner) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Public participation – it was noted that there is no registered conservation body for this area.
- The site is subject to a praedial servitude imposed by developers of the neighbouring apartment building and is accordingly limited in terms of development potential.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the full demolition of the building as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

KB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 980, 979, 985, 986 & 987, 8-12 Kloof Road & 93-95 New Church Street, Tamboerskloof: NM
HWC/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ TAMBOERSKLOOF/ ERVEN 980, 979, 985, 986 & 987**

Case No: HWC23052607RG0530

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 15 August 2023 at 12:30.

RG

**13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 65048, 24 Gibson Road, Kenilworth: MA
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ KENILWORTH/ ERF 65048**

Case No: HWC23010306CH0119

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Ms Cindy Postlethwayt (Lower Kenilworth Improvement District) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- An amended proposal was submitted but failed to meet all of the requirements set by BELCom in March 2023.
- The revised proposal for a glazed enclosure on the gabled north facade is supported.
- Proposed Pool room- while the double pitched roof is supported, it is advised that the new roof eaves be constructed to match the main building's eaves detail.
- The revised drawings show a double pitch roof for the 'carport'; however, the mono-pitch roof as per the earlier proposal would be preferable as having less impact on the streetscape.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Previous further requirements have not been met given that two of the items have not been addressed. The applicant is required to address all previous further requirements and is advised to consider comment made by the I&APs. The outstanding further requirements are:

1. The applicant is to provide a street elevation which shows the carport structure and the boundary treatment.
2. Drawings are to be updated to accurately reflect the as-built structure.

CH

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1283, 290 Main Road, Voëlklip, Hermanus: NM HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 1283

Case No: HWC23032311CH0329

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Mr Tim Ziehl (architect), Mr Gianpiero Melfi and Ms Lyn Melfi (owners) and Ms Maureen Wolters (I&AP) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is in a key position being next to a historic open space which would be very visible from the cliff path.
- Heritage Protection Overlay Zone regulations (published by the local authority in 2020) to be observed in terms of building requirements for the coastal strip.
- The context is characterised by buildings with soft 'flowing' sloping roof lines, be it in thatch, or flexible slates as suggested by members of the Committee. Rigid tiles, slates and especially roof sheets are much less likely to achieve the desired roof configurations. A consistency of colour – grey roofs, white walls – can be observed.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Applicant is to provide the heritage statement as required by HOMs, amendments and changes are to be tabled with design indicators and photomontages. Cognisance should be taken of design guidelines and I&APs comments were relevant.

CH

13.4 Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 270, 28 Jarvis Street, De Waterkant, Green Point: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GREEN POINT / DE WATERKANT / ERF 270

Case No: HWC23060209CN0608

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 18 July 2023. See attached annexure SI1.

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

Ms Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIB and located in the Loader Street HPOZ.
- The old Baptist Mission Hall (built 1890s) is proposed for use as a residence which includes internal alterations and additional floors being added to the ancillary structure against the southern end of the Hall.

- CoCT and De Waterkant Civic Association had objections to the initial design proposal.
- CoCT supported a revised proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered LUM1.001, LUM1.002, LUM1.100, LUM1.200, LUM1.300, LUM1.400, LUM1.500, LUM1.600, LUM2.100, LUM2.200, LUM2.300, LUM2.400, LUM2.500, LUM3.100, LUM3.200, LUM3.300, LUM3.400, LUM3.500, LUM4.100, LUM4.200, LUM4.300, LUM4.400 - Revision A dated 25 and 26 May 2023 prepared by CM from Jenny Mills Architect as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CN

**13.5 Proposed Alteration and Addition on Erf 975, 397 Main Road, Sea Point: MA
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SEA POINT/ ERF 975**

Case No: HWC2304011

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Katherine Mouyis & Mr Storme Kriel (architects) and Mr Carlo Pomoria & Mr Craig Palm (on behalf of company doing the redevelopment) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC and located in an HPOZ.
- A minor Works permit was issued by HWC, however, alterations outside the scope of this permit ensued.
- The initial proposal which included removal of the original shopfront was not supported by Sea Point For All and CoCT
- The amended proposal, retaining the original shopfront, was supported along with the internal alterations.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 20,21,22,23,24 dated 12 June 2023 prepared by MEA Architects as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

KB

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 95039, Ashanti Lodge, 11 Hof Street, Gardens: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GARDENS / ERF 95039

Case No: HWC23070610SJ0720

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 15 August 2023 at 14:30.

SJ

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at: 12:30

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

30 August 2023

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:


CHAIRPERSON _____

30 August 2023
DATE _____


SECRETARY _____

30 August 2023
DATE _____

Approved