

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 24 April 2024 via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)(Chair)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)
Mr Sipiwo Mavumengwana (SM)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Naushina Rahim (NR)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Emily Vowles (VW)
Ms Chiara Singh (CS)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)

Visitors:

Mr Mark Bell
Ms Elbe Cooper
Mr Richard Summers
Mr Shaun Adendorff
Mr Johan Cornelius
Ms A O'Connor-Smith
Mr Sean Hayden
Mr Mike Scurr

Mr Ashley Lillie
Ms Belinda McFadzean
Ms Elma Hamman
Mr Stuart Burnett
Mr Corne Viljoen
Ms Samantha Dyer
Mr Neil Moir

Apologies

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 24 April 2024.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 24 April 2024.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 14 March 2024

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 14 March 2024 and resolved to approve them with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:
None

7. Confidential Matters
None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

NR reported back on the following Appeals matters:

- Erf 172010 Beach Road, Muizenberg, Empire West Building
- Erf 55585, 26 Draper Street, Claremont
- Erf 1790, 1 Dudley Road (38 Rhine Road), Sea Point

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:
Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition.
Nothing to report.

8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders follow up.
For noting.

8.5 RE of Erf 2246, 163 Main Road, Paarl (Strooidak Church) - Request for extension to submit Further Requirements

The Committee resolved that an extension is granted, documentation to be submitted in time for the BELCom meeting of 27 June 2024.

CN

8.6 Erf 7182, 39 Marine Drive, Hermanus

The Committee approved the partial demolition of the stone boundary wall bounding Erf 7182 Hermanus on 30 November 2022, subject to a qualified heritage architect with specialist knowledge in stone construction provide guidance and monitoring of all heritage related processes including the dismantling, underpinning, reconstruction and other works. Mr. Mike Scurr has been appointed to oversee the work.

The Committee is supportive of Mike Scurr being appointed to oversee the proposed work.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports
Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings
Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

- Erf 754, 8 Cheviot Place, Green Point

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 46748, 67 Albion Road, Rondebosch

10. Appointments

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 None

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 46748, 67 Albion Road, Rondebosch: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ RONDEBOSCH/ ERF 46748

Case No: HWC23121303CH0223

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 17 April 2024.

Mr Mark Bell (CoCT), Mr Ashley Lillie (heritage consultant), Ms Elbe Cooper (representing the owner) and Ms Belinda McFadzean (representing I&APs) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Site inspection report was tabled and discussed.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as the structure has insufficient heritage value to warrant retention.

CH

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition & Replacement Structure on Erf 334, 21 Victoria Road, Bantry Bay (Tribunal Condition): MA
CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / BANTRY BAY / ERF 334**

Case No: 21030408XM0422E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Shaun Adendorff (architect), Mr Ashley Lillie (heritage consultant), Mr Richard Summers (representing landowners) and Ms Elma Hamman (I&AP) were present and took part in the discussions.

HELD OVER:

The matter is held over until the next BELCom meeting to be held on 30 May 2024.

SJ

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**13.1 Detail Design for Union Castle Building on Erf 149294-RE, Dock Road, Pierhead Precinct, V&A Waterfront: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / V&A WATERFRONT / ERF 149294-RE**

Case No: HWC23012709SJ0130

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Ms Samantha Dyer (V&A Waterfront), Mr Mike Scurr (RSA) and Mr Sean Hayden (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the amendment as presented in report titled "Union Castle Building Submission - Roof Details", dated April 2024, prepared by KMH.

SJ

**13.2 Erf 754, 8 Cheviot Place, Green Point: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GREEN POINT / ERF 754**

Case No: HWC23061909SB0826

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Stuart Burnett (Green Point Ratepayers' & Residents' Association) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is located in a HPOZ and graded Grade IIIA.
- All works on the site, whether perceived to be approved or not, is to stop immediately. The Chairperson of BELCom and the case officer will visit the site on Thursday, 25 April 2024.
- The proposed drawings do not in any way resemble the previous approval by HWC in 2019.

RECORD OF DECISION:

That, as there is good reason to believe that the conditions of the permit granted on 22 November 2019 are not being complied with, the applicant be requested in terms of Regulation 4(3)(a) of the regulations to the NHRA published on 29 August 2003 in Provincial Notice 298 to provide reasons why the said permit should not be revoked within 14 days of this being communicated to them.

SB

**13.3 Unauthorised Work on Erven 890, 979, 985, 987 & 986, Cloud Nine Hotel, 8, 10 & 12 Kloof Nek Road, 93 & 95 New Church Road, Tamboerskloof: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / TAMBOERSKLOOF / ERVEN 890, 979, 985, 987, 986**

Case No: HWC23052607RG0530

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant) and Mr Corne Viljoen (representing the owner) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Two options were presented for the proposed triple storey building on Erf 987, 95 New Church Street, C1&2 and D1&2, which will conceal the tall blank wall of the 'spine' rooftop area.
- These options were discussed by the committee who preferred C1&2 but with inclusion of an element from D1&2, being a two-storey veranda across the front of the building, so as to create a step up to the triple storey section behind.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

1. Additional information is requested for the shopfront column sizes considering a redesign is required to accommodate the glass roof option.
2. The Committee supports the proposal to the roofing elements of the spine buildings.
3. The Committee prefers option C1 with a double story balcony across the front of the building and encourages the applicant to pursue this design proposal.

SJ

13.4 Erf 938-Re, Corner Pentz Street and Yusuf Drive, Bo-Kaap

The Committee resolved to approve the application as in line with the previous approval.

SJ

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. OTHER

22.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 11:10

24

DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

30 May 2024

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

30 May 2024
DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

30 May 2024
DATE _____

APPROVED