

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 16 April 2025 via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Ms Heidi Boise, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Ms Heidi Boise (HB) (Chair)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Siphiso Mavumengwana (SM)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ)

Members of Staff:

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)
Ms Emily-Jane Vowles (EJV)
Ms Chiara Singh (CSi)
Mr Ruan Brand (RB)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Ms Chané Herman (CH)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Sofia Vy Menell Briel (SVMB)
Ms Yusrah Hoosain (YH)

Visitors:

Mr Henry Aikman
Mr Rikus Bosch
Ms Uryke de Preez
Ms Nicolene Visser
Mr Denis Balent
Mr James Hallinan
Ms Ursula Rigby
Mr Michael Louis
Mr Ashley Lillie
Ms Berendine Irrgang
Mr Bruce Wilson
Mr Reinjer Visser
Mr Lotang'amwaki Mollel

Mr Clive Theunissen
Mr Gerhard Ondendaal
Mr Maximilian Krome
Mr Jayson Clarke
Mr Chris Snelling
Mr Johan Cornelius
Mr Peter Urry
Ms Luis Mira
Dr Stephen Townsend
Ms Elize Mendelsohn
Mr Jone Kros
Mr Morne Moller

Apologies

Ms Karin Dugmore-Strom (KDS)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 16 April 2025.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 16 April 2025.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 12 March 2025

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 12 March 2025 and resolved to approve them without amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

- HB: item 13.4

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the following Appeals matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 56314, 64 Newlands Road, Claremont
- Proposed Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition on Erf 168487, 124 Waterkant Street, Cape Town
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1397, Bonne Esperance Boutique Guest House, 17 Van Riebeeck Street, Stellenbosch

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

HWC has issued a number of Stop Works orders in the recent past.

However, HWC have limited resources for follow up and often must rely on local authorities and building inspectorate to enforce and to monitor sites where Stop Works have been imposed.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

Nothing to report.

8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders follow up

For noting.

8.5 SAHRIS

Committee to familiarize themselves with the SAHRIS system ahead of the transition later this year. Submissions will commence with NID applications.

8.6 Ptn of Erf 26439-RE, Oude Molen Precinct, Pinelands referral

A BELCom member to be seconded to attend the site inspection and next IACom meeting for this case. Mr Graham Jacobs will be attending.

8.7 HWC Workshop

A proposed workshop regarding thatch replacement options would have to involve a wide range of stakeholders. A likely date would be in the second half of the year. A webinar format is proposed.

8.8 Standard template for case folders

HvdM to contact WD directly.

8.9 Muizenberg Train Station

A meeting took place between HWC and PRASA. Regarding repair work at the Train Station, HWC is planning to issue a Compulsory Repair Order to PRASA via the upcoming HWC Council Meeting. HWC to circulate the site inspection report to the Committee to review and to flag important points.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

None

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report. The next Council meeting is scheduled for 23 May. BELCom's matters for the agenda are to be submitted to the Chair by 14 May.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

None

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

- Proposed Deviation on Erf 775-RE, 469 Main Road, Paarl
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 65885, 1 Sunningdale, 11 Tennant Street, Kenilworth

10. Appointments

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Deviation on Erf 775-RE, 469 Main Road, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / REMAINING EXTENT OF ERF 775

Case No: HWC25020518CN0212

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 1 April 2025. See site inspection report attached as annexure SI1.

Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant), Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) and Mr Rikus Bosch (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is a PHS consisting of a 19th c farmhouse and barn/cellar building located inside the Paarl Special Character Protected Zone.
- A permit was granted by HWC on 16 July 2024 for alteration & addition work.
- Drakenstein Municipality reported deviations from the approved plan as well as unauthorised work relating to a second phase of the project.
- Following the committee's site inspection held on 1 April, concern was expressed about various issues, including:
 - A parking area in front of the historic homestead;
 - An unauthorised and visually inappropriate street boundary fence which negatively impacts the street interface;
 - Buildings along the north boundary built up to first floor and not yet approved;
 - Documentation submitted is not completely in accordance with all aspects of the works as observed at the site inspection;
 - The historic wall along the north boundary is a clay brick wall in a weathered condition having lost most of its lime plaster. The specification proposed in the documentation is not appropriate for the material and condition of the wall. An appropriate methodology and specification are required;
 - Lime plaster to be used throughout; and
 - Oversight by a suitably qualified and experienced heritage practitioner to the approval of HWC was noted as a condition of approval (refer further requirements of BELCom 27 June 2024) however, no heritage practitioner has been appointed.

RECORD OF DECISION:

1. The Committee resolved to revoke the permit dated 16 July 2024 as the deviations from the permit have negatively impacted on heritage resources.
2. The stop works order dated 24 March 2025 remains in place.
3. The Committee recommends that charges be laid.

CN

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposal Total Demolition on Erf 2645, 65 Main Street, Paarl: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ ERF 2645

Case No: HWC23121308CH1214

Ms Chané Herman introduced the case.

Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site has not been graded and proposed to be grade IIIC or NCW and inside the Paarl Special Character Protected Area.
- The case was before the Committee on 28 Feb 2024, further requirements were given w.r.t. the replacement building.
- A new and completely different proposal by a different architect has now been presented.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requires further information before it can make a decision. That includes the following:

1. A graphic streetscape analysis upon which design indicators for the scale, envelope characteristics and architectural treatment can be based.
2. A street plan showing both sides of the Main Street and the relative spatial interfaces with the street. The street plan must also indicate the footprint of the proposed building in relation to its neighbours. This must include an indication of street setbacks and side setbacks in relation to the proposed development's neighbours.
3. The extent of the study area addressed in the street plan is to be determined by the heritage consultant in conjunction with the architects so that it provides the Committee with sufficient information to understand the spatial context.
4. A photomontage and some 3D views showing the proposed replacement building within the surrounding environment.
5. A comprehensive revised proposal is to be circulated for comment to all I&APs for 30 days.

CH

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**13.1 Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 301, 26 Loader Street, Green Point: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GREEN POINT / ERF 301**

Case No: HWC25011610CN0117

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Jayson Clarke (heritage consultant), Mr Maximilian Krome (owner) and Mr Denis Balent (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and is located inside the Loader Street HPOZ.
- The building, a small single story house, pre-dates 1895.
- This project was initially permitted in 2019, after which delays followed and extensions of the permit, until sold to a new owner whereupon demolition work started, leaving only front and side walls standing.
- However, the permit had again lapsed, and a Stop Works order was issued, albeit apparently in error.
- The design for a three storey building has been revised with input from De Waterkant Civic Association (DWCA).
- DWCA and CoCT supported the revised proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as shown on drawing numbered CCC.100, Revision A, prepared by DV8 Architects and dated 4 December 2024 as not negatively impacting the heritage resources.

CN

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 557, 18 Alexandra Avenue, Oranjezicht: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ORANJEZICHT/ ERF 557

Case No: HWC24110642CSI1120

Ms Chiara Singh introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant), Ms Ursula Rigby (interested and affected party) and Mr Peter Urry (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The existing mid-20th century house is listed as not conservation worthy.
- The site is located inside the Upper Table Valley HPOZ and with PHS, Grade IIIA and IIIB properties in the immediate vicinity.
- A revised proposal has been submitted.
- Objections were received from neighbouring interested & affected parties.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The revised proposal is approved as per SDP Report Revision 10, dated 31 March 2025 and prepared by Malan Vorster Architects. Further design refinements must be dealt with by the City of Cape Town in terms of the LUMS process.

CSi

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alteration on Erf 232, 134 Beach Road, Gordons Bay: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GORDONS BAY/ERF 232

Case No: HWC24022305SB0319

HELD OVER:

The item has been withdrawn from the agenda.

SB

**13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 65885, 1 Sunningdale, 11 Tennant Street, Kenilworth: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ KENILWORTH/ ERF 65885**

Case No: HWC25021323XM0214

HB recused herself and joined the applicant. The Committee nominated HvdM to chair this item. HB logged out of the meeting during Committee deliberations.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 1 April 2025. See

Ms Heidi Boise (heritage consultant) and Mr Michael Louis (owner) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and not in an HPOZ.
- The villa was designed by Herbert Baker in 1893 and has been altered over time.
- However, its overall appearance (with the exception of the southeast façade) and including highly detailed and crafted interiors remain largely intact.
- The committee recommends a grading of IIIA.
- Alterations including steel enclosures at NE veranda, steel doors at SE façade), a new terrace (SE elevation) and a small addition (kitchen extension) have been made in recent years without first obtaining the required permits.
- As Built drawings have been submitted.
- The Committee conducted a site inspection to view the unauthorised work.
- During the site inspection various inconsistencies between the drawings and structures as observed were noted.

COMMENT:

HWC cannot condone unauthorised work.

The kitchen alteration being contemporary in expression is unobtrusive and does not negatively impact heritage resources.

The north east veranda is an important architectural element that should be commensurate with the significance of the building by having an integrated appearance which the modern steel enclosure currently does not provide.

The south east elevation is negatively impacted by the steel doors.

The terrace does not impact heritage significance to a great degree.

The Committee resolved not to press charges for the unauthorised work on condition that the following mitigation measures are taken:

1. Failing replacement of the steel frames a change of colour to match the remaining veranda structure.
2. The addition of matching arched elements to integrate with the earlier veranda structure.

XM

13.5 Proposed Development on Erven 2177-Re & 157932, 60 & 58 Loop Street, Cape Town: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CAPE TOWN CBD / ERVEN 2177-RE & 157932

Case No: HWC24062809SJ0717

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Dr Stephen Townsend (acting on behalf of neighbour), Ms Berendine Irrgang (CoCT), Ms Elize Mendelsohn (CoCT), Mr Bruce Wilson (applicant), Mr Jone Kros (applicant) and Mr Reinier Visser (Cape Institute for Architecture Heritage Review Committee) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- No 60 and No58 Loop Street are located inside the Central City HPOZ and are graded IIIB and IIIA respectively.
- The two erven form part of a proposed redevelopment which was previously seen at HWC as a single application and which proposed cross connections between the two buildings.
- No.60 is proposed to receive many additional storeys.
- The extent of the proposed tower is being opposed by various interested and affected parties.
- The committee was informed that a design proposal for No60 not resembling the application as seen by HWC was circulating at CoCT.
- The proposal for conversion of No58 from offices to residential use is being presented as a single application for consideration by HWC at this meeting. No connections to the neighboring No60 are shown on this revised proposal and No60 has not been included for consideration.
- Discussion followed as to whether HWC can consider the case as two separate applications or not.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is unable to make a decision and requires the following information:

1. The applicant to clarify the spatial connections between No.58 and No.60.
2. A revised proposal as submitted to CoCT LUMS to be provided.
3. Should the revised proposal differ from the previous RoD dated 28 August 2024 the applicant is to clarify the differences.
4. This revised proposal must be submitted to HWC.

SJ

13.6 Proposed Painting of Erf 4595, 55 St. Georges Mall, SS. Union Castle Building, Cape Town: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CAPE TOWN CBD / ERF 4595

Case No: HWC24110609CSI1112

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Lotang'amwaki Mollel (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is an early-mid 20th century office building graded IIC and inside the Central City HPOZ.
- The application is for repainting in a bold black and white pattern over large parts of the structure.
- Materials proposed to be painted include plasterwork, metal, concrete and sandstone.
- It was noted that for long-term protection of sandstone, it should not be painted.
- Whether paintwork is a 'reversible' intervention depends on the material being painted and the processes required to return to original finish.

RECORD OF DECISION:

1. The Committee resolved to approve the proposal as per the undated report, prepared by Evolve Habits subject to a methodology statement for the cleaning of the sandstone being submitted to HWC.
2. Once the methodology statement is approved, HWC will provide the required permit.

SJ

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations- Deviation on Erf 912-RE, 55 Long Street, Montagu: MA
HM/BOLAND/ BREEDE RIVER/ MONTAGU/ ERF 912-RE

Case No: HWC24102508XM01234

HELD OVER:

The item has been withdrawn from the agenda.

XM

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. OTHER

22.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 14:55

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

21 May 2025

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____