

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Thursday, 12 October 2023 via MS Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)(Chair)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ)
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Mr Sipiwo Mavumengwana (SM)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Naushina Rahim (NR)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)

Visitors:

Mr Richard Summers
Mr Johan Cornelius
Ms Nicolene Visser
Mr Stuart Burnett
Cllr Nateshia Combrink
Mr Tim Ziehl
Mr Ludi Cronje

Mr Arthur Levin
Ms Adelaide Combrink
Mr Salman Kajie
Mr Clive Theunissen
Ms Berta Hayes
Ms Maureen Wolters
Mr Johan Malherbe

Apologies

Ms Athi Njoba (AN)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 12 October 2023.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 12 October 2023.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 20 September 2023

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 20 September 2023 and resolved to approve them without amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest

- GJ: item 13.1

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

NR reported back on the following Appeals and Tribunal matters:

- Proposed New Accommodation Building on Erf 160695, 80 Liesbeeck Ave, Observatory
- Section 34 Permit issued in respect of Doves Funerals & Mortuary facilities at Erf 16337, 267 Victoria Road, Salt River
- Proposed Declaration of Newlands Rugby Stadium, Newlands

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition.

Nothing to report.

8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders follow up.

For noting.

**8.5 Appointment of Practitioner for Erf 177506, Stonehenge, 36 Main Road, St James
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / ST JAMES / ERF 177506**

Case No: 18120514HB0306E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the appointment of Mr Graham Jacobs as the heritage practitioner for this item.

SJ

8.6 Union Castle Building, V&A Waterfront

The Committee is happy with the revised drawings for signage and lighting; the matter is to be tabled at HOMs for approval.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

None

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

- Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 907, 24 Marmion Road, Oranjezicht on 12 September 2023.
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Portions 4 & 6 of Farm 100, Morgenhof Wine Estate, Stellenbosch on 12 September 2023.
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4907, Pearl Mountain, Uitkyk Farm, Bo Lang Street, Groenvlei, Paarl on 12 September 2023.

10. Appointments

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 None

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 907, 24 Marmion Road, Oranjezicht: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN, ORANJEZICHT / ERF 907

Case No: HWC23062601

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on Tuesday, 12 September 2023. See attached annexure SI1.

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant) and Ms Adelaide Combrink (CoCT) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIA and not in a HPOZ.
- The CoCT did not support the proposed demolition.
- There are several historic windows and doors which can be reused, either in the new development on this site, or be made available for reuse elsewhere.
- An architectural salvage storage bank needs to be created to accommodate historical doors, windows, and other valuable and unique salvage pieces for future use.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application for demolition. The historic windows and doors are to be salvaged and preserved.

KB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Portions 4 & 6 of Farm 100, Morgenhof Wine Estate, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH/ PORTIONS 4 AND 6 OF FARM 100**

Case No: HWC22053008CH0815

GJ recused himself and joined the applicants.

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on Tuesday, 12 September 2023. See attached annexure SI2.

Mr Graham Jacobs (heritage consultant), Mr Salman Kajie (Executive Director), Ms Berta Hayes (Stellenbosch Interest Group) and Ms Nateshia Combring (Councillor for Ward 6) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The werf with the oldest building dating from the 18thC is graded IIIA and set in a grade II landscape.
- Further assessment of the site should also include the historic fowl-house.
- It was noted that many of the changes have taken place incrementally over time and over different ownerships and may not in themselves have triggered S.34 of the NHRA.
- An overall heritage management strategy for the historic werf and the surrounding expansion would be helpful to recover and preserve heritage significance.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has prepared and endorsed a comprehensive site inspection report detailing further requirements including time frames for implementation of remedial work (Refer Site Inspection report, Recommendations, p.12). The applicant is to respond timeously.

CH

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1283, 290 Main Street, Voelklip, Hermanus: MA HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 1283

Case No: HWC23032311CH0329

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Ms Maureen Wolters (heritage consultant) and Mr Tim Ziehl (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC and located inside a HPOZ.
- The site is in a highly visible location, being on a corner adjacent to open space that connects with the Cliff Path. Views towards the proposed development to be considered in terms of visual impact and its relationship to the houses towards the west.
- The rounded shapes of thatch roofs is an important feature within the surrounding context.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is in general support of the proposal; however, the roof material and form require further exploration. Thatch or a suitable thatch replacement material should be considered.

CH

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4907, Pearl Mountain, Uitkyk Farm, Bo Lang Street, Groenvlei, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 4907

Case No: HWC23071907SJ0726

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality), Mr Johan Malherbe (architect) and Ms Nicolene Visser (Admin at Malherbe Architects) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The methodology proposed to raise the tie beam is acceptable.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requires the retention of the thatch roof of the historic building as per previous requirements.

SJ

**13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 363, 30 High Level Road, Green Point: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GREEN POINT / ERF 363**

Case No: HWC23022104RG0223

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Richard Summers (attorney) and Mr Arthur Levin (owner) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This building known as 'Sicilia' is graded IIIB and not in a HPOZ.
- Further revisions to the proposals for mitigation following unauthorised work was presented.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee endorses the mitigation measures proposed in Option A (single column) on drawings numbered S-1001 (OPTION A); S-1000 (OPTION A); S-1002 (OPTION A); S-2000 (OPTION A); S-2002 (OPTION A); S-2003 (OPTION A), dated 2023-10-10, and prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects. A heritage agreement to be entered into which includes the proposed mitigation.

SJ

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 11:00

24. DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

9 November 2023

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

9 November 2013
DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

9 November 2023
DATE _____