

**APPROVED MINUTES THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE, APPEALS
COMMITTEE
HELD ON WEDNESDAY, 8th April 2026, MICROSOFT TEAMS, SCHEDULED FOR 08:30**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson, Mr Gregory Ontong, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Gregory Ontong (GO)
Ms Corlie Smart (CS)
Dr André van Graan (AvG)
Mr Peter Büttgens (PB)(9:24)
Mr Piet Louw (PL)
Mr John Harris (JH)

Members of Staff:

Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)
Ms Chiara Singh (CSI)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Emily Vowles (EJV)
Ms Sofia Vy Menell Briel (SVMB)
Mr Ruan Brand (RB)
Ms Corne Alexander (CA)
Ms Nuraan Vallie (NV)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)

Visitors:

Richard Summers
Shreea Maharaj
James Nathan
Andrew Flint
Shawn Johnston
Bert Johnson
Gill Spreeth
Sneha Jhupsee
Ntombekhaya Nkoane
Ryan Robynson

Danielle Yeatman
Luyanda Mpahlwa
Bridget O'Donoghue
Emma Kaplan
Ashleigh Reimers
Clarice Arende
Chris Snelling
Tameron Paulse
Mareli Jordaan
Eloise Wessels

3. Apologies

None

4. Declaration for members to re-affirm their commitment to the Code of Conduct

Members re-affirmed their commitment to the Code of Conduct.

5. Approval of Agenda dated 8th April 2026.

- 5.1** The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 8th April 2026. CS moved to adopt the approval of the agenda and AvG seconded.

6. Disclosure and Conflicts of Interest

6.1 None

7. Approval previous of Minutes dated 4th March 2026.

7.1 The Committee resolved to approve the Minutes dated 4th March 2026. CS moved to adopt the Minutes as accurate and AvG seconded.

8. Confidential Matters

8.1 None

9. Administrative Matters

9.1 Outcome of the Tribunal and Recent Court Decisions

PM

9.2 Report back from HWC Council

None.

9.3 Site Visits undertaken/Site Inspection Report(s)

9.3.1 Erf: 9998, 13 Adderley Street, Cape Town.

9.4 Potential Site Visit

9.4.1 Erf: 13777, 21 Queens Park Avenue, Salt River,

Date 5th May 2026. Attending Chair. G. Ontong, Mr. P. Büttgens and Dr. A. van Graan

9.4.2 Erf: 162, 15 Avenue La Croix, Fresnaye

Date 8th May 2026. Attending Chair. G. Ontong, Mr. P. Büttgens and Dr. A. van Graan

9.5 Discussion of attendance at any upcoming Tribunal meetings

9.5.1 None

9.6 Discussion of the Agenda

9.6.1 None.

9.7 Appointments

9.7.1 None.

9.8 Committee establishment for Erf 9998, 13 Adderley Street, Cape Town

9.8.1 The co-opted members to be co-opted again when this matter is dealt with in future.

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

10 Matters Arising

10.1 Erf: 9998, 13 Adderley Street, Cape Town.

**HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CAPE TOWN CITY CENTRE
/ ERF 9998**

Case No: HWC24101603SVB1030

Appeal against BELCom's Committee Meeting.

Ms Sofia Briel introduced the item.

Mr Richard Summers: presented on behalf of the appellant.

Mr Summers noted that:

- Building is deteriorating badly due to lack of use and requires maintenance.
- It is located inside a declared HPOZ- which does not prescribe development guidelines.
- Büttgens argues that a HPOZ does not limit development rights but is created to ensure appropriate development in a particular heritage area.
- The design acknowledges the high degree of original heritage fabric which is to be retained and celebrated.
- Some of the historic fabric is to be demolished as per the heritage indicators.
- The most significant heritage fabric, including all facades will be subject to minor interventions.
- The ISDF is a policy guideline which is not legally binding.
- The GB7 grading and MU3 zoning indicate properties identified as areas for potential densification and urban regeneration.
- CiFA indicated the need for quality design interventions within the inner city.
- There is no height limitation imposed by the NHRA or any regulations promulgate thereunder.
- Indicated that the Golden Acre was built to a height of 90m and Cartwright's Corner to a height of 130m.

DISCUSSION

- The application was previously noted at the Appeals Committee meeting that was held on the 4th of March 2025 and the Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection.
- A site inspection was undertaken on the 2nd of April 2026 by Mr P. Louw, Dr. A.van Graan, Mr J. Harris and the Chairperson Mr G. Ontong.
- The Appeals is against a BELCom decision to refuse the application for alterations and partial demolition of the site on basis that it has a negative impact on the heritage resource.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The committee supports adaptive reuse / revitalisation of the site and its immediate surrounds in principle, with further requirements:

- The committee confirms that the interior banking hall space and associated architectural features as well as, the external façade interface facing Adderley Street are unique for their rarity and architectural qualities. The demolition of any part of the banking hall is not supported. The committee is of the view that a Grade II designation is appropriate and recommends that a Provincial Heritage Site declaration be considered.
- The committee is concerned about the height of the tower component in terms of the impact on the skyline and the broader (urban) landscape, the mountain silhouette and background relationship when viewed from dominant public orientated views.
- The loss of pedestrian dominated space on Parliament Street and its impact on cultural heritage due to the vehicular access to the proposal, is problematic and needs to be addressed.
- The lack of spatial and townscape integration with the immediate cluster of significant buildings, in terms of their height and shared contribution to the precinct, needs to be addressed.

Revised proposals are required which address the above concerns which must be informed by clear heritage design informants. The revised proposals must be submitted to the registered conservation bodies and interested and affected parties to enable further consultation and allow 30 days for comments to be submitted. The consultation must include users of the immediate surrounds. It is recommended that a report on the outcome of the further consultation be submitted.

SFB

11 New Matters

- 11.1 "Erf: 13777, 21 Queens Park, Salt River
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/ SALT RIVER/ERF 13777
Case No: 26947CH0105

Appeal against HOMs's Committee Meeting.

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

CH

DECISION

The matter is held over to the next Appeals Committee meeting, pending a site visit.

- 11.2 Erf: 162, 15 Avenue La Croix, Fresnaye.
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/ FRESNAYE/ERF 162
Case No: 27315RB0209

Appeal against HOMs's Committee Meeting.

Mr Ruan Brand introduced the item.

DECISION

The matter is held over to the next Appeals Committee meeting, pending site visit.

RB

12. Other Matters: For Noting

- 12.1 None

13. Proposed next date of the meeting to be held online: 13th May 2026.

14. Adoption of decisions and resolutions

The Committee unanimously adopted the decisions and resolutions, with CS proposing and AvG seconding the proposal.

Closure: The meeting was adjourned at 13:45

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON  DATE 16 May 2026

SECRETARY _____ DATE _____ 2026